



Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment

Distr.: General
12 July 2012

Original: English

Committee against Torture

List of issues to be considered in connection with the examination of the second periodic report of Qatar (CAT/C/QAT/2) adopted by the Committee at its forty-eighth session, 7 May–1 June 2012

Articles 1 and 4

1. Regarding the amendment to the Criminal Code in June 2010 (CAT/C/QAT/2, pp. 12-13 and 24), notably on the definition and criminalization of torture,¹ please provide information on measures taken to ensure the effective implementation of those legal provisions. Please indicate the number and the nature of the cases in which those legal provisions were applied by domestic courts, including penalties imposed or the reasons for acquittal. As the cases in the table on page 15 of the State party's second periodic report all took place prior to the amendment, please clarify the specific length of sentences and penalties imposed on the eight persons charged and found guilty of "cruelty" or "torture", and provide other case details including names and locations.

2. The Committee notes the information provided by the State party concerning its reservation to the Convention (CAT/C/QAT/2, p. 24), in response to the recommendation of the Committee in the previous concluding observations (para. 9). Please update the Committee on the measures that have been taken by the Council of Ministers in response to the suggestions made by the national committee calling for a partial withdrawal of the general reservation that would clarify that the reservation is limited in scope and applies only to articles 1 and 16 of the Convention.² Please inform the Committee how the proposed reservations on articles 1 and 16 would meet the requirements of the Convention, demonstrating an acceptance of the State party's obligations under the Convention. Clarification of the extent of the State party's commitment to fulfil those obligations would be appreciated.

¹ Concluding observations of the Committee against Torture (CAT/C/QAT/CO/1), para. 10; Report of the Working group on the Universal Periodic Review: Qatar (A/HRC/14/2), para. 85.7; views on conclusions and/or recommendations, voluntary commitments and replies presented by the State under review (A/HRC/14/2/Add.1), recommendation 7.

² A/HRC/14/2, para. 85.6; A/HRC/14/2/Add.1, recommendation 6.

Article 2³

3. Please provide information on measures taken by the State party to ensure that all detained persons are afforded, in practice, fundamental legal safeguards from the very outset of detention, including the right of access to a lawyer and an independent medical doctor, as well as the right to inform a relative, and to be informed of their rights. Which measures have been taken to ensure de facto implementation of the Criminal Procedure Code in that regard, including its articles 40 and 113, as referenced in the State party's report (CAT/C/QAT/2, p. 26)?⁴ Is a statement of detainee rights available at all places of detention for consultation by detainees? Have any law enforcement officers been subjected to disciplinary or other penalties for failing to afford fundamental legal safeguards to detainees during the reporting period? Please indicate whether legal aid lawyers are made available to all detained persons. How many legal aid lawyers are available in the country, disaggregated by location? Please indicate how the State party monitors the adherence of law enforcement personnel to the laws and regulations guaranteeing these fundamental safeguards. Does the State party require that all interrogations be videotaped? If not, is this under consideration?

4. Please provide information on measures taken by the State party to register all persons it detains under its jurisdiction by documenting the identity of the detainee, the date, time and place of the detention, the full names of all detaining and interrogating authorities, the ground for the detention, the date and time of admission to the detention facility, the state of health of the detainee upon admission and any changes thereto, and the time and place of interrogations, as well as the date and time of release or transfer to another detention facility. Please indicate if any law enforcement personnel have been subjected to disciplinary or other measures during the reporting period for failing to properly register detainees in accordance with these measures.

5. Please provide information on:⁵

(a) The monitoring mechanisms and measures adopted by the State party to prevent derogation from the Criminal Procedure Code, which stipulates that persons detained should be charged or released within 48 hours.⁶ Please indicate cases, if any, when detention without charge may be extended by the Attorney General for 16 days before the person is presented before a judge. Please provide data on any cases in which law enforcement personnel were disciplined for failing to adhere to the Code's requirements;

(b) The role of a judge in authorizing detention in all cases and the mechanisms that ensure that this rule is adhered to. Please provide data on any cases in which personnel were disciplined for failing to adhere to this rule. Please comment on the case of Abdullah al-Khowar and Salim al-Kowari, who, following their arrest on 27 June 2009, were

³ The issues raised under article 2 could also involve other articles of the Convention, including, but not limited to, article 16. General comment No. 2 (2007) on implementation of article 2 by States parties, paragraph 3, sets out: "The obligation to prevent torture in article 2 is wide ranging. The obligations to prevent torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment (hereinafter "ill-treatment") under article 16, paragraph 1, are indivisible, interdependent and interrelated. The obligation to prevent ill-treatment in practice overlaps with and is largely congruent with the obligation to prevent torture. ... In practice, the definitional threshold between ill-treatment and torture is often not clear." See further chapter V of the same general comment.

⁴ Committee against Torture, follow-up letter dated 7 May 2010 (available from <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/cat/follow-procedure.htm>); A/HRC/WG.6/7/QAT/2, paras. 23–24; A/HRC/WG.6/7/QAT/3, para. 20.

⁵ A/HRC/WG.6/7/QAT/3, para. 22.

⁶ *Ibid.*, paras. 19–21; see also A/HRC/WG.6/7/QAT/2, para. 46.

reportedly held in custody without trial for nine months, including with regard to alleged torture during incommunicado detention;

(c) Mechanisms in place which allow detainees to challenge the lawfulness of their detention before a judge. Please provide data on all such challenges made during the reporting period, and the outcomes of such challenges, including data on any disciplinary sanctions or criminal penalties issued against law enforcement personnel found responsible. Please also comment on the following cases:

(i) Mohamed Farouk al-Mahdi, who was reportedly arrested on 15 October 2009 without a warrant and allegedly held incommunicado at the Asima police station in Doha and who remained in detention without charge or trial until his release on 14 September 2010;

(ii) Sedki Ibrahim, a Jordanian national, who was reportedly arrested by Qatari Special Security forces in 2009 for a traffic violation and held at a police station in Doha for two months before being brought before a judge. Despite the judge's order that he be released on bail, he was reportedly held in solitary confinement at the State security prison for more than three months;

(d) Please provide detailed information about the following cases, which allege that fundamental safeguards were absent and that ill-treatment or torture ensued. Please indicate the status and result of any investigation into the allegations made, whether any personnel have been subjected to criminal or disciplinary penalties, and what redress, including compensation and rehabilitation, has been provided:

(i) Salim Hasan Khalifa al-Kawari, allegedly arrested on 7 February 2011 by State Security personnel, taken to an unknown location and held incommunicado for six weeks. Denied legal representation, he was allegedly subjected to ill-treatment and threats to compel him to sign documents;

(ii) Fawaz al-Attiyah, former spokesperson of the Qatari Ministry of Foreign Affairs, whose arrest and detention were the subject of an urgent appeal from the Special Rapporteur on torture, and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment, the Special Rapporteur on the independence of judges and lawyers, and the Working Group on Arbitrary Detention on 8 June 2010 (A/HRC/16/52/Add.1, para. 174). Please comment on the concerns expressed in the appeal, alleging that Mr. Al-Attiyah was denied proper access to legal counsel and family members and was placed in solitary confinement for more than six months without trial. Please also indicate whether Mr. Al-Attiyah remains in detention, and if so, please also indicate his condition. Please also comment on reports that Mr. Al-Attiyah's cousin, Nayef Bin Ghanim al-Attiyah, was arrested on 4 September 2009 after he brought a claim on his cousin's behalf and was reportedly subjected to torture and held incommunicado, without trial, for nearly nine months.

6. Please provide details on the number of persons detained, prosecuted, and convicted during the reporting period under emergency laws, including Act No. 3 of 2004 on Combating Terrorism, and the average length of their detention. Please provide information on existing measures by which persons detained under emergency laws can challenge the lawfulness or length of detention, as well as data on all such challenges made by persons detained under these laws, and their outcomes.⁷ Please describe the role of the National Human Rights Committee in monitoring the treatment and lawfulness of detention of persons pursuant to emergency laws.

⁷ Committee against Torture, follow-up letter dated 7 May 2010.

7. Further to the recommendation of the Committee in the previous concluding observations (para. 12), does the State party envisage abolishing the provisions of the Criminal Code which prescribe flogging and stoning as criminal sanctions (CAT/C/QAT/2, p. 27)?⁸ Please clarify why the State party did not accept the universal periodic review recommendations in this regard (A/HRC/14/2, para. 86.12). Please comment on reports that in 2011 at least 21 people, mostly foreign nationals, were sentenced to floggings of between 30 and 100 lashes for offences related to “illicit sexual relations” or alcohol consumption. In this regard, and noting the Committee’s past conclusions concerning the Criminal Code’s sanctions “where the accused or the victim is a Muslim”, please provide information on the number of cases during the reporting period in which individuals were charged with the crimes of adultery, slander, drinking alcohol or apostasy.⁹ Please indicate the criminal sanctions imposed in each case in which a determination of guilt was reached.¹⁰

8. Further to the recommendation of the Committee in the previous concluding observations (para. 22), has the State party introduced measures to prevent and punish violence against women? Please indicate whether domestic violence is a criminal offense, and provide the text of any relevant legislation. Please provide statistical data on the number of complaints of violence against women, including domestic violence, received and investigated during the reporting period, as well as the number of prosecutions and convictions, and penalties applied. Please indicate the standards of proof applied in such cases. Please provide statistical data specifically concerning the prevalence of violence against female migrant workers in the State party. Please indicate whether and how the Supreme Council for Family Affairs plays a role in combating domestic violence (CAT/C/QAT/CO/1/Add.1, para. 4). Please indicate whether women are required to obtain the consent of a guardian in order to file criminal complaints. Please also indicate whether the State party has initiated awareness-raising programmes regarding violence against women, and if so, describe these.

9. Please provide information on the implementation of relevant domestic legislation which criminalizes trafficking in human beings. Please provide statistical data on the extent of trafficking in the country, including the number of complaints received and investigated during the reporting period, and the number of prosecutions and convictions.¹¹ Please provide information on any measure taken by the State party to examine data on the trafficking of women and children and ensure that all data are used for the formulation, monitoring and evaluation of policies, programmes and projects; to strengthen its procedures for the early identification of victims of trafficking, including persons arrested for immigration violations or prostitution;¹² and to establish bilateral and multilateral agreements and cooperation programmes with countries of origin and transit to prevent the sale, trafficking and abduction of children (CRC/C/QAT/2, para. 67).

10. Please provide information on the measures taken to provide an alternative to the sponsorship (*kafeel*) system, which ties a migrant worker’s legal residence to his or her employer or sponsor, and to avoid the withdrawal of the passports of migrant workers by

⁸ Ibid.

⁹ Comments by the State of Qatar on the conclusions and recommendations of the Committee against Torture (CAT/C/QAT/CO/1/Add.1, para. 16).

¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹ Report of the Special Rapporteur on trafficking in persons, especially women and children, A/HRC/4/23/Add.2 and Corr.1, para. 49; concluding observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child (CRC/C/QAT/CO/2), paras. 66–67.

¹² See A/HRC/4/23/Add.2 and Corr.1; CAT/C/QAT/2, p. 10.

their sponsors in violation of the domestic law.¹³ Further to the recommendation by the Special Rapporteur on trafficking in persons, especially women and children (A/HRC/4/23/Add.2 and Corr.1, paras. 95 (a) and (d)), what measures have been taken by the State party to abolish the sponsorship system? Please describe examples of any cases where sponsors were punished for violating the rights of migrant workers protected under the sponsorship act.¹⁴

11. Further to the recommendation of the Committee in the previous concluding observations (para. 14), please provide information on measures taken by the State party to ensure that the Convention and its protections are applicable to all acts that are in violation of the Convention and that occur within its jurisdiction, from which it follows that all persons are entitled, in equal measure and without discrimination, to the rights contained therein.

12. With regard to the recommendation of the Committee in the previous concluding observations (para. 17) regarding efforts to ensure that the activities of the National Human Rights Committee (NHRC) are brought into full compliance with the principles relating to the status of national institutions for the promotion and protection of human rights (Paris Principles), including with regard to its independence and the appointment of its members, please provide additional information on the appointment process and any dismissals to date. Please provide information on the mandate and financial resources of the NHRC under the amended Act (Decree-Act No. 17 of 2010) (CAT/C/QAT/2, p. 26).¹⁵ Furthermore, please indicate the number of complaints received relating to violations of the provisions of the Convention, and the actions taken in response as well as their outcome.

13. Further to the recommendation of the Committee in the previous concluding observations (para. 11), please provide information on any measure taken by the State party, other than those legal provisions referred to in the State party's report (CAT/C/QAT/2, pp. 24–25), to fully ensure the independence of the judiciary in accordance with the Basic Principles on the Independence of the Judiciary. Please provide details on the procedure for the appointment of judges, the duration of their mandate, the rules governing their removability and the manner in which they may be removed from office. Please indicate measures taken to ensure that female judges may serve and address the same jurisdictions as male judges, and provide data concerning the number of female judges and judges who are members of racial, ethnic or religious minority groups (CAT/C/QAT/CO/1/Add.1, para. 15).

Article 3

14. Further to the recommendation of the Committee in the previous concluding observations (para. 13), please provide detailed information on measures taken, other than the legal provisions referred in the State party's periodic report (CAT/C/QAT/2, pp. 14–15), to respect the absolute prohibition on expelling, returning or extraditing a person to another State where there are substantial grounds for believing that he or she would be in danger of being subjected to torture and to fully incorporate the provisions of article 3 into the State party's domestic law.

15. Please provide information on cases during the reporting period, if any, where the Minister of the Interior issued expulsion decisions on the grounds that the presence of the

¹³ Concluding observations of the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD/C/QAT/CO/13–16), para. 15.

¹⁴ A/HRC/4/23/Add.2 and Corr.1, paras. 60–68 and 91; Committee against Torture, follow-up letter dated 7 May 2010.

¹⁵ CAT/C/QAT/CO/1, para. 17. See also CAT/C/QAT/2, p. 11.

person concerned in Qatar was found to threaten public order or the national economy, or to place a burden on the State, as provided in article 21 of the Alien Entry and Residence Act (No. 3 of 1963). Please indicate the State(s) to which any persons expelled pursuant to this provision were sent (CAT/C/QAT/CO/1/Add.1, para. 6).

16. Has the State party relied on diplomatic assurances? Please provide detailed information on what the State party's requirements are for such assurances and whether there are post-return monitoring mechanisms. Also, please provide information on all cases where diplomatic assurances have been provided since the consideration of the previous report. Has the State party signed any regional or bilateral agreements relating to the return of asylum seekers?

17. Please provide data, disaggregated by age, sex and nationality on:

- (a) The number of asylum requests registered and approved;
- (b) The number of asylum seekers whose requests were granted because they had been tortured or might be tortured if they were returned to their country of origin;
- (c) The number of forcible deportations or expulsions (please indicate how many of them involved rejected asylum seekers), and the countries to which these persons were expelled.

18. Please provide the information about the case of the reportedly forced return to Libya of Eman al-Obeidi, a Libyan national who publicly accused Libyan soldiers of rape, even though she had been recognized as a refugee by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR). Please explain how this case of refoulement is compatible with article 3 of the Convention as well as with the relevant Qatari legal provisions, including article 410 of the Criminal Procedure Code.¹⁶

Articles 5 and 7

19. Please provide detailed information on how the State party has exercised its jurisdiction over cases of torture referred to in articles 4 and 5 of the Convention. Please provide examples of current practices in this respect, in particular cases where the provisions of the Criminal Code, including its articles 17 and 18, have been applied in cases of extradition and/or international judicial cooperation (CAT/C/QAT/2, pp. 16–17).

20. Please indicate whether the State party has rejected, for any reason, any request for extradition by another State of an individual suspected of having committed an offence of torture, and has started prosecution proceedings as a result. If so, please provide information on the status and outcome of such proceedings.

Article 10

21. Please provide information on training and awareness-raising for public officials on the absolute prohibition of torture in accordance with the Convention and the Manual on the Effective Investigation and Documentation of Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Istanbul Protocol of 1999), including any such programmes provided to medical personnel (CAT/C/QAT/2, p. 26) or persons engaged in rehabilitation. With regard to the various training sessions on the prohibition of torture referred to in the State party's report (CAT/C/QAT/2, p. 18), please provide information on

¹⁶ UNHCR, "UNHCR condemns refoulement of Eman Al Obeidi to Libya", briefing notes, 3 June 2011; CAT/C/QAT/2, p. 14.

the subjects of such training programmes, how many persons have been trained, the outcomes of such trainings and how they are evaluated.

22. Please provide information on the training for police in handling cases of domestic and sexual violence, including how many officers have undergone such training, the results of these trainings, and how the effectiveness of the trainings is evaluated. Please provide updated information on specific training and sensitization programmes developed by the State party for law enforcement personnel on human trafficking as well as on the impact of such programmes.

Article 11

23. While the Committee notes that the Public Prosecutor has the obligation to conduct surprise visits to places of detention (CAT/C/QAT/2, pp. 20-21) and to receive complaints from prisoners, the State party's report does not provide details on the number and type of visits actually made, nor the places visited, or the number of complaints received. Please provide the Committee with this information, along with additional detailed information about unannounced visits by other existing monitoring mechanisms to places of detention, and any available data on steps taken by these mechanisms in response to the visits. Please explain whether independent international and national non-governmental organizations (NGOs), including the International Committee of the Red Cross and civil society groups, have been given unrestricted access to places of deprivation of liberty (in addition to the visits cited in the report), and indicate the dates on which visits have taken place and the places of detention visited. In particular, please indicate whether the NHRC is empowered to undertake unrestricted monitoring of all places of detention, and describe any other existing mechanisms which monitor places of detention and the scope of their authority to do so. Please provide data indicating the number of visits members of the NHRC have made to places of detention, as well as the name and type of place of detention, during the reporting period. Please indicate what measures the NHRC has taken as a result of these visits, and whether any procedures or practices were changed or investigations into potential misconduct initiated in response to actions taken by the Human Rights Commissioner or the special procedures of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights.

24. Please provide the Committee with all the interrogation rules, instructions, methods and practices, as well as arrangements for the custody and treatment of persons subjected to any form of arrest, detention or imprisonment aimed at preventing cases of torture, that may have been introduced since the consideration of the last periodic report. Please also provide information as to how the implementation of these rules is monitored, in particular by what institution. Does the State party provide law enforcement officials with manuals on interrogation techniques?

25. Please provide information on the measures taken to improve the conditions of all places of detention and imprisonment and to ensure the separation of male and female detainees as well as the separation of those convicted and those remanded in custody. Please indicate whether female medical personnel and officers are available to female prisoners. Please indicate whether detention facilities are accessible for detainees with disabilities. Also, provide information on interprisoner violence, including the number of complaints, any action taken by the State and the result of such action. Also, please provide statistical data on the number of prisoners in prison facilities, as well as the degree to which the number of prisoners in each facility exceeds design capacities.

Articles 12 and 13

26. In the light of the information provided by the State party (CAT/C/QAT/2, p. 21) and the recommendation of the Committee in the previous concluding observations (para.

19), please update statistical data, disaggregated by crimes, nationality, age and gender, on complaints relating to torture and ill-treatment and on any related investigations, prosecutions, penal and disciplinary sanctions.

27. Regarding the statistics provided in the State party's report (CAT/C/QAT/2, p. 16), please provide detailed information on the length of imprisonment and any other penalties applied for the offences of torture or degrading treatment.

28. Please provide detailed information on measures taken to protect domestic workers from violence and ill-treatment, including sexual violence, and to ensure access to justice (A/HRC/4/23/Add.2 and Corr.1, paras. 70–75), including measures that facilitate their ability to lodge complaints, such as those to alleviate the cost of going to court or language barriers. Also, please provide updated data on the number of complaints of ill-treatment of migrant workers that were received during the reporting period, how many were investigated, how long the investigations took and the outcomes of the investigations.¹⁷ Specifically, please indicate the number of complaints received by the NHRC alleging torture or ill-treatment, including sexual violence, and the actions taken by the NHRC in response to these complaints. Also, please comment on reports that in 2010, a safe house run by the Philippines Overseas Labour Office in Doha received 291 reports from domestic workers alleging physical abuse, 59 reports alleging sexual abuse or harassment, and 16 reports alleging rape or attempted rape. Specifically, please indicate what measures the State party has put in place to investigate these allegations and the status of any investigations into the above-mentioned claims. Please also provide data on the extent to which the NHRC monitors places of employment, and any results of such monitoring.

Article 14

29. Further to the information provided by the State party (CAT/C/QAT/2, pp. 22–23) and the recommendation of the Committee in the previous concluding observations (para. 18), what has been done by the State party to ensure that all persons who have been victims of acts of torture are provided with fair and adequate compensation, including the means for a full rehabilitation? Are migrant workers and persons subjected to trafficking in persons included in programmes of compensation and provided with appropriate rehabilitation assistance? Please include the number of instances during the reporting period in which the State party ensured that a victim of torture or ill-treatment obtained compensation, and the amount received in each case. Please clarify whether a victim of torture is entitled to compensation only if he or she receives a court order, and whether victims of torture are able to obtain redress even if the perpetrator has not been found guilty in a criminal proceeding.

Article 15

30. Please provide information on measures taken to ensure that any statement which is established to have been made as a result of torture shall not be invoked as evidence in any proceedings, except against a person accused of torture as evidence that the statement was made. How does the State party guarantee the effective implementation of article 232 of the Criminal Procedure Code? Have any public officials been punished under article 159 of the Criminal Code (CAT/C/QAT/2, p. 23)? Please indicate whether, during the reporting period, any court has excluded from evidence testimony found to have been compelled through torture.

¹⁷ Committee against Torture, follow-up letter dated 7 May 2010.

Article 16

31. Please indicate the measures the State party is taking to conduct prevent harassment and arbitrary arrest of human rights defenders and journalists, and to prosecute and punish perpetrators. Please comment on the March 2011 arrest of Sultan al-Khalaifi, a blogger and former secretary-general of the NGO Alkarama, and his nearly one-month detention. Please also comment on the April 2011 arrest and prosecution of two Radio Télévision Suisse journalists.

32. Further to the recommendation of the Committee in its previous concluding observations (para. 21), has the State party taken immediate measures to guarantee respect for the human rights of all persons during any body searches, and to ensure that such searches are conducted in full compliance with international standards, including the Convention?¹⁸

33. Please indicate to what extent the State party uses solitary confinement in detention, including the number of persons placed in solitary confinement and the duration of such confinement during the reporting period. Please describe steps taken by the State party to limit the use of solitary confinement as a measure of last resort, for as short a time as possible under strict supervision and with a possibility of judicial review (A/HRC/16/52/Add.1, para. 174).

34. Please provide information on the steps taken to improve the conditions of detention of persons on death row, and to ensure they are afforded all the protections provided by the Convention. Please provide information on what crimes receive the death penalty, the number of people who have been executed and the number of people on death row. Has the State party considered establishing a moratorium on the death penalty (CAT/C/QAT/CO/1/Add.1, paras. 17–19)?

35. In the light of the commitment made by the State party in the context of the universal periodic review (A/HRC/14/2, para. 83.39) and the recommendations made by the Committee on the Rights of Child (CRC/C/QAT/CO/2, para. 71 (a)), what measures have been taken to raise the minimum age of criminal responsibility from 7 years of age to an internationally acceptable level?¹⁹

36. What measures have been taken by the State party to review its current legislation with a view to prevent and end the use of corporal punishment of children as a method of discipline, and to introduce explicit legislation prohibiting all forms of corporal punishment of children in all settings, including in the family, schools, penal system and alternative care settings?²⁰

Other issues

37. Please provide updated information on measures taken by the State party to respond to any threats of terrorism, and please describe if, and how, these anti-terrorism measures, in particular the Counter-Terrorism Act (Act No. 3 of 2004), have affected human rights safeguards in law and practice; the number and types of persons convicted under such legislation; the legal safeguards and remedies available to persons subjected to anti-terrorist measures in law and in practice; whether there are complaints of non-observance of international standards; and the outcome of these complaints.

¹⁸ Ibid.

¹⁹ CRC/C/QAT/CO/2, paras. 70–71; A/HRC/WG.6/7/QAT/2, para. 33; CAT/C/QAT/CO/1/Add.1, paras. 10–13.

²⁰ CRC/C/QAT/2, paras. 39–40; CAT/C/QAT/2, p. 27.

38. Please provide information on any measures taken to become a party to the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment.²¹

²¹ A/HRC/14/2, para. 85.2 and 85.3; A/HRC/14/2/Add.1, recommendations 2 and 3.