



**International Convention on
the Elimination of All Forms
of Racial Discrimination**

Distr.: General
10 February 2010
English
Original: Russian

Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

**Reports submitted by States parties under article
9 of the Convention**

**Information received from the Government of the Russian
Federation on the implementation of the concluding
observations of the Committee on the Elimination of Racial
Discrimination***

[6 October 2009]

* In accordance with the information transmitted to States parties regarding the processing of their reports, the present document was not formally edited before being sent to the United Nations translation services.

Information from the Russian Federation on measures taken to implement the recommendations contained in paragraphs 16, 18, 23 and 26 of the concluding observations of the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination following its consideration of the combined eighteenth and nineteenth periodic reports of the Russian Federation on implementation of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination.

Paragraph 16

The Committee recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to combat ethnically motivated hate speech in the media, on the Internet and in political discourse, by publicly condemning such statements, imposing adequate sanctions for publicly making racist statements, making full use of official warnings under articles 4 and 16 of the Mass Media Act, and by closing, if appropriate, any media outlets inciting racial hatred. It also recommends that the State party effectively cooperate with third States from where Russian-speaking Internet sites operate, and that it train judges, procurators, the police and law enforcement officers on the application of article 282 of the Criminal Code and other relevant criminal law provisions.

1. In the Russian Federation, publication of extremist materials in the media is regulated by a series of legal instruments. Specifically, the Mass Media Act No. 2124-1 of 27 December 1991 and Federal Act No. 114-FZ of 25 July 2002, on measures to counter extremist activities, prohibit the use of the mass media for extremist activities, including activities intended to arouse racial and ethnic discord.
2. Article 12 of the Federal Act on measures to counter extremist activities prohibits the use of public communications networks for extremist activities. Use of such networks, including the Internet, for extremist activities attracts the measures set out in the Act, taking account of current legislation on communications.
3. Article 13, paragraph 1, of the Act states that the dissemination of extremist materials is illegal and renders the culprit liable; voluntary associations and religious or other organizations can also be held liable for engaging in extremist activities and be issued warnings, wound up, banned or suspended.
4. The authors of printed, audio, audio-visual or other material or productions intended for public use and containing even one of the elements provided for in article 1 of the Act are considered to be conducting extremist activities and are liable under the procedure established by Russian legislation.
5. Under article 64 of the Federal Communications Act No. 126-FZ of 7 July 2003, service providers may suspend communications services to legal persons and private individuals on the basis of a reasoned decision in writing from a director of a law enforcement or security agency of the Russian Federation in cases specified by federal laws.
6. Article 20.29 (production and dissemination of extremist material) of the Code of Administrative Offences of the Russian Federation makes the mass dissemination, or production or storage with the intention of mass dissemination, of extremist materials included on the published federal list of extremist material an administrative offence.
7. Article 280 of the Criminal Code makes it a criminal offence to call publicly for extremist activities; article 282 makes it an offence deliberately to incite hatred or enmity, or to disparage an individual or a group on the basis of sex, race, ethnic background, language, origin, religion, or membership of a social group, if done so publicly or through the mass media.

8. It is a criminal offence only to call publicly for extremist activities (article 280 of the Criminal Code), set up an extremist association (art. 282.1), or organize the activities of an extremist organization (art. 282.2).
9. It is an administrative offence to abuse the freedom of the press (article 13.15 of the Code of Administrative Offences), or to produce and disseminate extremist materials (art. 20.29).
10. Questions relating to combating extremism and the dissemination of racist and xenophobic material in the mass media are dealt with by the procuratorial bodies of the Russian Federation. A list of material recognized by the courts as extremist under article 13 of the Federal Act on measures to counter extremist activities is published periodically in the mass media, is permanently available on the website of the Ministry of Justice,¹ and is constantly monitored by the Office of the Procurator-General and the Federal Communications and Mass Media Oversight Service.
11. To meet the requirements of the Procurator-General's Office, the Federal Communications and Mass Media Oversight Service has established local branches in 78 constituent entities of the country, and has organized efforts to prevent extremism.
12. The priority task of the Service is to prevent offences involving the dissemination through the mass media of material calculated to arouse ethnic or religious discord, or racial intolerance.
13. The Service and its local branches constantly monitor the mass media to prevent media offences involving the use of hate speech, or incitement to ethnic or religious discord.
14. As a rule, every official warning about the posting of material displaying extremist features that is issued to a media outlet is preceded by an expert appraisal by independent experts or non-governmental expert organizations.
15. Any media outlet that receives a warning has the right to appeal against it in a court of law. The court decides whether to close the outlet in accordance with article 16 of the Mass Media Act. Currently, procurators say, more than 360 items of material have been ruled by court decision to be extremist and banned for dissemination.
16. For example, on 17 January 2008, the Investigating Unit at the Southern Sakhalin Investigation Department of the Sakhalin Provincial Procurator's Office Bureau of Investigation launched criminal proceedings for offences under article 280, paragraph 1 (public calls for extremist activities), and article 282, paragraph 1 (hatemongering and disparagement), of the Criminal Code, in connection with the posting of extremist information on a website.
17. The material on the website contained calls to join an organization whose aim is to expel from Russian lands persons of non-Slavic ethnic origin. As ways of attaining its nationalistic aims, the organization proposed preparing for the violent, armed overthrow of the State, and called for mass disturbances.
18. The Ministry of Internal Affairs also constantly monitors the mass media and Internet sites to detect material about forthcoming or past extremist crimes and the activities of radical organizations and their leaders. It uses its findings to organize further preventive and investigative work.

¹ www.minjust.ru.

19. One outcome has been the detection and suppression of the criminal activities of M.Y. Sakharov of Moscow province, who was systematically using the Internet to post photographs and videos of violent crimes carried out by activists of nationalist organizations, and propaganda for the ideas of National Socialism. The material served as an ideological basis for the activities of autonomous nationalist groups in the Russian Federation.

20. Material gathered from Internet monitoring and subsequent investigations by the Ministry of Internal Affairs Anti-Extremism Department made it possible to bring criminal proceedings against M.Y. Sakharov in September 2008 for offences under article 282, paragraph 1 (hatemongering and disparagement), of the Criminal Code. As the accused evaded investigation, the Ministry worked with the Federal Security Service and in cooperation with the law enforcement agencies of Belarus to trace him. He was caught and arrested by Ministry agents in February 2009.

21. It should be noted in particular that warnings over abuse of the freedom of the press have been issued not only to marginal publications such as *Russkaya pravda* and *Rus' pravoslavnyaya* that use anti-Semitic and anti-Islamic rhetoric but also to some very respectable media outlets such as *Kommersant*, *Argumenty i fakty*, *Izvestiya* and *Gazeta.RU*. The Russian authorities are fully aware that they do not, unfortunately, detect all postings using hate speech calculated to arouse national or religious discord. In organizing their efforts to combat the use of the mass media to arouse national or religious discord or racial intolerance, they therefore pay the most serious attention to cooperating with various voluntary non-governmental organizations.

22. The local management offices of the Federal Communications and Mass Media Oversight Service are currently setting up community councils that include representatives of journalists' unions, voluntary and human rights organizations, religious figures and academics. The councils assist the competent authorities in detecting possible violations related to abuse of the freedom of the press, including use of the media to arouse national and religious discord. On the other hand, under Russian legislation, given the way the Internet works, if an extremist site is hosted on a server in a foreign State, the Russian law enforcement authorities cannot as a matter of course take steps to have it closed down. The Procurator-General's Office and the Ministry of Internal Affairs are constantly working, through existing channels of international cooperation, with the law enforcement bodies in third countries that host Russian-language Internet sites to close down sites that disseminate extremist information. Unfortunately, it is not possible to close down all such websites, as they are governed by the legislation of the countries in which they are registered.

23. Since 2007, 43 notifications have been issued in respect of 148 websites containing extremist material. Responses have been received in respect of only 5, indicating that the requests did not satisfy national legislation. Specifically, the legislation in many countries does not allow Internet sites to be closed down simply for disseminating extremist information, as that would violate freedom of speech and expression. For example, in 2008, the Procurator-General's Office requested the United States authorities to close down the extremist organization *Russkaya Volya*'s Russian-language website, which was registered in the United States. The site included a list of Russian human rights defenders whom *Russkaya Volya* had "sentenced to death". The United States authorities refused to close down the site, citing freedom of speech, but the list was removed from the site because it disseminated personal information, which is forbidden under United States law.

24. Thus, the organizational and practical measures taken within one country will yield optimum results only if there is a single international legal mechanism to combat use of the Internet for terrorist or extremist purposes. The encouragement of xenophobia and racism through the media is widely discussed in Russian society. Various ways of dealing with it have been proposed: from a legislative ban on identifying national or ethnic origin in

postings and news broadcasts to calls for self-censorship among journalists. Unfortunately it must be recognized that no adequate solution has yet been found. This shows partly the ineffectiveness of proscriptive measures, and the need to maintain a balance between respecting the constitutional principles of freedom of speech and the citizen's right to information, on the one hand, and the inadmissibility of abuse of those rights, on the other. The journalism community has not yet shown that it is prepared to develop real forms and methods of self-monitoring.

Paragraph 18

The Committee recommends to the State party to further intensify its efforts to combat racially motivated violence, including by ensuring that judges, procurators and the police take into account the motive of ethnic, racial or religious hatred or enmity as an aggravating circumstance in any proceedings under the criminal law provisions mentioned in paragraph 3 above, and to provide updated statistical data on the number and nature of reported hate crimes, prosecutions, convictions and sentences imposed on perpetrators, disaggregated by age, gender and national or ethnic origin of victims.

25. Along with more active work by the law enforcement agencies in exposing and combating racially motivated crime, the State is also putting more effort into preventing manifestations of extremism. There has been a marked increase in the supervisory work of the procuratorial authorities; under the Constitution and current legislation, they must not only uphold citizens' rights and legal interests themselves, but also monitor the performance of those functions by other government authorities. The prevention of crime inspired by social, racial, ethnic or religious motives is constantly monitored by the President and the Government of the Russian Federation.

26. To prevent extremist crimes, the law enforcement authorities guard mass gatherings, including sporting events, that might inflame ethnic or religious enmity. Preventive action is also constantly being taken among ethnic diasporas and young people to prevent them being drawn into inter-ethnic or sectarian conflicts.

27. As part of the effort to prevent extremism based on xenophobia or ethnic and religious intolerance, comprehensive measures to detect and prevent the activities of informal radical youth groups make the leaders and active members of those groups liable under administrative and criminal law. Preventive discussions are held with the leaders and juvenile members of informal groups; sometimes close family members also attend. The possible consequences of illegal activities are explored, along with the relevant penalties.

28. To ensure State security and public safety on the basis of and in accordance with federal law, any person who participates in extremist activities may be restricted by a court ruling from access to employment in State and municipal services, enlistment in the military, service with the law enforcement agencies, work in educational establishments and employment with private investigative or protection services. Presidential Decree No. 1316 of 6 September 2008 on issues concerning the Ministry of Internal Affairs, and the related orders and regulations, established a department to combat extremism within the Ministry and specialized divisions (centres and groups) within the regional internal affairs bodies.

29. Data from the Ministry record 460 extremist crimes in the Russian Federation in 2008 — a figure approximately one third (28.9 per cent) higher than in 2007 — and 164 during the first quarter of 2009. Of those, 430 were investigated in 2008 (98.2 per cent more than in 2007) and 107 during the first quarter of 2009. The majority of the crimes committed in this category fall under article 280 (public calls for extremist activities) and article 282 (hatemongering and disparagement) of the Criminal Code.

30. In 2008, 379 individuals who had committed extremist crimes were detected (68 per cent more than in 2007); 85 were detected during the first quarter of 2009. Investigators from the Bureau of Investigation within the Federal Procurator's Office completed and submitted to the Procurator indictments against 123 individuals in 78 criminal cases involving extremist crimes (150 episodes of criminal activity) in 2008.

31. In 2008, courts in the Russian Federation tried 245 individuals for crimes related to extremist activity. Almost one quarter (57) had committed the crimes while under the age of 18. Of the 245 accused, 14 were acquitted, including 12 accused of offences against life and health on grounds of ethnic, religious or racial hatred, under article 282, paragraph 1 (hatemongering and disparagement), and 2 accused under article 280, paragraph 1 (public appeals for extremist action), of the Criminal Code.

32. The courts halted cases against 20 individuals on non-exculpatory grounds. These included: 16 because of reconciliation of the parties, 1 because of sincere repentance, and 3 because of expiry of the statute of limitations. Compulsory medical measures were taken in respect of one person who had committed a socially dangerous act punishable under article 282, paragraph 1 (hatemongering and disparagement), of the Criminal Code. One case was dismissed on the grounds of article 443, paragraph 2 (court ruling), of the Code of Criminal Procedure: the person had committed an act provided for in article 282.2, paragraph 2 (organizing the activities of an extremist organization), of the Criminal Code while not responsible for his or her actions.

33. The largest group (88, or 35.9 per cent) of those convicted in 2008 of offences in this category were found guilty of acts calculated to arouse hatred or enmity, or disparagement on the basis of race, ethnic origin or religion, sometimes in aggravating circumstances, under article 282 (hatemongering and disparagement) of the Criminal Code. Cases of extremist crime were considered by courts in 57 regions of the Russian Federation, the largest numbers coming before the courts of Moscow, Saint Petersburg, the Republic of Bashkortostan, and Moscow and Samara provinces.

34. Extremist crime is most common in the Central Federal Area, with 152 cases, of which most (93) were committed in Moscow. As a result of measures taken in Moscow, Moscow province and Saint Petersburg in 2008, 12 criminal nationalist youth groups were put out of operation. They had a total of 59 members, who were charged with 46 criminal episodes of inflaming inter-ethnic enmity against foreign citizens and persons of non-Slavic appearance. These included 34 murders, 2 attempted murders and 10 cases of causing serious injury to health. The law enforcement agencies have built up a certain amount of positive experience in detecting and investigating extremist crimes. The investigating bodies of the Bureau of Investigation, including the investigating teams in Moscow and Saint Petersburg, have worked actively to combat extremism. Successful investigations have also been conducted into the murders of foreign students in Voronezh.

35. With serious and very serious extremist crime against individuals on the rise, the Investigative Department of the Moscow Bureau of Investigation has developed and is applying a series of measures to ensure that such crime is duly detected and investigated:

- The collection, recording, synthesis and analysis of information on extremist crimes (including those of a serial nature) and the compilation and analysis of practices for their detection and investigation is now routine
- Software has been developed for recording and analysing information of criminological significance about the crimes themselves and about the individuals who take part in them (specifically, an electronic record of all daily incident summaries, a report of extremist incidents, and constant monitoring of the Internet and other mass media)

- Criminal procurators are actively involved in the detection and investigation of extremist crimes (they take part in viewing the scene of the crime, drawing up the plan for the investigation, and using special criminological techniques)
- There are various forms of collaboration with the investigating units (information exchange, joint meetings, standing interdepartmental investigation teams to detect and investigate crimes of this nature)

36. In 2008, the Procurator-General's Office took action in 37,000 cases, issuing 27,000 recommendations and protests, and nearly 10,000 warnings and cautions (three times as many as in 2007). The authorities pay particular attention to preventing displays of ethnic and religious intolerance. The Procurator-General's Office, the Federal Security Service and the Ministry of Internal Affairs worked together to draw up a joint procedural document aimed at further improving work to prevent and suppress the dissemination of ethnic discord or extremism.

37. A working group set up under the appropriate department of the Procurator-General's Office consists of representatives of human rights organizations, academics, and human rights and religious figures; it ensures that the procuratorial authorities receive timely information about extremist events, and formulates agreed positions and approaches to prevent them. The working group has held a number of meetings to discuss proposals to improve legislation on preventing extremist activities and on inter-ethnic relations. Reports by members of the working group and the resulting discussions have raised the following issues: the need to improve expert research on extremist material; cases of aggressive xenophobia in 2008 and the legal response to them; and the preparation of reference manuals for procuratorial staff, the law enforcement agencies, the judiciary, civil servants and leaders of non-governmental organizations on how better to deal with ethnic and religious intolerance.

38. The Russian authorities are paying serious attention to shaping an attitude of tolerance and preventing xenophobia, extremism and other forms of discrimination on grounds of ethnic origin or philosophical (religious) convictions. In particular, they are working to combat a variety of manifestations of racism based on Nazi ideology, notably among young people. The Ministry of Education and Science has approved regulations governing the evaluation of school books and the selection of organizations to publish textbooks for use in education. These make it compulsory, when selecting a publisher of teaching aids or evaluating textbooks, to use as one criterion the absence of any undesirable use of ethnic (racial) or religious topics. In evaluating textbooks, an assessment is made of whether the content conforms to current academic thinking, bearing in mind the educational level concerned, and whether there may be a threat to students' mental health from any hidden extremist propaganda for an ideology of violence or ethnic (racial) or religious superiority. Textbooks are evaluated by the Russian Academy of Sciences and the Russian Academy of Education or other organizations that have experts on their staff with the relevant background and qualifications, and experience in evaluating educational and scientific material. The academies' responsibility, scientific capacity and authority ensure the quality of the evaluation and prevent any textbooks of a quality that does not meet requirements being used in education. The subject of the Holocaust is included in the school curriculum and in State standards for general education, to teach the values of mutual understanding and tolerance.

39. The objective presentation of history in school books and the teaching of respect for social norms are, in general, particularly important in nurturing patriotism and citizenship and preventing extremism and xenophobia. Projects to shape an attitude of tolerance among young people are going ahead under the Federal programme for the development of education, 2006–2010. Extra-curricular and out-of-school activities and the supplementary educational system for children offer substantial possibilities for taking a comprehensive

approach to young people's education, combating the dissemination of nationalistic and anti-Semitic ideology among them, preventing crimes against humanity, assessing the adverse consequences of the crimes of a terrorist national-socialist regime, and promoting tolerance, mutual understanding and intercultural dialogue.

40. Religious organizations are active in projects to promote tolerance and prevent extremism among young people, drawing up a programme of spiritual and moral education. They work within the means available to them to prevent child neglect and juvenile delinquency, and collaborate with the social services, funds and other organizations to help prevent xenophobia and inter-ethnic conflict, and support the rehabilitation and social adaptation of young people who have suffered from those problems.

41. In 2008, the Ministry of Education and Science held a series of consultations and meetings with representatives of the Russian Academy of Education and the centralized religious organizations to support the traditions and cultures of the peoples of the Russian Federation, teach ethnic and religious tolerance, and prevent extremism. One outcome was a decision to set up a multi-faith expert group under the group drafting a federal general education standard.

42. The special multi-faith expert working group was set up under the Ministry of Education and Science in May 2008. To date, it has held four sessions and a series of working meetings, and has worked actively throughout that time at local level, in research teams and religious organizations. In 2008, it produced a draft handbook on spiritual and moral culture for teachers in general schools, to familiarize them with the main periods of history, religious traditions and the religious values of the peoples of the Russian Federation.

43. Particular attention is paid to working with ethnic community associations and their youth sections in implementing the State policy on migration, which provides for comprehensive measures to promote a culture of inter-ethnic dialogue and shape an attitude of public tolerance to migrants. The Republic of Mari-El, Lipetsk, Tambov and Yaroslavl provinces and other constituent entities of the Russian Federation with significant numbers of migrants have experience in this area.

44. For many years, the authorities have supported action to promote the development of the ethnic cultures of the peoples of the Russian Federation. Given the vulnerability of traditional ways of life, particular attention is paid to the cultural and socio-economic development of the country's small indigenous peoples. In April 2009, for instance, the Ministry of Regional Development supported three large events organized by the Russian Association of Indigenous Peoples of the North: the sixth Congress of Indigenous Peoples of the North, Siberia and the Far East of the Russian Federation (23–24 April); the Northern Civilization 2009 international trade show (21–26 April); and the All-Russian Festival of Culture of Indigenous Peoples of the North, Siberia and the Far East of the Russian Federation (21–26 April).

45. In 2009, to promote young people's integration into public life, create an integrated support system for young people with talent, initiative and leadership qualities, and develop patriotic education and the habits of intercultural dialogue, the Ministry of Sport, Tourism and Youth Policy, together with a number of other federal authorities (the Ministry of Education and Science, the Ministry of Public Health and Social Development, the Ministry of Regional Development, the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade and the Ministry of Finance), has been developing a special-purpose federal programme, "Russian youth over the period 2011–2015", to be submitted to the Government for approval in accordance with established procedure.

46. Furthermore, 2009 was declared Youth Year in the Russian Federation, and the Federal Youth Agency worked on a series of events as part of a wide-ranging programme

on tolerance. The events were designed to encourage young people to become involved in developing and implementing projects to promote tolerance and inter-ethnic harmony in Russian society. The tolerance programme's website has already registered 300 projects in different fields of activity.

47. Following on from the work in 2009, it is proposed to establish an idea bank of the most effective technologies and projects that could be implemented in 2010. There is now a wealth of experience in preventing xenophobia and extremism in almost all the regions of the country (the republics of Bashkortostan, Karelia, Udmurtia, Chuvashia, Mari-El and Khakassia, Altai, Stavropol and Krasnodar territories, Bryansk, Voronezh, Volgograd, Vladimir, Kemerovo, Kaluga, Kostroma, Moscow, Perm, Rostov, Orenburg, Tula and Chita provinces, the cities of Moscow and Saint Petersburg, and other constituent entities of the Federation). Effective ways of working in this area are being introduced into the activities of all types and forms of educational establishments in the Russian Federation, and are a priority in the work of teaching teams, voluntary organizations and associations.

48. A number of regions have developed and are successfully running programmes to promote tolerance in society. The special-purpose Moscow municipal programme, Capital of Multi-ethnic Russia (2008–2010), is of particular interest. It includes plans for a social conflict resolution service. Furthermore, it is hoped that ethnic organizations can be encouraged to become involved in helping migrant workers adapt in areas where the permanent residents are of different ethnic origins. Working groups are being set up within prefectures and local authorities to look at inter-ethnic relations and combating extremism. Another issue being discussed under the programme is the possible establishment of a coordinating council under the Federal Migration Service, to include representatives of ethnic voluntary associations, local authorities and the legal aid centres for migrants established under the Migration Service's area units in Moscow. The programme also includes ethnic cultural festivals, ethnic feast days and various mass events to promote inter-ethnic harmony.

49. Street advertising is being used to promote a tolerant attitude to people of other ethnic origins. Special in-service training courses on the ethnic process and inter-ethnic attitudes in the megalopolis are planned for civil servants, members of the police force and the passport and visa services, and representatives of the mass media. Educational institutions are planning lessons on courage and brotherhood, to prevent extremism. Saint Petersburg has a similar programme to promote inter-ethnic and intercultural relations, prevent xenophobia and promote tolerance over the period 2006–2010 (the Tolerance Programme). This includes a series of events to promote a tolerant environment in fields related to inter-ethnic, intercultural and interfaith cooperation in the city, to foster a culture of peace and to prevent extremism. The aim is to strengthen the tolerant environment in the city on the basis of the values of a multi-ethnic Russian society, an all-Russian identity and an awareness of the city's culture, as well as the principles of respecting human rights and freedoms.

50. The activities planned under the programme cover the main areas of community life. The aim of much of the Saint Petersburg Tolerance Programme is to shape the attitudes of representatives of the city's young people, forming a basis of tolerance.

51. Particular attention is paid to training the staff of the law enforcement agencies through a study programme on the culture of inter-ethnic dialogue and the traditions of the peoples of the Russian Federation.

52. Those subjects are also part of a special vocational training programme for staff of the internal affairs agencies on professional culture and ethics for members of the police force, and of advanced vocational training on ethnology and the ethics of inter-ethnic relations, ethnopsychology, the psychology of dialogue and conflicts, promoting human

rights in the work of the internal affairs agencies, the history of the State and the law, Russian constitutional law, Russian municipal law, and humanitarian law.

53. Significant attention is also paid in training programmes to the theoretical and practical aspects of safeguarding human and civil rights and freedoms. The Code of Professional Ethics of the internal affairs agencies, approved by Ministry of Internal Affairs order No. 1138 of 24 December 2008, states that the highest moral purpose in the official duties of a staff member is to protect the person, his or her life and health, honour and personal dignity, inalienable rights and freedoms. The State and public sector training plan for staff of the agencies, departments and institutions of the Ministry of Internal Affairs system includes the following courses for 2009:

- For senior officers of the internal affairs agencies: human and civil rights in Russian legislation and issues of compliance in the activities of the internal affairs agencies
- For private soldiers and junior and middle ranking officers of the internal affairs agencies and departments: promoting human and civil constitutional rights and freedoms in the activities of the internal affairs agencies
- For the staff of Ministry of Internal Affairs educational institutions: promoting and developing inter-ethnic tolerance among cadets and students at those institutions

54. The Ministry of Internal Affairs also collaborates actively with the main religious groups, academics and non-governmental organizations. A national conference on the role of the internal affairs agencies and the Federal Migration Service in promoting and protecting the rights and freedoms of national minorities was held on 27 and 28 November 2008 at the Ministry of Internal Affairs All-Russia Institute for In-Service Training.

55. The Ministry is planning to hold a round table discussion in November 2009 with representatives of civil society institutions on cooperation between those institutions and the State in preventing and resisting the spread of extremism among young people.

56. The Ministry of Regional Development also works to prevent ethno-political extremism, ethnic and racial intolerance and xenophobia. It is working particularly with the federal executive agencies concerned to implement a series of measures to combat ethnic and religious extremism and prevent inter-ethnic conflict during the period 2008–2010. The measures were developed with the participation of the Procurator-General's Office and the relevant federal executive bodies, took into account proposals by executive bodies in the constituent entities of the Federation, voluntary associations and religious organizations, and were approved by a Government instruction of 14 July 2008.

57. Related series of measures are being taken in many constituent entities of the Federation. The Ministry of Regional Development is working with these entities on special regional programmes to promote greater harmony in inter-ethnic and intercultural relations, greater ethnocultural development, and reduced ethnic and religious extremism and racial intolerance. By 1 August 2009, programmes (or subprogrammes) had been or were being drafted in 48 constituent entities.

58. Some of the most significant outreach activities supported by the Ministry of Regional Development in 2008 include:

- SM Irotvoret-2009, a national media competition for the best coverage of inter-ethnic cooperation between the peoples of the Russian Federation and their ethnocultural development (Moscow, 25 November 2008), intended to encourage a trend towards positive media reporting on matters related to inter-ethnic cooperation and the ethnocultural development of the peoples of Russia, better practices in intercultural and interfaith dialogue, and joint efforts by the State authorities and

civil society institutions to strengthen the unity of the Russian nation, safeguarding the ethnocultural rights of its peoples

- The Northern Caucasus children's forum, Children of the Caucasus for Peace in the Caucasus (Dombai, Karachai-Cherkessia Republic, 28–31 August 2008), intended to consolidate all-Russian civic solidarity, foster patriotism in the younger generation, encourage their involvement in the culture of the peoples of the Northern Caucasus and the Russian Federation as a whole, promote the principles of peacemaking and prevent ethnic and religious extremism and xenophobia
- A national School of Tolerance for young people (23–28 November 2008, Moscow province), aimed at introducing young activists to executive decision-making in the State regulation of inter-ethnic relations, consolidating all-Russian civic solidarity, and fostering patriotism and peacemaking skills to help them deal with conflict situations
- An international youth forum on intercultural and interfaith dialogue (29 November–4 December 2008, Kazan), to develop youth initiatives to strengthen intercultural and interfaith dialogue, to broaden cooperation between the authorities and youth organizations, and to promote information and intercultural links between young people in the Russian Federation and the European Union

59. To stimulate positive coverage of inter-ethnic relations and to strengthen inter-ethnic tolerance, the Ministry of Regional Development ran a publicity campaign (television advertisements) throughout the country in 2008 and 2009 on the theme "We are Russia", and published a supplement entitled *Ethnic accent* to the newspaper *Argumenty nedeli* on issues related to harmonizing inter-ethnic relations (570,000 copies printed with each edition of the newspaper).

60. In total, the Ministry of Regional Development's activities to promote tolerance in inter-ethnic relations and prevent extremism (including media campaigns) reached more than 700,000 Russian citizens in 2008. The Ministry is also making preparations for a comprehensive national publicity campaign in 2009 to strengthen civic identity and inter-ethnic tolerance, to popularize the traditional cultures of the peoples of Russia, and to reduce inter-ethnic tension at this time of global financial and economic crisis, in order to prevent extremism and racial intolerance.

61. Efforts to reduce inter-ethnic tension, prevent ethnic and religious extremism and harmonize inter-ethnic relations are continuing in 2009. Specifically, there have been some large-scale projects to promote the harmonization of inter-ethnic relations and prevent inter-ethnic conflicts and various forms of extremism; these include the second Northern Caucasus children's forum, Children of the Caucasus for Peace in the Caucasus (Dombai, Karachai-Cherkessia Republic, 28–31 August 2008) and an interregional seminar on ethnocultural technology in preventing extremism and xenophobia (Velikiy Ustyug, Vologda province). The following events are planned to take place before the end of 2009:

- The second national SM Irotvoret's-2009 competition (Moscow)
- The second national School of Tolerance youth camp
- Training seminars on using humanitarian technology to strengthen all-Russian identity among the peoples of southern Russia: inter-ethnic, intercultural and interfaith processes
- The development and publication of a study course for students in tertiary education institutes on tolerance and the culture of inter-ethnic relations

Paragraph 23

The Committee recommends that the State party facilitate access to residence registration and Russian citizenship by all former Soviet citizens on the basis of a simplified procedure and irrespective of the ethnicity of applicants.

62. Russian citizenship may be acquired under the standard procedure and a simplified one. Foreign citizens and stateless persons who have reached the age of 18 and are legally competent are entitled to apply for Russian citizenship under the simplified procedure if:

- At least one of their parents is a citizen of and resides within the Russian Federation
- They used to be citizens of the Soviet Union, lived and continue to live in States that were part of the Soviet Union, have not acquired citizenship of those States and remain stateless as a result
- They are citizens of States that were part of the Soviet Union, and have received a specialized secondary or higher education in educational establishments of the Russian Federation since 1 July 2002

63. In addition, foreign citizens and stateless persons living in the Russian Federation are entitled to apply for citizenship under the simplified procedure if:

- They were born in the territory of the Russian Soviet Federative Socialist Republic and used to hold Soviet citizenship
- They have been married to a citizen of the Russian Federation for at least three years
- They are disabled and have a legally competent son or daughter who has reached the age of 18 and is a citizen of the Russian Federation

64. Disabled foreign citizens and stateless persons who arrived in the Russian Federation from States that were formerly part of the Soviet Union, and were registered by place of residence in the Russian Federation on 1 July 2002, are entitled to apply for citizenship under the simplified procedure regardless of period of residence in the Russian Federation, and without presenting a residence permit.

65. Foreign citizens and stateless persons who were citizens of the Soviet Union, arrived in the Russian Federation from States that were formerly part of the Soviet Union, and were registered by place of residence in the Russian Federation on 1 July 2002, or who have been issued temporary or permanent residence permits, are granted citizenship under the simplified procedure if they express their wish to become citizens of the Russian Federation.

66. Veterans of the Second World War who were citizens of the former Soviet Union and live in the Russian Federation are granted citizenship under the simplified procedure without the need to present a residence permit. The simplified procedure also applies to:

- A child, one of whose parents is a citizen of the Russian Federation, when that parent makes the application with the consent of the other parent. Such consent is not necessary if the child resides in the Russian Federation
- A child whose only parent resides in the Russian Federation, when that parent makes the application
- A child or person lacking legal competence who is under tutorship or guardianship, when the tutor or guardian has Russian citizenship and makes the application

67. In accordance with article 4 of the Federal Citizenship Act No. 62-FZ of 31 May 2002, the principles of Russian citizenship and the regulations governing citizenship of the Russian Federation may not contain provisions that restrict the rights of citizens on social,

racial, ethnic, linguistic or religious grounds. In this connection, no one, regardless of ethnic background, may be subjected to any kind of discrimination when citizenship matters are considered. With regard to the granting of Russian citizenship to citizens of the former Soviet Union who are not registered, we wish to state the following.

68. Under article 13, paragraph 1, of the former Federal Citizenship Act No. 1948-1 of 28 November 1991, all citizens of the former Soviet Union who were permanently resident in the Russian Federation on the day on which the Act entered into force (6 February 1992) were granted citizenship of the Russian Federation provided that, within one year following the entry into force of the Federal Act, they had not expressed a wish to the contrary. Under article 4, paragraph 7, of Federal Act No. 62-FZ of 31 May 2002, which entered into force on 1 July 2002, citizenship of the Russian Federation is determined on the basis of the legislative acts of the Russian Federation or of the Russian Soviet Federative Socialist Republic that were in force at the onset of the circumstances with which the person's citizenship is related. Hence article 13, paragraph 1, of the earlier Act may still apply.

69. In this connection, persons not registered in the Russian Federation may be recognized as Russian citizens if it can be proved that they were permanent residents of the Russian Federation on 6 February 1992. Permanent residence in the Russian Federation may be established by the Federal Migration Service pursuant to paragraphs 15 to 15.13 of the administrative regulation governing the exercise by that Service of the powers of the State in applying the law on citizenship of the Russian Federation, as approved by Federal Migration Service Order No. 64 of 19 March 2008, or, if this is not possible, by the courts under article 264 of the Code of Civil Procedure (establishment of facts of legal significance).

70. Once permanent residence has been established, the passport of a citizen of the Russian Federation is issued under the same procedure as for all other citizens of the Russian Federation, without additional formalities.

71. An additional possibility for obtaining Russian citizenship was introduced in June 2006, when the State programme to assist the voluntary resettlement in the Russian Federation of ethnic Russians living abroad was endorsed by the President. The aim was to stimulate and organize the voluntary resettlement in the Russian Federation of ethnic Russians living abroad by making the constituent entities more attractive and by resolving demographic issues in the different regions. It is important to note that not only former citizens of the Russian Federation or the Soviet Union can take advantage of the programme. Participants and family members are given financial support for the move. Participation gives the individuals concerned and family members who hold foreign citizenship or are stateless the right to priority issuance of temporary or permanent residence permits and acquisition of Russian citizenship. To this end, the procedure for examining citizenship issues has been changed to ensure that applications for a change of citizenship made by a foreign national or a stateless person moving permanently to the Russian Federation under the programme are considered within a month.

72. To speed up the granting of citizenship to programme participants who do not qualify for the simplified procedure, Parliament has drawn up and approved amendments to the Citizenship Act. These provide for the extension of the simplified procedure to all participants. This means, in practice, that citizenship may be granted without any further conditions, such as period of residence in the Russian Federation. There are currently more than 12,000 participants in the programme.

73. Thus the current procedure for obtaining Russian citizenship is clearly regulated, transparent, and allows former citizens of the Soviet Union to obtain citizenship of the Russian Federation under a simplified procedure regardless of their ethnic origin.

Paragraph 26

The Committee recommends that the State party review its policy of demolishing illegally constructed Roma settlements when the dwellings have existed for a long time, legalize existing settlements to the extent possible, and provide adequate alternative housing whenever forced evictions of Roma take place.

74. Work is constantly being done with regional and local level government bodies and with Roma communities with a view to preventing and settling the conflicts that arise when Roma buildings are demolished. There are various reasons for the incidents that have occurred, but the demolition of houses, mostly by decision of the judicial authorities, is not the consequence of an organized operation or extrajudicial action by the law enforcement agencies.

75. One of the most high-profile events occurred in the settlement of Dorozhny, in the Guryevsk district of Kaliningrad province. According to information from the Government of Kaliningrad province, Dorozhny was described by law enforcement agencies as a place where narcotic and psychotropic substances were sold, where there was a high concentration of drug-dependent persons and where most of the inhabitants of the settlement were engaged in unlawful buying and selling of stolen property and trafficking in narcotics. According to the Kaliningrad province Administration of the Federal Service for Drug Trafficking Control, in 2005 alone 158 incidents involving illicit drug trafficking were detected; criminal proceedings were instituted in connection with 125 of those incidents and a total of 61 persons were prosecuted.

76. Concerning the buildings in Dorozhny that were demolished, the Minister of Housing, Public Utilities and Construction of Kaliningrad province reports that only 1 of the 46 buildings was a legal construction and had the status of a dwelling; the rest had been put up on parcels of land without official permission. Moreover, the Guryevsk district court had been considering claims from the Guryevsk district administration relating to 68 unlawfully erected buildings since November 2005. Between November 2005 and June 2006, the court, having examined all the claims, decided to demolish the buildings. Not one of those decisions was appealed, so they all became enforceable.

77. To resettle the people living illegally in Dorozhny, by decision No. 288 of the Kaliningrad Provincial Government of 28 April 2006, on allocation of monetary resources, more than 5.7 million roubles were allocated to establish a special housing stock in five provincial municipalities; but the homeless former inhabitants of Dorozhny ignored all proposals to resettle them in other municipalities. Another well-known case, which is often cited by human rights organizations, is the demolition in Arkhangelsk, in August 2004, of 17 temporary buildings in the Varavino-Faktoria area of the city for Roma families who had moved there from Volgograd province. By decision of the Lomonosov court in Arkhangelsk, the buildings were declared unauthorized and subject to demolition.

78. The mayor of Arkhangelsk provided material assistance with the move by members of the Roma community back to Volgograd province in July 2006: the departing Roma were provided with transport, their travel and the transport of their baggage were paid for, and they were given food for the journey and 250,000 roubles to resettle elsewhere. In addition, the building materials from the demolished unauthorized structures were sold and the proceeds from their sale were given to the Roma community.

79. Checks were made in connection with the demolition of Roma houses in the spring of 2007 in the town of Chudovo in Novgorod province. The Ministry of Regional Development of the Russian Federation, the Federal Service for Drug Trafficking Control for Novgorod province and the Novgorod provincial administration, in cooperation with the Federal Autonomous Ethnic Cultural Organization of Russian Roma, have discussed the situation of the Roma in Chudovo and means of resolving the situation that had arisen. The

Novgorod provincial administration constantly monitors the situation of the Roma in the province. Work has begun on a general plan to develop an area where the Roma community can live.

80. In accordance with legislative requirements, 35 per cent of the buildings are subject to demolition, 30 per cent must be reconstructed to meet fire-prevention, environmental and epidemiological standards, and the relevant registration documents are being issued for the remaining 35 per cent of the buildings. It should, in general, be noted that most demolitions of residential buildings in the Russian Federation are occasioned by violations of existing legislation or environmental or technical standards.

81. Efforts are constantly being made to resolve many organizational issues related to social and cultural adaptation by the Roma. Specifically, representatives of the Ministry of Regional Development carried out a detailed study of the social and cultural problems of the Roma community in Krasnodar territory during a field mission in April 2009. The staff of the territorial administration, members of ethnic voluntary associations and expert advisers consider that the Roma are socially integrated into the community life of the region to a significant degree. The administration maintains close contacts with the leaders of Roma of Kuban, an autonomous ethnic cultural organization. Roma of Kuban helps a great deal to stabilize the situation in different parts of the territory and prevent illegal acts.

82. Much more attention is now being paid in those constituent entities of the Federation where there are high concentrations of Roma to the way education is organized, improving the quality of education available to the Roma and building up cooperation between Roma voluntary organizations, the authorities and the expert community in order to meet students' ethnic and cultural needs. This is helping, to a certain extent, to solve the problem of access to education (including preschool education) for children living in Roma settlements.

83. Representatives of the Roma community in Novgorod, Penza, Tula and Tyumen provinces help significantly with organizing schooling for Roma children. Coverage of Roma children by the general education system is being expanded with varying degrees of success in constituent entities of the Federation such as Tula, Volgograd and Pskov provinces. However, producing study materials for Roma children who do not speak, or speak very little, Russian is a problem.

84. It should be noted that the Ministry of Regional Development has held a series of working meetings, attended by M.A. Travnikov, the Deputy Minister of Regional Development, to discuss with representatives of the Roma community possible ways of implementing the recommendations made by the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination at its seventy-third session (28 July–15 August 2008, Geneva). A meeting was also held on 13 May 2009 with leaders of the Federal Autonomous Ethnic Cultural Organization of Russian Roma at the Russian Government's Department of Culture and Education.

85. As a result of those meetings, and on the basis of the position adopted by the federal authorities concerned, the following proposals were made:

- A working group on the problems of Russian Roma should be set up under the Interdepartmental Commission for cooperation with ethnic voluntary associations, established within the Ministry of Regional Development by joint order No. 97 of 14 August 2006 of the Ministry of Regional Development, the Ministry of Culture, the Ministry of Education and Science, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Ministry of Internal Affairs, the Ministry of Justice, the Ministry of Economic Development and the Ministry of Environment
- The working group should consider drafting, in conjunction with the authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation, the Federal Autonomous Ethnic

Cultural Organization of Russian Roma and research establishments, a series of measures to promote the socio-economic and ethnocultural development of the Russian Roma and their sociocultural adaptation and integration into Russian society

- The federal authorities concerned should continue with measures to help the Russian Roma develop and integrate

86. Pursuant to State policy on ethnic affairs, the Ministry of Regional Development is planning to support (with 1.5 million roubles from the federal budget) the Third All-Russia Congress of Russian Roma in October–November 2009. Roma from different regions of the country will attend the Congress for a constructive discussion on issues related to the socio-economic and ethnocultural development of their people, broader cooperation between the authorities and Russian Roma voluntary associations, and preventing the spread of negative stereotypes of Roma in society. The Congress is to be run by the Federal Autonomous Ethnic Cultural Organization of Russian Roma.

87. The Ministry of Regional Development will also fund (with 1.0 million roubles from the federal budget) the 2009 Roma under Russian Skies national folk festival, which will be a great event in the social and cultural life of the Russian Roma.
