



**International Convention on  
the Elimination of All Forms  
of Racial Discrimination**

Distr.: General  
14 March 2017

Original: English  
English, French and Spanish only

---

**Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination**

**Consideration of reports submitted by States  
parties under article 9 of the Convention**

**Seventeenth to nineteenth periodic reports of States parties  
due in 2016**

**Israel\* \*\***

[Date received: 2 March 2017]

---

\* The present document is being issued without formal editing.  
\*\* The annexes are file with the Secretariat and are available for consultation.

GE.17-04122(E)



\* 1 7 0 4 1 2 2 \*

Please recycle



## Introduction

1. The Government of Israel (GOI) welcomes the opportunity to present its 17-19th Periodic Report to the Committee for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (Hereinafter the “Committee) in accordance with the requirements of Article 9, paragraph 1(b) of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (hereinafter, the “Convention” or “CERD”).
2. In accordance with the Committee’s Concluding Observation No. 38 of March 9, 2012, (CERD/C/ISR/CO/14-16), all GOI Ministries and institutions relevant to this Report were requested to supply data and information concerning their areas of operation. Additionally, in accordance with Concluding Observation No. 32 of March 9, 2012, Israeli Non-Governmental Organizations (“NGOs”) were also invited to submit information and comments prior to the compilation of this Report.
3. This Report was compiled by the Counseling and Legislation (International Law) Department at the Ministry of Justice (MOJ), in cooperation with other Governmental Ministries and agencies.
4. Racial discrimination is prohibited in Israel. The State of Israel condemns all forms of racial discrimination, and its Government has maintained a consistent policy prohibiting such discrimination. The GOI has taken comprehensive measures to uphold the CERD provisions since its ratification.
5. In accordance with Concluding Observations No. 33 of March 9, 2012, Israel routinely considers its position with regard to Article 14 of the Convention, but based on the experience of other states and on the current work of the Committee, it does not consider it appropriate to accept this optional procedure at this time. Under Israel’s domestic legal system, any alleged victim of violations has full access to effective redress and judicial review in Israeli courts, as well as in many other venues, as detailed in Israel’s Core Document.
6. In response to the Committee’s letter dated March 7, 2014, Israel notes the following: in regard to Concluding Observation No. 16 of March 9, 2012 — regarding information on military service benefits, such information was provided in detail in Israel’s 14-16th Report in 2010 (CERD/C/ISR/14-16) (please see Para. No. 546-549), additional information regarding other legislation is available throughout this report; in regard to Concluding Observation No. 18 on the *Citizenship and Entry into Israel Law (Temporary Provision)* 5763-2003 — please see Para. No. 181-190 below; and in regard to Concluding Observation No. 30 — please see below Para No. 15, 115-121, 334-356 and 422.

## I. Legislative Measures

7. Since the submission of Israel’s 14-16th Periodic Report, significant new steps have been taken by the Israeli Parliament (the “Knesset”) to promote tolerance and the elimination of racial discrimination in all its forms. Some noteworthy examples are cited below.
8. In accordance with Concluding Observation No. 30 of March 9, 2012, Israel is pleased to report that in March 2016, the GOI ratified the Marrakesh Treaty to Facilitate Access to Published Works for Persons Who Are Blind, Visually Impaired, or Otherwise Print Disabled of the World Intellectual Property Organization.
9. For additional legislation concerning the elimination of racial discrimination in all its forms, please see detailed information throughout this report.

## II. Judicial Measures

10. Israeli courts, led by the High Court of Justice (HCJ), continue to play a crucial role in anchoring and promoting human rights throughout Israeli society. In the criminal context,

a number of criminal cases concerning incitement to racism and the commission of racist acts were decided by the Supreme Court and lower courts, generally resulting in convictions. For details on judicial decisions, please see relevant information throughout this report.

### III. Administrative Measures

11. On April 6, 2016, the Ministerial Committee on Symbols and Ceremonies approved the list of people honored to light the twelve beacons in the ceremony that opens the national celebrations of Israel's 68th Independence Day. Included in this list were members of the Arab and Christian populations: Dr. Annan Falah, a prominent public activist for women's empowerment in Israel, and Father Gabriel Naddaf, a Greek Orthodox Priest, one of the leaders of the Aramean ethnic population and a central figure in strengthening the relationship between Jews and Christians in Israel and abroad.

#### The Ethiopian Population

12. On February 9, 2014, the Government approved its Resolution No. 1300, in which it mandated the Ministry of Aliyah and Immigrant Absorption (MOAIA), together with other relevant Ministries, to recommend a new policy for the advancement and promotion, to the greatest extent, of the integration of Israeli citizens of Ethiopian origin into Israeli society. For further detailed information concerning this Governmental policy, see Article 2 below.

#### The Arab Population

13. Over the past several years, the Government has made important inroads into improving the representation of the minority population within the Civil Service (CS) and Government Companies. The Government instituted affirmative action programs and mandated target goals to significantly increase the number of minority employees within the CS. Please see further information concerning Government Resolutions No. 922, 2365, 1052 below.

14. The Government has also been active in addressing the rights of migrant workers. Changes have been implemented that more fully protect their rights, particularly *vis à vis* their employers. This has largely been instituted by a reform in methods of employment, increasing foreign workers' awareness of their rights, and the establishment of specific enforcement divisions within the relevant governmental authorities.

15. National Conference for the Integration of the Arab Population in the MOJ and in the CS — On September 30, 2014, the MOJ held a national conference in Haifa aimed at encouraging the integration of students, lawyers and persons with academic education of the Arab population, including the Druze and Circassian populations, into the MOJ. The Ministry's representatives presented the pool of vacant positions within the Ministry and explained how to apply for these positions.

16. A similar Conference for the integration of Arab and Ethiopian populations, and persons with disabilities was also held on December 28, 2015, at the Tel Aviv University.

17. The MOJ Campaign and Hotline against Discrimination and Racism — In January 2014, a public campaign initiated by the Minister of Justice was launched with the aim of reminding the general public that discrimination and racism are not only morally wrong but constitute a criminal offence. As part of this campaign, a special hotline was created to provide information and assistance to persons affected by such acts. An internet site, including information on laws and regulations dealing with discrimination and racism, relevant judicial decisions, and ways to contact the relevant authorities, was also created. In July 2014, the issue of incitement was also added to the matters handled by the hotline. As of March 2016, 1,340 e-mails and several thousand calls concerning incitement have been received. Approximately 543 of the e-mails were transferred to the Police.

## **IV. Other measures and information**

### **Dissemination of Human Rights Conventions**

18. As of September 2014, Supreme Court hearings on constitutional issues are publicly broadcasted and made accessible through electronic media (television, radio and internet). The initial pilot came to an end in July 2016 and a tender has been issued for the continued operation of these broadcasts.

19. In May 2013, the Haifa University Senate instituted three additional vacation days honoring the most important holidays in the Christian, Islamic and the Druze religions — Christmas, Eid Al-Fitr, and Eid al-Adha respectively. This decision was taken with the participation of student representatives.

20. Several projects to promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among nations and populations have been implemented in Israel, for two outstanding examples see Part II of Annex No. II to this report (p. 19).

21. With regard to Concluding Observation No. 12 of March 9, 2012, for information on the composition of Israel's Jewish population of, please see Table No. 1 in Annex No. I to this report.

22. The following Report addresses the main issues addressed in the Convention since the submission of Israel's 14-16th Periodic Report, as well as the concerns raised by the Committee during the last session. We look forward to maintaining a constructive dialogue with the distinguished members of the Committee.

### **Article 2**

#### **A. Legal Framework to Eliminate Racial Discrimination**

23. Racial discrimination is prohibited in Israel as required under Article 2(1)(a) of the Convention. Several Basic Laws, laws, and court rulings operate together to guarantee that no public authority or public institution engage in any act or practice of racial discrimination against persons, groups of persons, or institutions. These prohibitions apply with equal force at the national and local levels, and all public authorities and institutions are required to comply with their directives.

24. Information concerning new legislation and legal amendments is available throughout this report.

#### **B. Specific Detailed Information on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination**

##### **1. Measures Taken to Prevent Discrimination by all Public Authorities and Institutions**

###### *I. Legislative Measures Relating to the Reporting Period*

25. On July 11, 2011, Amendment No. 3 to the Pupil Rights Law 5761-2000 was approved by the Knesset. This amendment added national origin to the list of grounds upon which discrimination of pupils is prohibited.

###### *II. Judicial Measures*

26. For detailed case law including landmark decisions against certain discriminatory practices of both government entities and private individuals, see Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 3).

### III. Administrative Measures

27. For information on the Ministerial Committee on Symbols and Ceremonies' April 2016 decision, please see the Introduction above.

28. Arab Population's Representation in Israel's CS — Data indicates a steady increase in the rates of Arab, Druze, Bedouin and Circassian employees in the CS. For specific data see Annex No. I to this report (p. 2). For additional information see Article 5 hereinafter.

29. The Judiciary — In recent years there has been a significant increase in the number of women and Arab citizens working in the Israeli judicial system. For specific data please see Annex No. I to this report (p. 3).

30. Governmental Companies — A steady increase is evident in the representation of the Arab population within Governmental companies. For further information see Article 5C(2) hereinafter (p. 19).

#### 2. Not Sponsoring or Defending Discrimination by Persons or Organizations

31. No change has occurred in this area since the submission of Israel's 14-16th periodic report (hereinafter: No change).

#### 3. Measures to Review, Amend, Rescind or Nullify Governmental, National and Local Policies That Create or Perpetuate Racial Discrimination

##### **Enhancing Infrastructure within Israel's Arab Localities**

##### **Planning Scheme for the Arab Population**

32. In recent years, the Department of Planning in the Ministry of Interior (MOI) has initiated an extensive project of updating planning schemes for the majority of Arab localities. Although the responsibility for initiating and promoting local planning is that of the local authorities, the Government decided to initiate and fund this project for those Arab localities which are unable to take such steps independently. For additional information about the above-mentioned project and on the implementation of the outline plans, see Part II of Annex No. II to this report (p. 19).

##### **Facilitating Housing Issues**

33. In July 2015, the Government approved a set of recommendations involving housing issues in Arab localities (Resolution No. 208). For information on this Resolution see Part III of Annex No. II to this report (p. 37).

##### **Translating into Arabic information relating to the planning process**

34. Currently, tender notices for the leasing or selling of land lots and houses are not translated into Arabic. However, the Ministry of Construction and Housing has established a special website in Arabic that includes all information presented in the Hebrew website and additional information specifically intended for the Arab population. Such information covers the governmental program for affordable housing ("A Price for Residents"), the procedure for participating and upgrading participation in the program, financial benefits, the technical specifications of the flats on offer, etc.

35. Furthermore, in 2015-2016, the Ministry widely published campaigns aimed at the Arab population through advertising "A Price for Residents" projects in Nazareth and in Sakhnin. The Ministry continues to operate to promote linguistic accessibility for the Arab population.

##### **Planning and construction in the eastern neighborhoods of Jerusalem**

36. In partnership with the residents, the Jerusalem municipality started re-planning a number of eastern neighborhoods of Jerusalem (Beit Hanina, Shuafat, Al-Issawiya, Silwan, Arab as-Sawahra, Sur Baher, Ras al-Amud, and Al-Muntar among others). The Municipality has invested millions of NIS in this process and has also established a new

system simplifying the process of proving ownership of land in eastern neighborhoods of Jerusalem. This involves a professional committee which is comprised of representatives from the municipality and local community leaders, and it serves to simplify the process of obtaining building permits.

ר"ו. Translating into Arabic planning documents filed under the *Planning and Building Law 5725-1965* — for relevant case law on this matter see Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 4).

#### 4. Measures to End Discrimination by Individuals and Organizations

38. Racism in its various manifestations is considered a criminal offence in Israel, as discussed in Article 4 below.

##### I. Legislative Measures

##### A. Increasing Proportional Representation

##### CS

39. In January 2012, the Government approved the *Expansion of Adequate Representation for Persons of the Druze Community in the Public Service (Legislative Amendments) Law 5772-2012*. This law expanded the existing affirmative action plan applicable to persons of the Druze community, by requiring government companies with more than 50 employees, as well as municipalities in which at least one-tenth, but no more than 50% of the residents are Druze, to apply the Law's affirmative action requirements with respect to persons of the Druze community, for all the positions and ranks within these companies.

40. The *Expansion of Adequate Representation for Persons of the Ethiopian Community in the Civil Service (Legislative Amendments) Law 5771-2011*, was enacted in March 28, 2011. This law drastically expanded the existing affirmative action scheme applicable to individuals who were born in Ethiopia or who have at least one parent born in Ethiopia, by requiring Government Ministries, agencies and government companies with more than 50 employees, as well as municipalities, to apply the Law's affirmative action requirements with respect to persons of Ethiopian descent, for all the positions and ranks within these companies. The amendment further mandates companies and municipalities to promote the appropriate representation of employees of Ethiopian descent in their workplace. These requirements apply to all types of job openings, as well as promotions within government companies and municipalities.

##### II. Judicial Measures

##### Prohibiting Discrimination by Private Enterprises

41. For relevant case law on this issue see Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 5).

##### III. Administrative Measures

##### **The Authority for Economic Development of the Arab Population, Including Druze, Bedouin and Circassian (hereinafter: the "Authority")**

42. The Authority is a multi-purpose entity that leads policy changes, is charged with drafting and implementing government programs, handles the coordination and monitoring, all for the benefit of the Arab population.

43. The Authority leads economic and social projects in collaboration with governmental and municipal agencies, as well as civil society organizations — among them an investment fund with the total sum of 177 Million NIS (46.5 Million USD) and a scholarship fund for Arab students totaling 15 Million NIS (3.95 Million USD). The budgetary scope of the government programs headed by the Authority is approximately 3 Billion NIS (789.5 Million USD). Hereinafter are several examples of Government Resolutions supervised by the Authority.

44. On June 2, 2016, the GOI approved Resolution No. 1480 titled “Government plan for the empowerment and socio-economic strengthening of the Bedouin localities in northern Israel for the years 2016-2020.” On December, 31, 2015, the Government approved Resolution No. 922 titled “Government activities for the development of minority populations for the years 2016-2020.” On December 21, 2014, the Government approved Resolution No. 2365 titled “Government plan for the development of Minority Localities (including Arab, Bedouin, Druze and Circassian local authorities) in 2015.” On December 15, 2013, the GOI approved Resolution No. 1052 titled “Multi-year plan for the development and strengthening of the Druze localities in the Golan for the years 2014-2017”. For information on these Resolutions please see Part III of Annex No. II to this report (p. 38).

45. The Authority provides additional assistance for Arab local authorities, in areas ranging from adequate application for subsidies published annually by Government Ministries and additional entities, to better usage of those subsidies granted.

#### **Affirmative Action in Higher Education**

46. In addition, in December 2015, the Council for Higher Education (CHE) published a call for submission of proposals for the establishment and operation of a state-funded academic college in an Arab locality in northern Israel. This institute will render higher education more accessible to the Arab population living in northern Israel, especially women.

47. In 2014, the Ministry of Education (MOE) and the CHE together with the Iratika Scholarship Fund and other private donors and benefactors, offered 650 scholarships for first degree students of the Arab population (including Druze and Circassian students) for the 2015 academic year. In 2014, 650 scholarships in the total sum of 6.5 Million NIS (1.7 Million USD) were allocated. Preparations are being made for the second allocation to roughly 650 new recipients.

#### **5. Measures to Encourage NGOs to Foster Mutual Understanding**

48. There are a number of organizations in Israel that seek to enhance cross-cultural understanding and co-existence. As discussed further in Article 7 below, the activities range from youth orchestras to educational centers such as Givat Haviva, etc.

### **C. Information on National Human Rights Institutions (NHRI)**

49. For information on mechanisms for the protection of human rights please see Israel Core Document of 2008 (HRI/CORE/ISR/2008) and as amended in 2014 (HRI/CORE/ISR/2015) (Article 2(IV)(A)(vi) to (xiii)).

#### **Bedouins in the Negev**

50. The Bedouin population resides in both the North and the South of the country. The Government has initiated a number of plans that address their concerns and needs, as described in Article 5 below. The key goals are to allow for sustainable integration of the Bedouin population, while maintaining their traditional practices and lifestyle. All of the plans involve active participation of the relevant communities.

#### **Advancement of the Integration of the Ethiopian Population into Israeli Society**

51. On February 9, 2014, the Government approved Resolution No. 1300 in which it mandated the MOAIA, together with other relevant Ministries, to recommend a new policy for the advancement and promotion, to the greatest extent, of the integration of Israeli citizens of Ethiopian origin into Israeli society. On July 31, 2015, the Government approved Resolution No. 324, thus adopting the milestones for Governmental policy for this advancement. For additional information on these Resolutions and on Government Resolution No. 609 and 1107, please see Part III of Annex No. II to this report (p. 40).

52. The total budget for this project is approximately 500 Million NIS (130.2 Million USD). The project administration is currently in the process of recruiting personnel for the implementation of this plan.

### **Inter-Ministerial Team in Charge of Forming an Action Plan to Deal with Racism against Persons of Ethiopian Origin**

53. On January 18, 2016, the Ministerial Committee for the Advancement of the Integration into the Israeli Society of Israeli Citizens of Ethiopian Origin approved a decision assigning the MOJ's Director General to establish and direct an inter-ministerial team charged with forming an action plan to deal with racism against persons of Ethiopian origin. For additional information on this team see Part II of Annex No. II to this report (p. 21).

## **Article 3**

54. Apartheid has always been regarded as abhorrent by the GOI and society, and continues to be so regarded. Apartheid has never been practiced in Israel. There exists in Israel no restrictions of any kind as to place of residence nor is there any segregation of any kind.

## **Article 4**

### **A. Criminal Prosecution of Racism**

#### *I. The Law*

55. No change.

#### *II. State Attorney's (SA) Guidelines and the Department for Special Functions (DSF)*

56. In 2012, the SA issued a guideline titled "Offences committed with an ideological or nationalistic motive" which emphasized the use of the *Penal Law*'s provision that allows for doubling the maximal punishment set for an offence when it is committed with racist intent or motivated by hostility towards a section of the public, etc. In addition, District SA's were requested to supervise personally the handling of each case of ideological or nationalistic offences. Additional supervision and final responsibility for the decision making process in such cases rests with the Deputy SA (Special Functions).

#### *III. Judicial Perspectives*

57. Since 2012, the DSF in the SA's Office (SAO) has authorized the filing of dozens of indictments in cases of offences motivated by racism or hostility. Investigations into the statements of several rabbis have been conducted. Moreover, one religious educational institute was closed after it was established that its educational content was violent and inciting and the funding for another religious educational institute was terminated on the same grounds.

58. Beyond these measures, the staff of the DSF has been working since 2012 to increase the attribution of hate crimes — an aggravating circumstance that applies to offenses carried out with racial motivation or hostility to a certain public — to criminal incidents in accordance with Section 144F of the *Penal Law*. In the past years the SAO has approved the addition of this circumstance to many files. The circumstance allows the prosecution to request double the punishment set for the offense specified in the indictment.

59. Please see several main examples of judicial decisions concerning criminal prosecution of racism in Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 6).



### **Incitement on the Internet**

60. The DSF also deals with prosecution of incitement offences in general, including cases of incitement on the internet.

61. The policy for dealing with incitement on the internet has changed. This change includes a substantial increase in the number of investigations and indictments concerning offenses of incitement to racism or violence; raising public awareness by clarifying the “red lines” of legitimate public discourse; appointing officials in each SA’s District Offices (SADO) authorized to handle such cases within in a short timeframe, filing an indictment within one month and providing information to the public through the media regarding these steps. Accordingly, dozens of indictments for incitement on the internet, mainly through social media, have been filed.

62. During 2014, there was an increase in the number of incitement to racism and violence cases and more than 200 such cases were opened and a total of 86 indictments were filed. During 2015, an additional 80 indictments were filed for incitement to racism or to violence and for offences that were committed with a racial motive.

## **IV. Administrative Measures**

63. The use of “Illegal Association” Restrictions as a Legal Tool — On August 13, 2013, the Minister of Defense declared that any association of persons — unionized or not, including any group, cell, social partnership, section, or similar association — that uses the name “price-tag” or any other derivative with a similar meaning is an “illegal association” pursuant to Regulation 84 of the *Defense (Emergency) Regulations* of 1945. Under this classification, a “price-tag” offence can be regarded as a security-related offence that, in certain circumstances, allows for special law enforcement measures to be taken, subject to judicial review. Defining “price-tag” perpetrators as engaging in an “illegal association” also attests to Israel’s unequivocal stance against this phenomenon.

### **B. Racial Motive as an Aggravating Circumstance**

64. The issue of racial motive as an aggravated circumstance is regulated by Section 144F to the *Penal Law*. In 2016, (until November 30) 13 cases were authorized to be filed as indictments that include racial motive. In 2015, this figure stood on 24 investigations, and in 2014, 41 such investigations were authorized. In the past year, reaching a plea bargain requires consultation with the Deputy AG. For additional information see Israel’s 14th-16th Periodic Report (Para. 168).

### **D. Judicial Measures**

65. For detailed information concerning incitements and cases relating to incitement to violence, racism, or other serious offences with a racial motive, please see Table no. 2 in Annex No. I and Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 6).

## **Article 5**

### **A. The Right to Equal Treatment before National Tribunals**

66. The right to equal treatment for all persons regardless of their race or ethnic origin is a fundamental principle in Israel. All governmental bodies and judicial apparatus recognize this right, and maintain and uphold equal treatment for all individuals. In regard to the Appeals Tribunal over decisions of the Detention Review Tribunal-Section 13W to the *Entry into Israel Law 5712-1952*, sets the appointment procedure of judges based upon a public process of examination and selecting by a professional committee. In addition, the principle of independence set forth in Article 3 of the *Administrative Courts Law 5752-1992*, applies to the Appeals Tribunal.

67. In order to guarantee these rights, free legal aid is offered in Israel under certain circumstances in both civil and criminal proceedings.

68. **The Legal Aid Administration (LAA)** — is a unit operating under the auspices of the MOJ. The main responsibility of the LAA is the provision of legal assistance to persons who cannot afford to realize their constitutional right of access to judicial forums, subject to certain conditions and subject to an eligibility test. The LAA provides legal representation by virtue of the provisions of the *Legal Aid Law 5732-1972* and *the Legal Aid Regulations 5733-1973*. While it is a governmental organ, the LAA enjoys some independence and has the ability to file suits against the Government on behalf of their patrons when necessary.

69. **The Public Defender's Office (PDO)** — is part of the MOJ. Its goals are to promote the best interests and protect the rights of all suspects, defendants, and convicts in Israel. **PDO provides legal representation throughout the entire criminal proceedings**, from consultation for suspects during police investigation to representation during sentencing, hearings before parole committees, etc. PDO plays a crucial role in the representation of persons who cannot afford a lawyer and in maintaining justice in criminal legal proceedings. Recently, PDO launched a website in Hebrew, English, Arabic and Russian.

#### **The Counter-Terrorism Law 5776-2016**

70. On June 15, 2016, as part of Israel's ongoing battle against terrorism, the GOI enacted the *Counter Terrorism Law 5776-2016*. This detailed and carefully-designed new law is part of an effort to provide law enforcement authorities with more effective tools to combat modern terrorist threats while incorporating additional checks and balances necessary to safeguard against unreasonable violations of individual human rights. The Law provides, among other things, updated definitions of "terrorist organization", "terrorist act" and "membership in a terrorist organization", detailed regulations for the process of designating terrorist organizations, and enhanced enforcement tools, both criminal and financial. This Law nullifies current legislation in the field of counter-terrorism. It does not create discrimination on the grounds of race, color, decent or national or ethnic origin and does not subject individuals to racial or ethnic profiling or stereotyping.

## **B. Security of the Person**

71. In April 10, 2016, the Government approved its Resolution No. 1402, titled "improvement of personal security in the Arab population and the Security in Jerusalem. For additional information please see Part III of Annex No. II to this report (p. 40).

72. Also in 2014, as part of an effort to increase personal security in minorities' localities and to fight crime, two police stations commenced operating in Kafr Qasim and Iron — each receiving an allocation of 60 personnel.

73. Israel Defense Forces (IDF), the IDF has a military justice system which examines and investigates allegations of misconduct, ensuring compliance with the rule of law, including International Law and the Law of Armed Conflict. The three main components of the military justice system are as follows: the **Military Advocate General's Corps** ("MAG Corps"). The Military Advocate General himself is appointed by the civilian Minister of Defense and is guided only by Israel's Attorney General (AG); the **Military Police Criminal Investigation Division** ("MPCID") which is the IDF's primary entity for investigating allegations of criminal offences. It enjoys complete professional independence and is not subordinate to any commanders outside the military justice system; and **the Military Courts**, which are independent of both the Military Advocate General and the IDF chain of command. These courts adjudicate charges against IDF soldiers for military and criminal offenses.

74. Furthermore, the IDF's military justice system is subject to civilian supervision by the AG. Further review is available through Israel's Supreme Court, which may hear direct appeals on a judgment of the Military Court of Appeals. Complainants or NGOs may also petition the Supreme Court, sitting as the HCJ, against a decision of the MAG or the AG.

75. The IDF, as part of the executive branch, is also subject to the supervision and inspection of the State Comptroller, who carries out external audits and reports and fulfills the function of a Public Complaints Commissioner (Ombudsman). The Comptroller is accountable only to the Israel's Parliament (Knesset) and enjoys unrestricted access to the accounts, files, and staff of all bodies subject to an audit.

76. Furthermore, the Knesset can also appoint a parliamentary committee of inquiry and act to supervise the activities of the IDF.

#### **Communication between the IDF and Minority Population Groups**

77. **The Bedouins and Druze population** — the IDF is operating to expand the recruitment and involvement of persons of the Bedouin and Druze populations. For this purpose, the IDF's human resources is responsible for assisting these populations in the pre-drafting stages and during their service.

78. **Every position is open before every person, regardless of his/her race, religion and color, and assignments are determined only in accordance with each person's qualifications.**

79. **With regards to the rates of Bedouin Volunteers, a wide plan was formed in order to expand these rates for various positions, including in technological and professional positions.**

80. **The Israel Security Agency (ISA)** operates in accordance with the *Israel Security Agency Law 5762-2002* and is subject to review by the Inspector for Complaints, by the State Comptroller, the SAO, the AG, the Knesset and every instance of the courts, including the HCJ.

81. Where a complaint is made concerning an interrogation, the Inspector, who has been an organ in the MOJ since 2014, conducts an inquiry. The Inspector's findings are transferred to a senior advocate in the SAO who examines the evidence and makes a recommendation as to whether the facts justify opening a criminal investigation.

82. The Department for Investigation of Police Officers (DIPO) in the MOJ is specifically designated to investigate complaints of involvement of police personnel in the commission of offences (defined as offences punishable by one year imprisonment or more).

83. The DIPO views with the utmost severity instances of police officers' ill-treatment and disproportionate use of force. Cases of alleged violence are investigated thoroughly and meticulously, using all means to exhaust the investigation and bring to justice those found to have used unnecessary violence or acted in an unreasonable manner.

84. The DIPO is responsible for most criminal investigations against police officers. Disciplinary proceedings are initiated by filing a complaint to the Disciplinary Department at the Police Central Headquarters Personnel Division or to any of its branches.

85. For information concerning cases handled by the DIPO please see Annex No. I to this report (p. 12).

86. The Israel Prisons **Service (IPS)**, every detainee under the care of the IPS has access to the following complaint mechanisms: filing a complaint to the prison Director; petitioning the relevant District Court in a prisoner's petition; filing a complaint to the Wardens Investigation Unit of (WIU) through the IPS or directly to the Unit, which is part of the Police and not the IPS. The findings of the WIU are subject to the SAO scrutiny, who decides whether to institute disciplinary measures or criminal proceedings. Detainees may also file a complaint to the Prisoners Complaint Ombudsman, including via a complaint box placed inside the prison which is conveyed to him directly and without the interference of the prisons' staff; write to Members of Knesset; file a complaint to the State Comptroller and Ombudsman and approach an Official Visitor.

87. In addition, Section 71 of the *Prisons Ordinance* establishes rules for Official Visitors to prisons, appointed by the Minister of Public Security. Official Visitors are allowed to enter the prisons at any given time (unless special temporary circumstances

apply) to inspect prisoners' care, prison management, etc. During these visits, the prisoners may approach the visitors and present their complaints.

### **Communication between the Police and Minority Population Groups**

#### **Relations with the Arab Population**

88. The Police carries out a regular annual work plan for strengthening and improving relations with the Arab community. For information concerning a focused organizational effort that was conducted during 2014-2015 on this issue see Part II of Annex No. II to this report (p. 22).

89. Following a claim raised by an NGO in the process of compiling this report, that Arab complainants admitted to hospital are unable to file complaints against their attackers whilst in hospital, but are directed to police stations in order to do so, and following a query that was directed to all police districts in this regard, the Police reiterated that in every case in which a person is hospitalized as a result of a serious violent offense, an investigator is sent to him/her at the hospital to take a complaint.

#### **Relations with the Ethiopian Population**

90. In 2015 following the Ethiopian population's protest against the Police, a steering committee was formed headed by the Director of the Police's Human Resources Department, including representatives of the Ethiopian population, with the aim of examining claims of racism and discrimination in the criminal law enforcement system. The team collected factual data and summoned representatives from police units, both in order to clarify the actions taken so far in handling complaints to formulate a program for the future handling of this matter.

91. Although this work evolved in order to respond to claims raised by the Ethiopian population, it was expanded during 2016 in order to apply to additional populations such as the Arab and the Ultra-Orthodox populations.

92. The Police has drawn a detailed plan for reinforcing trust between the Police and the Ethiopian population and reducing sensitive incidents. For Additional information on this plan and on special operations taken at Police stations please see Part II of Annex No. II to this report (p. 23).

93. **Personal Cameras Pilot** — In August 2016, the Police began a pilot program involving personal body cameras attached to police personnel, in order to increase transparency regarding daily police operation, objective recording of incidents and in order to reduce clashes between police personnel and citizens. For information on this program see Part II of Annex No. II to this report (p. 23).

94. **Verbal Accessibility** — Interpreters are summoned to Police stations and units in accordance with the needs and operative requirements of each investigation, with the aim of supplying professional translation services in the shortest time possible. The interpreters travel to all Police stations as required, regardless of geographical distance or other variables.

95. Following an agreement signed with a private company, the Police receives translation services **into all languages** including sign language, including of course Amharic and Tigrinya, all days of the year and at all hours of the day (excluding on the Day of Atonement).

96. The Investigations Department is advancing the linguistic accessibility of the main forms used during a criminal investigation and their translation into English, Russian, French and Amharic. The process of translating and computerizing these documents is ongoing.

97. Amharic speaking policemen have been placed in emergency call centers (100/110) 24/7.

98. Also, a complaint form to the DIPO in the MOJ has been formulated. This form will be given to any suspect or witness who raises a complaint regarding police violence towards him/her. This form will also be translated into Amharic.

### **Information regarding Police Personnel from among the Arab and Ethiopian Populations**

99. The Police invest great efforts in seeking candidates for recruitment among the Arab and Ethiopian populations, and in recruiting additional members of these populations by holding career days, participating in employment conventions for discharged IDF soldiers, in conferences of the MOAIA and more.

100. For further information on this issue please see Table No. 3 and additional data thereafter, in Annex No. I to this report.

101. In addition, emphasis is placed on the recruitment of criminal and traffic prosecutors of Ethiopian decent. Presently, 11 prosecutors are serving in the police prosecution division, seven of whom were recruited during 2015/16.

### **Asylum Seekers**

102. Israel fully respects all its obligations under the 1951 Refugee Convention and the Protocol of 1967, ratified by Israel. For figures regarding undocumented migrants in Israel please see Annex No. I to this report (p. 14).

103. Israel is committed to the principle of non-refoulement and will not return persons to an area where their lives or liberty are at risk.

104. As far as encouraging the return of migrants to foreign countries, Israel has reached arrangements with two safe third countries with regard to the safe relocation of persons from Sudan and Eritrea who entered Israel through the Egyptian border illegally, as a more appropriate way of dealing with this situation, due to the unique circumstances that Israel is facing and the geopolitical context in the Middle East.

105. The AG conditioned his approval of the safe relocation policy on the following criteria:

- There are no wars or general disturbances taking place in the third countries;
- No UNHCR recommendations exist against relocation to the third countries;
- The life and freedom of the individual are not at risk in the third countries based on race, religion, nationality or membership in a particular social or political group;
- Relocated individuals in the third countries will have access to the asylum procedure or enjoy temporary protection, or, at a minimum, these countries are obligated to abide by the *non-refoulement* principle;
- Torture or cruel and degrading treatment are prohibited in the third countries;
- The third countries are obligated to allow the relocated individuals the means to live in a dignified manner, or at least the possibility to stay and to work for a living.

106. Prior to reaching these arrangements, Israeli authorities ensured that these third countries are committed to international legal standards for treatment of asylum seekers. These countries are parties to the 1951 Refugee Convention and other major human rights conventions, and they meet the AG's criteria.

107. Several NGOs petitioned the District Court in Be'er-Sheva against the procedure but their petition was rejected in November 2015. The Court determined that prior to the implementation of these agreements, a thorough and strict examination had been made, regarding the safety of these third countries on the political, social, economic and legal levels. An appeal to the Supreme Court is currently pending.

108. Between 2010 and 2015, 12,300 persons who entered Israel through the Egyptian border illegally, exited Israel to safe third countries or to their country of origin voluntarily. Based on the information available to the State of Israel, there have been no known cases of

violations of the principle of non-refoulement, and those relocated receive all their rights according to the arrangements.

109. For detailed case law on the Amendments to the Prevention of Infiltration Law (Offenses and Jurisdiction) 5714-1954, please see Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 8).

## **C. Political Rights**

### **1. Access to the Political System**

110. No change.

The Right to Run for National Public Office

111. No change.

#### **Legislative Developments**

112. On December 9, 2014, the Knesset approved *Election Law (Legislative Amendments) 5775-2014*, which, *inter alia*, amended the *Knesset Election Law [Consolidated Version] 5729-1969*. Among other things, the amending law revised Section 76(C) of the *Knesset Election Law*, clarifying that a blank note marked by a handwritten letter representing a list or marked by such a handwritten letter and the list's label, in Hebrew, Arabic or both, is sufficient to be regarded as a legal note. Prior to this amendment, the *Knesset Election Law* was silent in regard to the languages in which such a vote may be cast.

113. In March 2014, the Knesset approved Amendment no. 62 to the *Knesset Elections Law*. In the scope of this amendment, the electoral threshold for political parties to be elected into the Knesset was raised from 2% to 3.25%. In the explanatory notes for this amendment, the Knesset notes that the purpose of this threshold is to reduce the number of political parties represented in the Knesset by preventing the representation of very small parties and encouraging them to unite with other parties in one electoral list. The explanatory notes further state that such a rate for this threshold is common in other countries as well, and that several parties may run in a unified list — but still remain separate parties in the Knesset — provided that an advanced notice is provided to the Knesset Chairperson. For related case law, please see Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 10).

#### **The Central Elections Committee**

114. The Central Elections Committee, including its current Chairperson sees great importance in raising the rate of voter turnout and integrating the entire Israeli population in the elections process. For information relating to steps implemented by the Committee, including allocation of resources, transportation to the ballot boxes and encouraging voting for the 20th Knesset please see Part II of Annex No. II to this report (p. 24).

#### **Members of Ethnic and Religious Minorities**

115. Minorities vote for Knesset lists (political parties) along with the entire population. In addition, Arab political parties have been consistently represented in the Knesset, as is the case in the current 20th Knesset. There are currently thirteen Arab Knesset Members, four Druze, and one Bedouin Knesset Member (two of who are women). For updated figures regarding Arab Knesset Members sitting in the current 20th Knesset and key roles please see Table No. 4 in Annex No. I to this report.

Political Expression of Knesset Members

116. In this regard, please see Israel's 14-16th Periodic Report of 2010.

#### **Case Law**

117. For relevant case law, please see Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 10).

## 2. Access to Public Service

### The CS-General

118. **The Arab Population's Representation in Israel's CS** — Since 1994, the Government has been taking affirmative action to enhance the integration of the Arab and Druze populations into the CS. These include both legislative and administrative measures. Some of the most recent examples are:

(i) The enactment of the Expansion of Adequate Representation for Persons of the Druze Community in the Civil Service (Legislative Amendments) Law 5772-2012, please see Article 2B(4)(1)(I) above.

(ii) Furthermore, in order to better inform Israeli Arabs of the specialized positions available in the CS, the GOI ran a media campaign in 2012. As part of this campaign, a special website was established in which information and success stories are published — all with the aim of making the CS more accessible to the Arab population.

(iii) In January 2012, the CS Commission (CSC) issued a new procedure for hiring employees in order to conform to Government Resolution No. 2579, according to which at least 10% of the CS employees should be of the Arab population. According to the new procedure, every Ministry or auxiliary requesting to hire new employees shall approach the Planning and Supervision Department who determine the minimum number of positions to be manned by persons of the Arab population. Any Ministry or unit that meets the required 10% will be exempt from this procedure.

(iv) For Further information please see Annex No. I to this report (p. 2).

(v) **Minorities' Terms of Employment in the CS.** The CSC has also taken steps to better accommodate the needs and lifestyles of minority employees. Holiday and vacation time is provided according to the relevant religious holidays, such that Muslim employees are entitled to a day off during Ramadan and Christians can choose Sunday as their day off work. Only recently, in May 2016, the CSC approved, beyond the letter of the law, that Muslim employees of the MOJ will be able to report on-call shifts during the holy month of Ramadan, since this year it almost parallels the month of June in the Gregorian calendar. Normally, on-call shifts may not be reported during holidays.

### Persons of the Ethiopian Population in the CS

119. For further information please see Article 2B (4) (1) (I) above.

120. The Ethiopian population constitutes approximately 1.5% of the Israeli population; parallel to the percentage represented in the CS (approximately 1.4%). In order to further increase representation in the CS, particularly for those with higher education, Government Resolution No. 2506 of November 2010 created 30 positions (13 of which were new), specifically to be fulfilled by people of Ethiopian population. The Resolution was implemented in 2013 and has increased the Ethiopian population representation in the CS, and this trend continues.

### Ministry of Justice

121. The Ministry is constantly operating to increase the number of employees of Ethiopian origin so it will reach at least 1.5%. Currently there are 30 employees of Ethiopian origin employed in the Ministry (0.75%). Although there is a need for improvement, this figure represents an increase compared to 2014.

122. In addition, the Ministry's LAA and the PDO regularly outsource to 29 lawyers of Ethiopian origin.

### The Judiciary

123. Please see Annex No. I to this report (p. 3).

### **Representation in Governmental Companies**

124. Appropriate representation is required in each government company, and in accordance with the company's unique characters. Thus, the Committee for the Examination of Appointments does not insist upon appropriate representation in very small companies (1-3 directors), or in a company which is newly established or which is under liquidation, or in a company which in essence is not related to the Arab population.

125. Increasing Arab Representation within Governmental Companies — According to data received from the Government Companies Authority, there is a steady increase in the representation of the Arab population within Governmental companies. For information on this issue, please see Annex No. I to this report (p. 3).

## **D. Civil Rights**

### **1. The Right to Freedom of Movement and Residence Within state Borders**

#### **The Legal Landscape**

126. No change.

#### **Freedom of Movement within the State**

127. Freedom of movement within the State is generally unrestricted unless by a lawful decision of the Minister of Interior. All residents of Israel (i.e., citizens, permanent residents who are not citizens, and temporary residents) are required to register their address, or any change thereof, with the Population Registry. Non-resident aliens need not register their whereabouts while in the country.

#### **Public Transportation Services in Bedouin Localities**

128. The Ministry of Transportation and Road Safety continued to advance the development of intra-municipal infrastructure in Arab localities and the development of inter-municipal infrastructure through the allocation of budgets to the local municipalities.

129. For information related to Government Resolutions on this issue, including in regard to northern Bedouin localities, please see Part III of Annex No. II to this report (p. 41).

130. Public transportation services are provided for the Bedouin population in the north for lower cost, and are operated regularly on all days of the week, including Saturdays. Public transportation in the Bedouin localities in the north is provided for the localities of Abtin, Shibli and Zarzir. Other localities are assisted by service lines, which are operated in a similar manner to those that operate in localities in the South.

131. More improvements are expected in the next few years with respect to transportation infrastructure in Arab, Druze and Bedouin localities.

### **2. The Right to Leave any Country, Including One's Own, and to Return to One's Country**

132. No change.

#### **Exit from Israel**

133. No change.

134. Please see related case law regarding MK Sa'id Naffaa in Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 11).

#### **Entry into Israel**

135. Please see Israel's 14-16th Periodic Report in this regard.



136. In addition, in August 2014, Population and Immigration Authority (PIA) personnel were instructed to recognize same-sex marriages for the purposes of granting a visa in accordance with the *Law of Return 5710-1950*.

### 3. The Right to Nationality

137. No change.

The Eastern Neighborhoods of Jerusalem

Expiration of Residency

138. In 1967, the Palestinian residents of the eastern neighborhoods of Jerusalem received the status of permanent residents. A permanent resident who wishes to receive Israeli Citizenship is entitled to do so, subject to security or criminal prevention. Since 1967, more than 15,000 permanent residents of the eastern neighborhoods received Israeli citizenship.

139. Permanent residents receive the same rights as citizens, excluding an Israeli passport and the right to vote in general elections. However, residents can participate in municipal elections. Residency can expire when the person leaves Israel for a period longer than seven years or acquires citizenship or residency in another country. Expiration of residency is relevant only with regard to *residence* abroad for a period longer than seven years, rather than a *temporary stay* abroad (as required, for example, in order to participate in academic studies).

140. A person can regain his/her residency, if he/she maintains an affinity to Israel despite his/her life abroad, if he/she lived in Israel for two consecutive years, and if certain conditions were met.

141. The following statistics relate to residents of eastern neighborhoods of Jerusalem whose residency expired: 2015 — 84 cases; 2014 — 107 cases; 2013 — 93 cases; 2012 — 114 cases. As can be seen, these figures are extremely small.

142. Recently, the Court for Administrative Affairs ruled in a number of petitions on this matter. For related information see Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 12).

### 4. The right to marriage and Free Choice of Spouse

Underage Marriage in Israel

143. In December 2013, the Knesset amended the *Marital Age Law 5710-1950* (Amendment No. 6), by raising the minimum marital age from 17 to 18. The Law prescribes that a Family Matters Court is authorized to permit the marriage of a minor if they are above the age of 16 and if there are unique reasons linked to the minors' best interest to do so. The Court must hear the minor before deciding on this matter. In addition, concerning the marriage of a minor over the age of 16 but below the age of 17, the Court must request a survey of a social worker in accordance the *Marital Age Law*.

Same-Sex Marriages

144. No change.

145. In recent years, there have been many judicial decisions which have promoted rights of same-sex couples in Israel. For further information, please see Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 12).

Family Unification

146. In paragraph 18 of its concluding observations to Israel's 14th-16th Periodic Report, the Committee expressed concern with the process of family reunification for foreign spouses.

147. For background information on the *Citizenship and Entry into Israel Law (Temporary Provision) 5763-2003*, including the Law's constitutionality as upheld by the Supreme Court, please see Israel's 14th-16th Periodic Report.

148. The Law was extended several times and it is currently valid until June 30, 2017.

149. On April 17, 2016, the Minister of Interior requested that the Government extend the Law for a further year, in accordance with the expert opinion of the Israeli Security Agency (ISA). Moreover, the wave of terrorist attacks that began in October 2015 has shown that status given for the purpose of family unification is still misused in order to engage in and facilitate terrorist activity.

150. Nevertheless, following statements of the Supreme Court, the Minister of Interior has decided on a number of changes aimed at providing humanitarian relief for those to whom the Law applies. The Government gave notification that holders of temporary residency (A/5) visas will be able to extend the visa for a period of two years, instead of one year at a time.

151. In addition, the Government notified the Court that holders of temporary permits for stay in Israel granted by the Coordinator of Government Activities in the Territories (COGAT), whose family reunification applications were made before the end of 2003 (the year the Temporary Provision was enacted) and who have therefore been screened by the security services for many years, would be upgraded. These individuals are to be granted temporary resident status which includes registration in the population registry, social security benefits and national health insurance for them and their children. They will also receive an Israeli identity document. This upgrade will be made available to persons born after January 1, 1998, who comply with several standard criteria (namely, that their marriage is an authentic one, that they live in Israel and that there are no security or criminal obstacles to the upgrade). This decision should affect some 2,000 families.

152. Furthermore, it was determined that the Advisory Committee to the Minister will be instructed that in relevant humanitarian circumstances, recommendations for a two year permit may be given, as opposed to recommendations limited to one year at a time.

153. In regard to health care, the *National Health Insurance Regulations (Registration to a Health Fund, Rights and Obligations of Persons Who Receive a Permit Pursuant to the Citizenship and Entry into Israel Law (Temporary Provision) 5763-2003) 5776-2016*, which entered into force on August 1, 2016, established a health insurance arrangement similar to that enshrined in the *Health insurance Law* relating to persons who hold temporary permits for stay in Israel pursuant to sections 3, 3A(2) or 3A1(a)(2) of the *Citizenship and Entry into Israel Law*.

## **5. The right to inherit**

154. No change.

## **6. The Right to Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion**

### **Freedom of Religion**

155. Freedom of religion is an important aspect of Israeli society, and also includes the freedom from religion, sometimes also referred to as the freedom of conscience, as well as the freedom to practice one's religion, which are all basic principle of Israeli law.

#### *Promoting Equality in Funding of Religious Services*

#### *Budgeting of Religious Services and Religious Institutions*

156. Please see Annex No. I to this report (p. 15).

#### *Civil burial*

157. The *Right to Alternative Civil Burial Law 5756-1996* requires that such alternative cemeteries be established in various areas around the country, sufficiently distant from one

another so that all those who wish to take advantage of them may reasonably be able to do so. For information on cemeteries for civilian burial in Israel Please see Annex No. I to this report (p. 15).

#### **Case Law**

158. Please see Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 13).

#### *Non-discrimination on the Basis of Religious Affiliation and Building of Religious Institutions*

159. No change.

#### *Protection of Holy sites*

160. Israel sees great importance in protecting holy sites of all religions and acts to prevent damages to such sites. In cases where damage is caused, the State takes measures in order to investigate and prosecute the offenders as detailed hereinafter.

#### **Case Law**

161. Please see Part I of Annex No II to this report (p.14).

#### *Free Access and Protection of Holy Places*

162. Israeli Law grants freedom of worship and ensures the safekeeping of and access to holy places to members of all faiths. Sites are guarded by the Police in order to protect public order in sensitive places.

### **7. Freedom of Opinion and Expression**

163. For information regarding incitement to racism on the internet please see Article 4(A)(III) above.

#### **Case law**

164. For related case law, please see Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 14).

### **8. Freedom of peaceful Assembly and Association**

165. Please see Israel's 14th-16th Periodic Report for further information.

166. In addition, concerning the Ministry of Defense's declaration on an "illegal association," please see Article 4(A)(IV) above.

## **E. Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights**

### **1. The Right to Employment**

167. Increasing the employment rate in Israel among all population groups is a primary objective of the Government and of the Ministry of Economy and Industry (MOEAI) in particular.

168. In recent years, there has been a constant increase in the employment rate of Arab women. In 2014, the employment rate among Arab women between the ages of 25-64 was 33% (compared to 27% in 2011) with a target of 41% percent by 2020. Among Arab men between the ages of 25-64, the employment rate is close to 76% with a target of 78% by 2020. This increase is compatible with the Government's targets under Government Resolution No. 1995 of July 15, 2010. For information about Government actions to increase the employment rate among the Arab population, for both men and women (including in regard to Ryan employment centers, daycare centers, professional training, entrepreneurship encouragement, development and establishment of industrial zones, integration in to high-tech industries, employment of Arab teachers and more), please see Part II of Annex No. II to this report (p. 25).

### **Employment among the Bedouin Population**

169. In the past few years, the MOEAI has taken significant steps to promote and integrate the Bedouin population into the labor market pursuant to Government Resolution No. 3708 (September 11, 2011) which establishes a five year plan to promote the economic growth and development of the Bedouin population in the Negev (2012-2016). The plan's total budget stands at 1.263 Billion NIS (343 Million USD), of which 338 Million NIS (92 Million USD) has been allocated to the MOEAI.

170. In 2014, the Bedouin population employment rate was 65% among men and 26% among women, and the unemployment rate was 13% among men and 6% among women. Thus, special vocational training and programs for this population have been developed in order to increase employment rates and increase the number of students, men and women, enrolled in higher education courses. For further information (including in regard to Ryan employment centers, professional training, daycare centers, industrial parks, integration in to high-tech industries and more) please see Part II of Annex No. II to this report (p. 27).

### **Promotion of the Ethiopian Population in the Labor Market**

171. About 135,000 Israeli citizens are of Ethiopian origin; about 45,000 of them had been born in Israel. The population is young compared to the general population and only about 63,000 persons are of employable age (18 to 65). Over the years, there has been a significant increase in the employment rates of persons of Ethiopian origin. This is partly due to the increases in the level of education. Correspondingly, employment gaps between men and women of Ethiopian decent had been substantially reduced. The rates of participation in the labor market among the Ethiopian population are similar to those of the general population and even exceed it — 65.3% of the Ethiopian population compared to 64.2% of the general population.

172. The average wages among the Ethiopian population are lower compared to the rest of the population, mostly attributed to the high rate of non-professional workers — 27.2% compared to 6.52% of the general population.

173. For information about Government actions to increase the employment rate among the Ethiopian population (for both men and women) (including employment centers, allocation of vouchers for professional training, group professional training and more) please see Part II of Annex No. II to this report (p. 32).

### **Equal Employment Opportunities Commission (EEOC)**

174. Since its establishment in 2008, the EEOC within the MOEAI is leading the process of implementing equality within the labor market, as well as serving as a “normative marker” for adopting norms and values which constitute the foundation for an equal labor market. The role of the Commission is to promote awareness among employees and employers of the rights conferred by virtue of the equality legislation and to act to exercise and implement this legislation.

175. In January 2016, Adv. Miriam Kabaha, an Arab-Israeli, was appointed to serve as the Commissioner for Equal Employment Opportunities.

176. The EEOC has made the Arab population a priority in its work and is targeting cases dealing with discrimination, raising awareness and enforcing the law in specific cases.

177. During 2015, the EEOC established a Forum for Increasing Enforcement for the Arab Community. The Forum constructed a practical plan that includes increasing the level of awareness and applications concerning discrimination from the Arab population, thus enabling the Commission to take measures against discriminating employers.

178. The EEOC has created a wide range of training programs for managers and employers on the issues of equal opportunities, diversity, and inclusion in the labor market. Such programs place strong emphasis on the Arab population in Israel, its incorporation within the labor market, and creating true and substantial equal opportunities through managers and employers.

180. In 2015, the EEOC conducted a survey among employees of the Arab population. The survey reviews various issues that are relevant to the unique employment experiences of Arabs, including under-employment (non-correlation between education and occupation), labor rights, adjustments in the workplace, feelings and experiences of discrimination at work, etc. The survey is currently in the advanced stages of data collection and will be published in the near future.

181. The EEOC conducted a study of a number of selected firms for the creation of an informational booklet on occupational diversity. The booklet addresses the integration of the Arab and Ultra-Orthodox populations into the labor market, and its aim is to assist employers in implementing occupational diversity by learning from the experiences of companies that do so successfully.

181. Complaints filed to the EEOC — the EEOC provides professional and reliable legal advice to applicants. For information regarding inquiries handled by the Commission, including on inquires on ethnic origin grounds, please see Annex No. I to this report (p. 17).

### **Case Law**

182. For related case law, please see Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 15).

### **The Authority for Advancement of the Status of Women**

183. During 2013-2014, the Authority implemented economic empowerment and business entrepreneurship programs for Arab women, together with the Authority for Economic Development of the Arab, Druze and Circassian populations. These programs included the following topics: community, family and work; entrepreneurship and entrepreneurs characteristics; personal and professional empowerment; communication skills; constructing community projects; and establishing an independent business covering licensing, financial management, marketing, collaborations, etc.

184. In addition, during 2014, a women's empowerment and leadership course was held. It was designed uniquely for consultants on promoting the status of women in Arab localities and municipalities. The topics included: leadership patterns and styles, leading a change, decision-making, training for personal, organizational and public empowerment, emotional intelligence, and effectiveness. Following the shared studies, a women's forum was formed which continues with meetings and collaborations.

185. Arab women also partake in self-defense workshops that are held country-wide in designated groups in their localities and in mixed groups in mixed cities.

186. The publications distributed by the Authority on various topics are distributed in various languages, including Arabic and Amharic.

### **Designated Employment Programs and Projects for Promoting Girls and Women of Ethiopian Origin**

187. The MOE, MOAIA and MOEAI are leading several projects to promote women and girls of Ethiopian origin.

188. The Herzog Geriatric Hospital has developed a program for training young women of Ethiopian decent to be geriatric nurses. The program promotes the better integration of these nurses of Ethiopian decent into quality positions in the labor market. The course also enables continued higher education.

189. The National Council of Jewish Women (NCJW) Research Institute for Innovation in Education at the Hebrew University conducts the "Neta" project (Girls for Fostering Hebrew), intended to train high school girls of Ethiopian origin to participate in programs for promoting children of Ethiopian origin to develop cognitive, social and linguistic skills, which will better prepare these children for school.

190. Migrant Workers — Please see details regarding the Protection of Migrant Workers above in Article 5B.

## 2. The Right to Form and Join Trade Unions

191. Between the years 2012-2015, dozens of new unions were established as part of various organizations in Israel, some in new fields such as the communications and insurance industries. The main reasons for this increase were judicial decisions in which courts ruled that employees should not be prohibited from unionizing; competition between labor unions that created a proper environment for unionizing and increased awareness among employees of their rights.

192. Regarding measures taken following complaints concerning employers' disruptions of employee unionization:

- Three indictments were filed under the Collective Agreements Law 5717-1957 — one case was closed and the indictment was altered to a warning, a second case was closed with a plea bargain, and the third case is still pending.
- There have been no convictions during this period.

193. In addition, pursuant to Section 33.14.(a)(1) of the *Collective Agreements Law*, anyone who refrains from hiring a person, worsens an employment term or dismisses an employee due, among other things, to membership in a labor union or workers' committee shall be sentenced to a fine pursuant to Article 61(a)(2) of the *Penal Law 5737-1977*. Between 2012 and 2015, six cases were opened, however no indictments have so far been served.

### *Foreign Workers*

194. Following an amendment to the Histadrut's (General Federation of Laborers in Israel) Code, as of March 2010, foreign workers staying legally in Israel may join the Histadrut and exercise all relevant rights, including the right to vote or be elected. Some make use of these rights.

195. Subsequently, the Histadrut's Tel Aviv-Jaffa District initiated and established a department for foreign workers that serves as a center for assistance and professional protection.

## 3. The Right to Housing

### **The Housing Situation in Israel**

#### **The Arab Population**

#### *Representation in the National Council for Planning and Building*

196. The National Council for Planning and Building (hereinafter: the "Council") has 32 members—a third of which are representatives of Ministers (appointed by the Ministers), another third are representatives of municipal authorities (appointed by the Minister of Interior), and the final third are public representatives (partially appointed by the Minister of Interior).

197. The MOI ensures a balanced representation of all communities, regions and populations, including the Arab population, in the Council. As of January 2016, there were two Arab members of the Council and an additional four Arab replacements for council members.

#### **Outline Plans for Arab Towns and Villages**

198. Please see Article 2II above.

#### **Jerusalem — General**

199. Please see Article 2II above.

### **Housing in the Bedouin population**

200. There are more than 240,000 Bedouins living in the Negev desert area. About 76% of them live in urban and suburban centers which have been legally planned and constructed (25% live in the city of Rahat, an additional 40% live in six local authorities (Hura, Kuseife, Tel-Sheva, Ar'ara, Lakiya and Segev shalom) and an additional 11% reside in 11 authorized localities within the Al-Kasum and Neve Midbar Regional Councils. The remaining 24% of the Bedouin population reside in hundreds of unauthorized and unregulated clusters, mainly within the Al-Kasum and Neve Midbar Regional Councils which are spread over an area of almost 500,000 dunams. This obstructs urban expansion in the greater Negev area and is not beneficial to the common good of the Bedouin population.

### **Planning for the Bedouin Population**

201. In regards to planning for the Bedouin population — there are 18 Bedouin localities with approved outline plans, including the city of Rahat, Lakiya, Hura, Kuseife, Tel-Sheva, Segev Shalom and Ar'ara. All of these plans include infrastructure such as schools, health clinics, running water, electricity, roads, pavements, etc.

202. An additional 11 localities that are under the jurisdiction of the Neve Midbar and A-Kasum Regional Councils also have approved outline plans.

203. These two regional councils are the result of the division of the former Abu Basma regional council in November 2012, following a decision of the Minister of Interior based on the recommendations of an Inquiry Committee for the Examination of the Proper Organization of the Municipal Jurisdiction Boundaries and Local Planning Areas in the Bedouin Population in the Be'er-Sheva Region (the Razin Committee). The two regional councils encompass 11 Bedouin localities: the regional council of Al-Kasum includes the localities of Tarabin, Um Batin, El Seid, Darijat, Kahla, Makhol (Merit) and Moleda; and the regional council of Neve Midbar includes the localities of Abu Krinat, Bir Hadaj, Abu Tlul, and Kasar A-Sir.

204. The purpose of this division was to improve the services provided to the authorized Bedouin localities that were located in the former Abu-Basma regional council, and indeed, despite the short time that has passed since the reorganization, positive changes in the standard of services provided to residents in both regional councils are evident.

205. In addition, the planning procedures for six additional localities are ongoing.

206. The strategic work of examining and setting rules for the planning of construction solutions for the Bedouin population in the Negev has been undertaken and completed. The work included the collection and presentation of demographic information and planning data. Recommendations have been formulated to expand existing localities and establish new ones, whilst regularizing some Bedouin localities at their current location. The report of stage one of this strategic work, which includes these recommendations, was submitted to the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development in November 2015.

207. In regards to the planning relating to the rest of the clusters in the Bedouin diaspora, ten leading planning companies were recruited to conduct feasibility studies and to examine special planning solutions. This process is being conducted with the participation of the population in each region. Currently, these companies are conducting field surveys and formulating the resulting data into planning recommendations that will be examined by the Authority for the Regularization of the Bedouin Housing Situation in the Negev, currently handling the bulk of issues in this area. This course of planning, with the special emphasis placed on the participation of the Bedouin population, is unprecedented in Israel.

208. Additional development plans are underway in several other Bedouin towns. Rahat, for example, will be approximately tripled in size (from 8,797 dunams today to 22,767 dunams). The project is estimated to cost approximately 500 Million NIS (135.13 Million USD). Other localities are also in the process of expansion with the development of infrastructures and construction of industrial and employment areas.

209. The Government is encouraging movement to regulated localities (regardless of the localities' nature as city, town, village, etc.) by providing unique financial benefits. These

benefits include, *inter alia*, provision of land plots for free or at very low cost, and compensation for the demolition of unauthorized structures.

#### **Case Law**

210. Please see Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 16).

### **4. The Right to Public Health, Medical Care, Social Security and Social Services**

#### **The Right to Health**

211. The right to health is guaranteed to all individuals without discrimination or distinction. Nationwide health promotion programs have gained momentum during the last few years, especially those encouraging physical activity.

212. The Ministry of Health (MOH) regularly conducts surveys for the purpose of identifying regions and populations in which health conditions need to be improved, whether due to the level of health services or as a result of socio-economic, cultural, or educational differences. Based on the results of these surveys, the Ministry prepares treatment programs for special population groups, including the Bedouin, Arab, and Ultra-Orthodox populations. In addition, special attention is paid to peripheral regions which require designated intervention to improve the health conditions.

#### **Legislation**

213. On July 7, 2014, the Government amended the *Patient's Rights Law 5756-1996* to include prohibition of discrimination in providing medical treatment for reasons of age (unless required for medical reasons).

214. Also in 2014, the Government enacted, *inter alia*, the *Supervision on the Quality of Food and Proper Nutrition in Education Institutions Law 5774-2014* which obligates the State to supervise the nutritional values of all foods served and sold in educational institutions. Of the 500 schools that participate in the MOE's healthy schools program, 30% are schools that serve the Arab population. In addition, of the 250 kindergartens that participate in this program, 62 (25%) are located in Arab localities.

215. According to Section 21 of the *National Health Insurance Law 5754-1994* (the "*National Health Insurance Law*"), a health fund is obligated to provide any person it is responsible for with all the services he/she is entitled to receive under this Law without discrimination and without conditioning the provision of services on joining or membership in additional service programs. The Law also determines that non-payment or late payment of the health insurance payments shall not exempt a health fund of its duty to provide the health services included in the health basket.

#### **Administrative Measures**

216. In May 2016, the Minister of Health participated in the final event of the "Get It Online" initiative, aimed at promoting digital access to information on health using an interactive online game in Arabic. This initiative, which is the result of cooperation between the Ministry, Microsoft Israel, the "Clalit" Health fund and the 'Appleseed' Academy association, was launched in 2013, and currently involves 10,000 participants from 50 municipalities. This initiative is operated in schools and in 130 healthcare stations in the Southern and Northern parts of Israel, and it refers to four main health fields: nutrition, sport, dental health and routine examinations. This project is to be operated nationally in the future.

#### **National Health Policy**

217. Following the recommendation of a 2008 professional committee to examine the gaps in health services, several publications and plans have been compiled in order to deal with these gaps. The last was introduced in 2010 and, *inter alia*, refers to the accessibility of the health system (including hospitals, health-funds, etc.) to the entire population. This plan has set the reduction of gaps and inequalities, including in aspects of cultural and



linguistic accessibility in health services as one of its major goals. This action plan includes, *inter alia*, cultural and linguistic accessibility improvements within the health system; setting standards for such adaptation; and the reduction of gaps between various population groups while strengthening vulnerable populations.

218. For information on Government Resolutions on this issue please see Part III of Annex No. II to this report (p. 42).

219. The main principles set by this program include: the creation of supportive social and physical environments such as with the construction and expansion of walking and bicycle riding lanes; increasing public knowledge and awareness regarding the importance of regular physical activity such as by organizing mass sport events; and improving and enhancing communal infrastructures aimed at the promotion of health lifestyle such as by offering subsidized sport classes for all ages and throughout Israel.

### **Vulnerable Groups**

#### *Healthcare for Women in the Arab Population*

220. The Ministry, in coordination with its various health funds, operates dozens of programs promoting the health of Israel's Arab population. Several of these have received positive notice in professional medical publications in Israel and abroad.

221. Further examples of steps taken by the MOH in recent years to reduce inequalities in healthcare include:

- Improving infrastructures in peripheral areas, including an additional 1,000 hospital beds and manpower to peripheral hospitals.
- Establishment of a medical school in the Northern Galilee and new emergency rooms in peripheral localities, both in the north and the south of Israel.
- Allocation of additional medical equipment to peripheral areas, including new MRIs, linear accelerators, and PET scan devices.
- Developing financial incentives, including grants and state-sponsored salary raises for specialized doctors to move to peripheral areas.
- Reduction of the maximum co-payments of chronic elderly patients who receive income supplements.
- Discounts on co-payments for the purchase of generic medications.

#### *Gaps between the Jewish and Arab Population*

222. The MOH operates a designated unit for the reduction of inequalities in the health system. This unit promotes policies, standards, supervision, training and awareness-raising activities on this important issue, including by hosting conferences for professionals, the publication of an annual report that monitors such gaps, and the activities needed for its eradication. As part of its activities, the Ministry established in 2013 a translation call center manned by representatives who were trained to operate as medical translators. This call center provides translation services 24 hours a day for medical treatment provided by physicians to their patients, in Russian, Arabic, Amharic and French. On average, 1,500 calls are handled by this call center per month.

223. The MOH also provides financial support for health-fund activities aimed at reducing gaps. Between 2012 and 2014, a total of 55 Million NIS (14.5 Million USD) were allocated by health funds for such steps, with the emphasis on peripheral areas and reducing gaps among minority populations. The criteria for such support in 2015-2016 were amended in order to put special emphasis on steps conducted in Arabic in regards to prevention of diabetes and obesity.

224. For information on life expectancy, diabetes and cancer-please see Annex No. I to this report (p.18).

### *Infant Mortality Rate in Israel*

225. Israel's infant mortality rate continues to decrease from 6.3 between 1996 and 1999, to 3.1 deaths for every 1,000 live births in 2015. For statistical information on infant mortality rate please see Annex No. I to this report (p. 18).

226. For further information regarding additional measures taken by the Government, including a special long-term intervention program intended to decrease infant mortality among the Bedouins and genetic testing, please see Israel's 14-16th Periodic Report.

### **Designated Health Services and Infrastructures for the Bedouin Population**

227. In the framework of Government Resolution No. 3708 (of September 11, 2011) which specifies a plan for the economic development of the Bedouin population in the Negev, 90 Million NIS (24.3 Million USD) was allocated for the issues of society and community which includes the health field.

228. For information on some of the main projects, including health clinics and medical services, data on immunization coverage, nurses serving the Bedouin population, mother and child healthcare stations, school nurses, recent developments and eradication of the Brucellosis disease in the Negev, please see Part II of Annex No. II to this report (p. 32).

### **Ethiopian Population**

229. The MOH is operating, together with the National Health Fund, a program titled "wholesome medicine," in which medical mediators of Ethiopian origin are stationed in relevant medical clinics, with the aim of improving the communication between the medical professionals and the patients, and to assist in implementing various educational programs in the health field among this population.

230. In addition, the Ministry prepared a list of substantial steps to better integrate persons of Ethiopian origin that focuses on five areas: cultural accessibility of the health system, adequate representation, accessibility of medical rights, reduction of diabetes, and an increase in trust in the health system-including reducing the duration for addressing racism and discrimination-related complaints to less than 48 hours.

231. The Ministry also promotes the qualification of nurses of the Ethiopian population that will assist in advancing these plans and programs.

232. In addition, please see additional information regarding a translation call center established in 2013, in this Article above.

### **Foreign Migrants and Workers**

233. As mentioned in Israel's previous Reports, the *Foreign Workers Law* requires employers to arrange broad medical insurance for employees who are foreign workers. Employers who violate this obligation may face criminal prosecution. Children of migrant workers unlawfully residing in Israel are also entitled to receive medical insurance provided by a designated Israeli Health Fund according to a subsidized fee, as detailed below.

234. Also, according to Section 3(b) of the Patient's Rights Law, minors and adults are entitled to urgent medical care in emergency situations, regardless of their status in Israel.

235. The MOH operates several services dedicated to providing health services to migrants, persons who entered Israel illegally, and foreign workers — For information on some of the main services, including health clinics, treatment for persons with tuberculosis, hospitalization, health insurance to migrants' children until the age of 18 and unaccompanied minors, intervention program for African families lacking legal status and health services available for persons staying in the "Holot" facility, please see Part II of Annex No. II to this report (p. 34).

### **The Right to Social Security and Social Services**

236. As mentioned above, the Ministry of Social Affairs and Social Services is taking part in the program of fighting discrimination against Israeli citizens of the Ethiopian

population. As part of this effort, it has set up a round table with social workers from all ranks and districts and representatives of the Ethiopian population.

237. In addition, this Ministry operates for the treatment of welfare and social issues of all Israeli children and youth, including those of the Ethiopian population. Amongst other activities, the Ministry operates a program for identification and assistance to children and youth in risk situations, including: physical and developmental risks, health and welfare risks, social affiliation risks, dangerous behavior etc. Last year, 115,315 Jewish children at risk were identified, 8% of those children (3,908 children) were of Ethiopian origin. Among the children who were identified, 17,900 were integrated in the program, 10.1% of them (1,818 children) are of the Ethiopian population.

238. For additional information, please see Israel's 14-16th Periodic Report.

## 5. The Right to Education and Training

### *Legislation*

239. One of the enumerated purposes of the education system in Israel is to ensure equal opportunities for all children, as noted in Section 2(8) of the National Education Law 5713-1953 ("The National Education Law"). Similarly, Section 5(A)(1) of the Pupil's Rights Law disallows any form of discrimination concerning the registration of pupils by governmental and local authorities or any educational institution.

240. Due to budgetary constraints, the gradual implementation of the Long School Day and Enrichment Studies Law 5757-1997 detailed in Israel's Initial Report, is scheduled to be completed in the 2017-18 school year (Economic Efficiency Law-Legislation Amendments for Achieving Budgetary Goals for 2015 and 2016 budget years 5776-2015).

241. Additionally, in 2014 the Government enacted, inter alia, the Supervision of the Quality of Food and Proper Nutrition in *Education Institutions Law* (5774-2014) which obligates the State to supervise the nutritional values of all foods served and sold in educational institutions, as mentioned above on page 66.

### *Pupils' Rights*

242. On March 24, 2014, Amendment No. 4 to the Pupil Rights Law 5761-2000 was approved by the Knesset. This amendment added sexual orientation and gender identity to the list of grounds upon which discrimination of pupils is prohibited.

243. On July 11, 2011, Amendment No. 3 to the Pupil Rights Law 5761-2000 was approved by the Knesset. This amendment added national origin to the list of grounds upon which discrimination of pupils is prohibited.

### *Statistical Data*

244. For statistical data and additional information concerning the Right to Education, including: pupils in schools by level of education, distribution of pupils by classrooms and populations (Table No. 8), literacy rates and the extent of formal education possessed by the adult population during the years 2006-2014, by population group, gender and age (Table No. 9), please see Annex No. I to this report (p. 19).

### *Dropout Rates and Prevention of Dropping Out of School*

245. One important indicator of school performance is the rate of attendance. The MOE operates a special department of attendance officers who regularly visit schools in order to maintain school attendance and prevent pupils from dropping out. This department works in accordance with the *Compulsory Education Law* (Section 4). As of April 2016, there are 623.7 standard positions of attendance officers and in practice there are 679 attendance officers (an increase of 36% compared to 2010), of which 435 operate in Jewish localities, 75 operate in the Ultra-Orthodox population, 138 in Arab localities, and 25 in Bedouin localities. In addition, there are six attendance officers who are designated to the Ethiopian population, although many other attendance officers who handle reduction of dropout rates in the general population also handle this population.

246. For additional information of the total dropout rate in the Jewish and Arab populations, please see Annex No. I to this report (p. 22).

247. Note **that the total reduction of the dropout rate between 2010 and 2013 is 42.8%**. Action taken in recent years has significantly reduced, in almost every grade, the dropout rate among all the populations in Israel.

#### *Eligibility for Matriculation Certificate*

248. For details regarding eligibility for matriculation certificates and on pupils in 12th grade, matriculation examinees and entitled to a certificate — 2014, please see page 22 and Table No. 10 thereafter in Annex No. I to this report.

#### *Programs That Help Pupils Matriculate Fully*

249. The MOE implements many programs to strengthen weaker pupils and improve their chances of completing all matriculation examinations. To increase the proportion of pupils eligible to receive a matriculation certificate, the MOE acts in four ways: it encourages pupils to take matriculation examinations; provides intensive assistance to pupils who need it; creates post-secondary continuing education frameworks; and finances studies for pupils who lack only one or two examinations. The Ministry has earmarked resources for allocations to schools that wish to adopt discretionary initiatives in this regard.

#### *The Psychological Counseling Service Department (“Shefi”)*

250. The “Shefi” is a department within the MOE responsible for providing counseling, psychological services, and educational guidance to pupils, parents and educators. Among the main purposes of these services are the promotion of pupils’ mental wellbeing, as well as attaining solutions for and information on the location, prevention, and treatment of children at risk, etc.

251. “Shefi” currently has 2,800 educational psychologists who work in kindergartens and schools in every local authority in Israel with children from three years old to pupils in the 12th grade. 1,598 psychologists work within the Jewish population, 246 work within the Arab population, 17 work within the Druze population and 84 work within the Bedouin population — with coverage rates of 70%, 62%, 91% and 78% respectively.

252. “Shefi” employs 4,912 education counselors who work in higher education institutions. 941 (19.2%) of these counselors work within the Arab population.

#### *Special Education*

253. Special education services are provided by the MOE nationwide and equally to all populations, for children with special needs between the ages of 3 to 21 who are entitled to such services by law

254. For additional information on this matter, including on the number of pupils and classroom for pupils with disabilities, according to type of disability and population group (2014-2015), please see Annex No. I to this report (p. 23) and Table No. 11 thereafter.

#### *Special Education Frameworks Serving the Bedouin Population*

255. In accordance with Government Resolution No. 3148 of April 2011, the establishment of the three-part rehabilitation complex for Bedouin children with special needs in Tel-Sheva still continues. For additional information please see Part III of Annex No. II to this report (p. 42).

#### *Resources in Education — National Expenditure on Education*

256. The policy of the MOE is to provide an equal budget to all schools, in accordance with clear and transparent criteria, while providing additional budgets to certain populations, both for educational and socio-economic reasons.

257. Thus, for example, the budget invested in the education of a pupil in the Jewish education is 14,715 NIS (3,870 USD) and in the Arab education is 15,375 NIS (4,046

USD). In the higher secondary education, the investment in a Jewish pupils stands at 24,344 NIS (6,406 USD) and in the Arab pupils 18,667 NIS (4,912 USD).

258. The Ministry is aware of the disparities in the budget per pupil according to type of school; however these gaps do not reflect financial preference of one population over the other, but rather originate from the complexity of the salary model of teachers' wages. For example, if there are two identical schools but one is equipped with a young teaching staff and the other has a more senior teaching staff, the schools will receive different budgets due to the seniority differences and the relevant collective agreements. For information regarding the average level of teachers' seniority by years and population, please see Table No. 12 in Annex No. I to this report.

259. In recent years, the Ministry allocated a major part of its additional resources deferentially, giving preference to peripheral areas, weaker populations, and accordingly to the Arab population.

260. The Ministry launched a five-year plan for gap reduction and for the promotion of equality in primary and intermediate education, which is intended to substantially increase the budget of Arab schools. This program includes additional teaching hours for the Arab population with a budget of 1 Billion NIS (260 Million USD) over five years, and additional substantial resources for enrichment activities (100 Million NIS in 2016 and 188 Million in 2018-26 and 49.5 Million USD respectively).

261. The Ministry is also constantly examining ways to reduce gaps in higher education, such as by making adjustments in the budgeting mechanism, implementing a national program for the promotion of technological-professional education that will provide preference to the Arab population, and other ways. In 2014-15, the Ministry added an entire teaching unit to the Arab population (including Druze and Bedouin population) with a total budget of 38 Million NIS (10 Million USD).

262. Additional financial assistance — the Coordination and Supervision Administration in the MOE oversees a scholarship assistance plan to assist pupils from weak families from all populations, including the Arab, Bedouin, Druze and Circassian populations. These scholarships are intended to assist in funding general parents' payments, learning aids and equipment and assistance in payments for field trips and socio-educational activities. In 2015, an estimated 44% of the scholarship budget was allocated to pupils of the Arab, Bedouin, Druze and Circassian populations.

#### *Construction of New Schools*

263. In recent years, there has been a steady increase in the number of schools in both the Hebrew education system and in the Arab education system. The total number of schools in the Jewish population rose by 9.3% (from 3,480 in 2010 to 3,807 in 2015). During these years, the total number of schools in the Arab population rose by 15.1% (from 878 to 1,011 schools).

#### *Construction of Schools and New Classrooms in the Eastern Neighborhoods of Jerusalem*

264. A number of new schools have been constructed in the eastern neighborhoods of Jerusalem in recent years. These schools contain approximately 800 classrooms, and an additional 1,000 classes are currently in various planning and construction stages. New sport halls were also established in Beit Safafa, Al-Issawiya, and other neighborhoods.

265. Investments in physical infrastructure — the Jerusalem Municipality is also promoting a technological revolution with the distribution of 1,720 desktop and laptop computers to schools, kindergartens, and teachers in eastern neighborhoods of Jerusalem, and an additional 350 computers for pupils' homes. In addition, 7 state-of-the-art "smart-boards" were introduced by the municipality to six schools in these neighborhoods.

266. This past year, the Municipality began implementing an initiative to lengthen the school days in secondary schools in eastern neighborhoods of Jerusalem with extended programming that continues until 17:30 daily. Pupils enjoy an organized educational framework with a variety of interesting classes and enrichment courses. This project is

extremely successful-in the year and a half since it began, the number of pupils participating in this initiative has doubled.

267. Since 2012-13, the Municipality has invested 1,000,000 NIS (263,150 USD) per year in a new program for pupils from the eastern neighborhoods of Jerusalem in the fields of science. This initiative aims to increase the percentage of pupils who choose to major in the sciences for their school matriculation exams (the Tawjiha examination). It seeks to open doors in both academia and future career opportunities, thereby enabling Arab pupils to integrate into the workforce in the future.

### **Government Resolutions**

268. In recent years, the Government has approved several multi-year resolutions in favor of the Arab population including the Bedouin, Druze and Circassian populations with a total budget of 3.7 Billion NIS (One Billion USD). For several examples of these Resolutions please see Part III of Annex No. II to this report (p. 43).

### **New Educational Programs**

269. In recent years, the Education Administration in the MOE launched four education programs aimed at promoting pupils with high scholastic achievements: "Atidim", "Psagot", "Mentoring" and "Alpha" programs. For additional information on these programs and regarding pupils' participation, please see Annex No. I to this report (p. 26) and Table No. 14 thereafter.

### **Science and Technology Education**

270. The **Science and Community** Branch in the Ministry of Science, Technology and Space (MOSTAS) is dedicated to promoting science and technology to the general public, and one of its main goals is to encourage pupils to study these fields. Each year the Branch holds a series of extra-curricula activities aimed at making science more accessible to youth.

271. For **science-related** activities held by the Branch in 2015, including information about the number of participants and budgets, please see Table No. 15 in Annex No. I to this report.

272. Additional educational activity with the goal of encouraging pupils to study space-related fields is conducted by the Israel Space Agency. For example, in 2015, the Space Agency, conducted an online academy (virtual classroom lectures) with the participation of 700 classrooms, 400 of them (57%) from the Arab population and a "Hoopoe Project" in which a nano satellite was built with groups of pupils from 5 schools, 1 of which is of the Arab population.

273. During the February 2016 Israeli Space Week, 80 schools, 25 of which are of the Arab population, participated in dedicated science activities in the Eretz Israel Museum in Tel Aviv-Jaffa.

274. Also, among the eight science-related activities that were conducted in community centers around Israel, one was conducted in an Arab population community center. In addition, as part of the Ramon Education and Space Convention, 15 schools presented various science projects and three of these schools were of the Arab population.

275. The Ministry offers annual scholarships for students studying for second and third degrees in a number of fields, in order to promote the Ministry's objectives and allow young people to be positively exposed to these fields. In 2015, the Ministry provided about 150 scholarships, of which more than 33% were awarded to women. Moreover, the Ministry funds student activities as part of a tutorial project in the field of science. In 2015, 241 female students and 261 male students received scholarships for participating in this project.

276. The MOSTAS provides additional support to regional research and development centers, with the aim of establishing scientific research in areas in which the rate of such activities is low. This additional support, in the total sum of 13 Million NIS (3.4 Million

USD), is currently provided to seven regional research and development centers, two of which operate in Arab localities.

### **Education — The Bedouin Population**

277. The Bedouins living in existing towns enjoy the same rights and opportunities as other Israeli citizens, including the right to receive formal education at all levels, in accordance with the Israeli law. Indeed, their education has improved considerably over the past several years, as indicated by the information provided below.

278. According to the MOE, in 2015 an estimated 91,000 Bedouin pupils attended various frameworks in the education system. For information on the number of educational institutions and pupils by level of teaching and district (2014), please see Table No. 16 in Annex No. I to this report.

279. In the last five years, over 30 new schools were established for the Bedouin population in Israel, in addition to new kindergartens. Most of these schools are equipped with science and technology laboratories, computer classes, and other advanced educational tools.

280. As part of Government Resolution No. 3708, several five-year plans (2012-2016) were approved to improve the scholastic achievements amongst pupils in the Bedouin population, entailing a total budget of 124 Million NIS (33.5 Million USD). The following are the main programs that were approved: increasing the number of literacy classes from kindergarten to high school, increasing the attendance of pupils and reducing dropout rates, operating a project titled “Education towards Career”, recognizing and diagnosing learning impediments, expanding technological education and other education for detached youth and adults, expanding the activity of youth organizations and summer camps within the Bedouin localities, promoting the construction of classrooms and educational facilities, operating centers and programs intended to promote and encourage excellence, expanding the operation of the Excellence Promotion Program among high school pupils, operating a program to prepare 12th grade pupils for integration into academia and the labor market, empowering and developing personal leadership abilities, upgrading the scientific-technological education in the Bedouin population, and more.

281. In addition, please refer to the above-mentioned information (in this Article) on the establishment of the three-part rehabilitation complex for Bedouin children with special needs in Tel-Sheva.

282. The MOE’s Science and Technology Training Institute operates a special course that includes a full scholarship, a monthly income scholarship, and paid transportation fees for Bedouin pupils who meet the relevant requirements. In 2014, 48 pupils, including 13 female pupils, began their studies and an additional 100 pupils were integrated into this learning course in 2015.

283. On September 23, 2014, the Government approved Resolution No. 2025 in which it resolved, *inter alia*, to conduct a pilot program of daycare centers in three industrial areas in the Negev area and to expand the number of subsidized nurseries and afternoon frameworks. In this Resolution, the Government also decided to improve the schools’ technological learning environment and approved a grant for the technological colleges in southern localities.

### **Education in the Ethiopian Population**

284. On October 23, 2015, the Government approved Resolution No. 666 in which it decided to strengthen the informal education of children of Ethiopian origin. According to the Resolution, a budget of six Million NIS (1.6 Million USD) will be allocated for extra-curricular activities for children of the Ethiopian population for the years 2017-2019. This Resolution entered into force on November 8, 2015.

285. Financial assistance — The MOE allocates financial assistance to children of Ethiopian origin in the sum of 400 or 800 NIS (105 or 210 USD) based on their date of immigration. In 2015, a total of 10,322 pupils of Ethiopian decent received this assistance.

**Foreign Workers' Children**

286. According to data of the MOE, 100% of children of foreign employees and migrants in Israel between the ages of 3 and 18 are integrated into kindergartens and schools.

**Higher Education**

287. Please see Annex No. I to this report (p. 28).

**Universities Psychometric Entry Test**

288. The Psychometric Entrance Test (PET) is a standardized national exam in Israel, generally taken as a higher education admissions exam. The PET covers three areas: mathematics, verbal reasoning, and English. It is administered by the Israeli National Institute for Testing and Evaluation (NITE).

289. The PET may be taken in Hebrew, Arabic, Russian, French, Spanish, or combined Hebrew/English. There are generally five dates during the year, and Arabic is available on four of these dates.

290. The MOE invests extensive efforts in improving the access of Arab pupils to higher education. Thus, during 2010, the Ministry specially trained 150 educational advisors and other professionals and placed them in PET learning centers established for 500 pupils of the Arab community.

291. The MOSTAS provides further assistance and allocates special scholarships to Arab pupils so they can take a preparatory course for the PET.

292. In the process of creating the exam, the National Institute takes into account the differences between population groups and conducts fairness testing to evaluate the exam's sensitivity towards gender, religion, populations, and political correctness.

293. The Arabic version of the test is drafted by a professional academic team comprised of native Arabic speakers. This team is responsible for supervising the wording in Arabic, in order to prevent differences between the Hebrew and Arabic versions and eliminate unequal reference points for the different examinees.

294. Additional measures — In January 2010, the Planning and Budgeting Committee (PBC) of the CHE launched a multi-year plan for the years 2011-2016, with the goal of making higher education more accessible to minority populations, including the Ultra-orthodox population. The PBC and the Ministry of Finance has allocated a budget of about 500 Million NIS (135.1 Million USD) for this purpose.

295. In March 2013, a professional team headed by the PBC's Deputy Director for Planning and Policy published a report titled "Pluralism and Equal Opportunities in Higher Education — Expansion of the Accessibility of Academic Studies to Arabs, Druze and Circassians in Israel". In its report, the team provides details on existing tools for increasing their participation in higher education institutions. Hereinafter are the team's main recommendations:

*Preparatory Information, Guidance and Counseling*

- Establishment of centers for the Arab population that disseminate professional and educational guidance, provide employment counseling, etc. These centers have been established in 18 Arab localities and 17 more are underway.
- Since 2014, the PBC operates a program in over 100 high schools intended to provide pupils with tools on how to choose the most suitable academic field for them. Education supervisors — cooperate with high schools in order to provide pupils with information on academic institutions, courses, etc. The supervisors assist the pupils with their admissions applications.
- Teaching staff in high schools to actively inform pupils about requirements for acceptance into academic institutions.



### *Preparatory Training and Courses*

- Since 2013, every preparatory college funded by the PBC in which minority students study receives additional funds for Hebrew lessons, dormitories/transportation, preparatory course for the PET, and a counselor.
- In addition, the PBC participates in a campaign i marketing and branding these colleges aimed at the Arab population. Since 2014, the PBC also grants excellence scholarships to 20% of the preparatory colleges' graduates who belong to minority populations.

### *Academic Preparation Programs towards the First Degree*

- A special crash course has been implemented for students of minority populations who are accepted to higher education institutions. Students are provided with important skills and information, including languages (both Hebrew and English), learning skills, academic orientation, time management, computer literacy, library instruction, information on exam anxiety, social activities, etc.

### *Absorption Programs*

- The PBC allocates a budget of approximately 90 Million NIS (23.7 Million USD) for programs aimed at easing the absorption of Arab students in the beginning of their first academic year. These include social guidance, tutoring, academic workshops, mental support, professional academic guidance, etc.

### *Absorption of Arab Graduates in the Academic Staff*

- The team recommended encouraging students who excel in their studies to pursue advanced degrees and to integrate qualified candidates as academic staff members.
- Scholarships and funds — the PBC, together with the Prime Minister's Office and NGOs, are working for the establishment of a scholarship and loan funds. Preference will be given for excellence, extra-curricular activities, etc.

296. In addition to the above, the PBC, via a permanent steering committee, holds additional support programs for the Arab population or general programs which also include Arab students:

- In 2014, the PBC began operating a special scholarship fund designated for the Arab population, which provides support to students according to their socio-economic situation, field of study, etc. Each year 650 students receive such scholarships, of which more than 50% are women.
- "Ma'of" Scholarships — intended for excellent scientists of the Arab population that higher education institutions wish to recruit as academic staff. Each year, seven such scholarships are granted with an annual budget of 3 Million NIS (810,000 USD) per year.
- Tutoring scholarships ("Perah" scholarships) — intended for first degree students who volunteer to tutor high school children in return for 50% of their annual tuition. The rate of Arab students who participate in this project is 27% and the rate of schools designated for the Arab population who benefit from this program is 21%. The project's annual budget is about 130 Million NIS (33 Million USD).
- Students' Assistance Fund — the PBC and the MOE utilize a special fund for providing assistance to students in need. The fund's total budget in 2016-2017 was approximately 80 Million NIS (20 Million USD). In 2012, 22% of the applications were filed by Arab students and 21% of the fund recipients were Arab students. In addition, 40% of those who applied for a loan from this fund were Arab students, of which 80% of them decided to take this loan.

297. Multi-annual program for the promotion of the Ethiopian population — On June 14, 2016, the CHE announced that it will invest 100 Million NIS (26.3 Million USD) to increasing the participation in higher education of students from the Ethiopian population.

A professional working group established by the Council examined difficulties and barriers faced by students of Ethiopian origin and formulated a comprehensive program to deal with these obstacles and establish goals for the next five years. The budget allocated for the program will help fund efforts to make university or college candidates of Ethiopian decent more aware of their rights and options, fund additional classes, or personal tutors for those requiring such assistance, fund preparation courses for entering the labor market, and provide stipends and scholarships to all students of Ethiopian decent, etc. The program will first target students in the country's social and geographic periphery.

#### **6. The Right to Equal Participation in Cultural Activities**

298. The Unit for Israeli Communities' Heritage in the MOE holds an annual essay and research competition on issues relating to the heritage of all of Israel's communities. In regards to the Ethiopian population, in 2015 the Unit held a special class in which pupils were taught about the Ethiopian heritage, including the 1994 "Operation Moses" when 6,400 persons were flown into Israel from Ethiopia, discussed religious poems, and more.

299. For additional information, please see Israel's 14-16th Periodic Report.

#### **Arab Heritage and Culture**

300. On March 20, 2016, the Minister of Culture and Sport announced that the budget for cultural activities for the Arab population will be doubled to 20 Million NIS (5.26 Million USD) for 2016. The Minister also presented the Ministry's five-year plan for the promotion of the Arab population and added that the Arab population will receive an additional budget for cultural initiatives and events. The Minister also noted her directive that cancels a two-year waiting period for new cultural institutions who wish to receive financial support from the Ministry, including Arab cultural institutions.

#### **Druze and Circassian Heritage and Culture**

301. No change.

#### **The Role of Mass Media and Communication in Promoting Participation in Cultural Life**

302. No change.

#### **Initiating and Granting Licenses for Designated Channel Broadcasting**

303. No change.

#### **The Development and Production of Original Israeli Content and Approvals for Broadcasting by Foreign Television Channels**

304. No change.

#### **Israel Broadcasting Authority (IBA), the Second Authority for Television and Radio and Community TV Broadcasting**

305. No change.

#### **The Status of the Arabic Language**

306. On May 24, 2016, the Knesset marked its first-ever Arabic Language Day in which Arab and several Jewish lawmakers spoke in the plenum in Arabic with simultaneous translation into Hebrew, and committee meetings were dedicated to the use of Arabic in the public sphere. Seven Governmental committees focused their efforts that day specifically on advancing Arabic language and culture in Israeli society. Among the topics discussed in these committees was public transportation in the Arab localities, the teaching of Arabic in schools, providing court services in Arabic, the provision of online government services in Arabic, and the provision of health services in Arabic. The special day was the initiative of Joint List MK Youssef Jabareen.

307. In 2013, the CHE decided to evaluate study programs in Arabic during the academic year of 2014, and appointed an examination committee headed by Prof. David Wasserstein of Vanderbilt University in Nashville, Tennessee (U.S.A.) and composed of additional international experts. In 2014, this committee examined Arabic language education at four Israeli universities (including study programs, human resources and staff, students, research, scholarships etc.). In 2015, the Council for Higher Education adopted and approved the findings of this committee. In its report, the committee expresses satisfaction with the level of Arabic teaching and commended the Hebrew University in this matter.

308. In addition, in 2015, the MOE allocated 2,156 weekly hours in order to encourage the learning of the Arabic language, including lessons on the Arab world, Arab culture, and Islam.

#### **Combating Hostility at Sport Events**

309. Please refer to Article 7 below for further details.

### **7. The Right of Access to Places of Service**

#### **Public Transportation**

310. Regarding public transportation services in Bedouin localities, please see Article 5D above.

311. Eastern neighborhoods of Jerusalem-Light rail — The light rail in Jerusalem includes 23 stations: five stations mostly serve the Arab population due to their proximity to Arab neighborhoods, six stations are in the center of the city and serve both Arab and Jewish residents, and 12 stations are situated near mostly-Jewish neighborhoods. As the six stations in the center of the city serve everyone, the five stops near Arab neighborhoods should be compared to the twelve stops near Jewish neighborhoods, which is more or less equal to the rates of the Arab and Jewish populations in Jerusalem.

312. There is a practical difficulty in extending the light rail to other eastern neighborhoods of Jerusalem as the slope in these areas is steeper and not appropriate for the light rail. However, as a part of the long-term municipality general transportation plan, there are plans to overcome those topographical problems by building a tunnel and adding more services to all the eastern neighborhoods of Jerusalem.

### **Article 6**

313. As mentioned in Israel's Previous Reports, the main guardian of the individual "against any acts of racial discrimination which violate his/her human rights and fundamental freedoms" is the Israeli Court System. The Court System is open to all without discrimination, including to non-citizens of Israel. An individual can sue both other individuals and the Government for any wrong or harm done to him/her, or to his/her property, and can claim compensation or an injunction. In addition to the regular court procedure, the Supreme Court, residing as the Highest Court of Justice, can and does issue writs against the Government and public bodies.

314. For additional information on mechanisms for the protection of human rights, please see Israel's Core Document of 2008 (HRI/CORE/ISR/2008) and as amended in 2014 (HRI/CORE/ISR/2015) (Section IV(A)(vi) to (xiii)).

315. Additional mechanisms include:

- (i) The Warden's Investigation Unit (WIU), which is in charge of examination of inmates' complaints against Israeli Prisons Service wardens;
- (ii) The Inspector for Complaints against the ISA Interrogators — please see Israel's Core Document of 2008 (HRI/CORE/ISR/2008) and as amended in 2014 (HRI/CORE/ISR/2015) (Article 1(II)(F)).

316. In regards to Legal Aid, please see Article 5A above.

**Case Law**

317. Please see Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 17).

**Article 7****Measures Taken to Combat Prejudices and to Promote Understanding and Tolerance****A. Education and Teaching***Education against Hate Propaganda and Human Rights Education*

318. Human Rights Education and Education against Hate Propaganda. In recent years, the MOE has created several educational programs on the topics of democracy, tolerance, coexistence, and human rights, which are intended to provide knowledge and tools in these fields and combat all forms of discrimination. These concepts are part of special educational programs designed for school pupils of all ages and aimed at exposing them to different groups within Israeli society. In addition, the pupils learn about these principles of democracy, the rule of law, human rights, rights of minorities and pluralism in the framework of civic lessons.

319. Educational programs concerning human rights issues are routinely conducted throughout the country. Israel has developed special programs such as an annual “Human Rights Day”. Each year, this program is dedicated to a different aspect of human rights, and a relevant curriculum is developed in both Arabic and Hebrew. In 2015-2016, for example, this day addressed the right of Freedom of Speech as part of the U.N. Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948). In 2014-2015, this day addressed the right of Human Dignity. In 2013-2014, this day addressed the issue of “social responsibility towards the ‘other’ in society” which focused on tolerance, coexistence, equality, accepting others, etc. In 2012-2013, the topic was “the right for political participation in the society” which focused on political rights, equality, etc.

*Programs to Foster Democracy and Tolerance*

320. The MOE has made a concerted effort to advance principles of democracy and coexistence in its curriculums, and through this educational approach, to combat all forms of discrimination. For information on educational programs regarding democracy, tolerance and co-existence please see Part II of Annex No. II to this report (p. 36).

321. In addition, the Ministry formulated training programs for teachers, aimed at assisting them in effectively introducing human rights, equality, tolerance, coexistence to their pupils. The Ministry also allocated an additional 100 teaching hours to schools that wish to promote coexistence and/or democratic values. For several examples of such programs please see Part II of Annex No. II to this report (p. 36).

322. The Ministry also operates an initiative that encourages Jewish and Arab pupils to study together for subjects such as mathematics, English and civil studies — either in face to face meetings or via video-conference.

323. In addition, the Ministry operates a project to eliminate stereotypes and racism by facilitating meetings between various populations, attended in the recent year by approximately 17,000 pupils.

*Measures Taken to Review Textbooks*

324. The MOE’s Study Books Branch is responsible for the approval of all textbooks and teaching materials for all education institutions. This branch operates to keep textbooks and teaching materials up-to-date, and it is also responsible for reviewing teaching materials for both general content and the educational content specific to the field of study.

325. In accordance with the Ministry’s Director General Guideline No. 6 titled “Teaching Methods” of May 3, 2015 the Study Books Branch must ensure that “teaching material will

include adequate and un-stereotyped representation of both genders, and of all populations in the Israeli society, suitable to the requirements of the relevant educational program.”

#### *Dissemination of Human Right Conventions*

326. The Human Rights Conventions and Protocols to which Israel is party can be found on the website of the MOJ in Hebrew, English, and Arabic. Also, the full body of work with the UN Human Rights Committees, including Israeli initial and Periodic Reports, List of Issues and replies to the List of Issues, Concluding Observations, follow-up to Israel’s oral presentations as requested by the various Committees in their Concluding Observations, and other related documents can be found on the MOJ’s website.

327. In 2012, the entire collection of Concluding Observations relating to Israel by all the Human Rights Committees were translated into Hebrew and published on the MOJ’s website. Where available, links to the UN translation in Arabic of these Concluding Observations are also published.

### **Training Provided for Law Enforcement Officers**

#### **The Institute of Legal Training for Attorneys and Legal Advisers in the MOJ**

328. The Institute of Legal Training for Attorneys and Legal Advisers in the MOJ regularly conducts many seminars, courses, and vocational training — attended by hundreds of practitioners — to raise awareness of human rights issues and eliminate racial discrimination. In recent years, the training focused on the following issues: The fight against racism and prevention of discrimination (January 2014), The Arab population in Israel (November 2011, June 2015), Equality — the law as a tool for the promotion of equality in the society (October 2013), The battle against trafficking in persons (TIP) (October 2013, March 2015, March 2016), Equal rights for persons with disabilities (September 2011), human rights in international law (December 2014, November 2015) and Equality (October 2014, November 2015 and planned for November 2016). There are additional seminars on topics such as freedom of speech versus incitement, social rights, etc.

#### **The Institute of Advanced Judicial Studies**

329. The Institute holds lectures, seminars, and courses for judges on various forms of discrimination in the legal context. During 2015-2016, these seminars included: TIP, the rights of children, the struggle against racism and discrimination, and human rights and the criminal process. Similarly, in 2014-2015, the Institute held lectures, seminars and courses for judges on various human rights issues such as TIP, equality and non-discrimination and immigration and refugee law.

### **The IDF**

330. The School of Military Law hosts multiple training exercises for IDF forces on human rights and the law of armed conflict. These exercises include lectures and academic courses which provide both practical and theoretical applications of international law. They analyze real and fictional operational cases designed specifically for the participants and their military specialty. In addition, commanders and the IDF’s International Law Department take part in operational exercises in order to provide them with the professional tools that will allow them to face such challenges in accordance with international law.

331. Every year, hundreds of lectures are given to IDF soldiers and commanders who serve their mandatory service, as well as to reserve soldiers. These exercises place a specific emphasis on complicated issues such as arrest and detention practices, the legal duties of a soldier, and commanders’ legal responsibilities, as well as the laws and rules of conduct during an armed conflict.

332. With regard to human rights content, a special emphasis is placed on the legal obligation towards civilian populations, such as: the prohibition of using civilian population for military purposes, the rights of prisoners and detainees, the prohibition of using threats and physical force during questioning in the field, the principle of equality, etc.

**The ISA**

333. In recent years, the Legal Department of the ISA and dozens of ISA personnel have undergone specific training on international law, including human rights law, the core human rights conventions, and the work of the Human Rights Treaty Bodies.

334. Moreover, ISA operational personnel are taught, in detail, about the relevant human rights conventions, including their implications in the unique Israeli context. This is done both during preliminary and continued ISA training. These courses instill the importance of fundamental human rights principles, together with upholding of the rule of law and practices stipulated by the courts.

**The Israeli Police**

335. The Police Education and Information Section operates educational programs aimed at ensuring that various values are incorporated into police officers' work, such as tolerance within a multicultural society, elimination of prejudice, and raising awareness of the relevant human rights conventions.

336. The educational programs are run both within the police training program and in special workshops. In the last few years, special emphasis has been given to training police commanders at all levels, since they are in the best positions to influence their subordinates.

337. The Police School for Investigation and Intelligence incorporates into its training the main provisions of the relevant human rights conventions and law of armed conflict regarding procedures and investigation ethics.

**The Israeli Prisons Service (IPS)**

338. IPS officers and wardens undergo regular training through the School for IPS Officers and Wardens, as well as within their respective units. This training includes topics such as prevention of the use of force, warden's ethics, and values of human dignity and liberty, and the rights and liberties of the prisoner. These issues are also routinely addressed during training and guidance of other prison staff members.

339. Staff members at the "Saharonim" and the "Givon" detention facilities have participated in workshops regarding identifying victims of TIP conducted by the National Anti-Trafficking Unit in the MOJ. Further, all staff members responsible for youth incarceration undergo specialized training focusing on the unique characteristics of youth, guidelines, and the special requirements in Israeli and international law regarding minors.

**The Population and Immigration Authority**

340. The PIA Authority personnel in the Refugee Status Determination Unit (RSD) undergo a four-week course on topics specifically related to refugees and asylum seekers. This includes the 1951 Refugee Convention, relevant human rights conventions and Israeli laws, and TIP awareness. The course was co-developed and first conducted in 2009 by the MOI, UNHCR, the Hebrew Immigrant Aid Society (HIAS), and the United States Department of Homeland Security.

341. Detention Review Tribunals Judges undergo specialized trainings with respect to issues of detention, TIP, the procedure for filing an asylum request, detention of minors, and more. For examples of such seminars and trainings please see Annex No. I (p. 29).

*Mixed Schools, Bilingual Education, and Arab-Jewish Schools*

342. In its concluding observation No. 19 concerning Israel's 14-16thth Periodic Report, the Committee encouraged the development of a system of mixed schools for Jewish and Arab pupils, in order to promote understanding, tolerance, and friendship amongst Israeli citizens. According to data provided by the MOE, there are 420 Jewish schools which are also attended by Arab, Bedouin and Druze pupils (in several of these schools the number of Arab pupils exceeds that of the Jewish pupils). Additionally, there are 35 Bedouin schools attended by Jewish pupils, 109 Arab schools attended by Jewish pupils, and four Druze schools attended by Jewish pupils.

### **Projects to Promote Understanding, Tolerance and Friendship among Nations**

343. The Arab-Jewish Orchestra — consists of 20 young musicians, aged 15 to 25, from various parts of Israel. The repertoire is based on a mixture of East and West, as is also the case with the instruments, ranging from the Oud and Kanoon to the Cello and Violin. In addition to performing at concerts across Israel, the orchestra appeared at the Museum of Islam, the Oud festival, the “Sounds of the Desert” festival, the Israeli Music Holiday, at a meeting of the Anti-Defamation League in the U.S. ambassador’s house, and more. The orchestra places emphasis on performances in Arab towns and concert tours were held in the Netherlands, Croatia, Slovenia, Cyprus, Spain and Germany thus far.

344. For information about the Peres Center for Peace, Givat Haviva Seminar, and other programs, please see Israel’s 14-16th Periodic Report.

## **B. Culture**

### **Sporting Activities**

#### *Prevention of Violence, Hostility and Racism in Sports Events*

345. The *Prohibition of Violence in Sport Law* which was enacted in order to facilitate the safe and peaceful hosting of sporting events by broadening the definition of a racist display, facilitating training for security and safety personnel, and broadening their responsibilities and authorities, came into effect on August 12, 2008. This law was amended in December 17, 2014 (Amendment No. 1). According to this Amendment, if a police officer ordered the removal or restriction of a person from a sport event and that person violated the removal order, or within 180 days violated Section 17(1) of the Law, namely acted violently or disturbed public order during a sport event, if there is suspicion that he/she committed an offence related to sport, or if he/she did not obey a policeman/woman’s or an usher’s order, he/she may be removed from a sport event,. The Amendment further states that if a person violates a restriction or removal order, or one of its conditions, a police officer may order his/her removal or restriction from sport events for an additional period of up to 60 days. If that person acted violently or disturbed public order during a sport event, or if there is suspicion that he/she committed an offence related to sport, a police officer may order his/her removal or restriction from sport events for an additional period of up to 90 days.

346. Also, Amendment No. 1 adds Section 16A to the law, according to which, a person who assaults another person where a sport event is taking place is liable for up to three years imprisonment.

347. *Administrative Measures* — in 2015, the Ministry of Culture and Sport established a professional team headed by the Ministry’s Director General to examine cases of violence in sports. Following the team’s recommendations, a police unit to combat violence and hostility at sporting events was established. The Unit’s goal is to collect and apply intelligence to prevent violent incidents prior to the arrival of the fans to the fields, as well as during and after the games.

348. For statistical data on investigation cases and their status, including cases with racial motives, please see Tables No. 17 to 20 in Annex No. I to this report.

349. For additional information regarding cultural activities, including administration measures, programs and budget, please see Article 5 above.

### **Case Law**

350. For related case law, please see Part I of Annex No. II to this report (p. 18).

## C. Information

### *The Role of State Media in the Dissemination of Information to Combat Racial Prejudices*

#### *The Israel Broadcasting Authority*

351. The Israel Broadcasting Authority (IBA) invests extensive efforts to promote tolerance and equality among children and youth. The IBA emphasizes the importance of impartiality and equivalence between different races, skin colors, ethnic origins, and nationalities. The IBA transmits various movies and programs, both through television and radio, on religious pluralism, coexistence between the Arab and Jewish populations, children and children with disabilities, children of immigrants, children of foreign workers, etc.

352. The IBA has broadcasted in recent years several movies which dealt with the Ethiopian population in Israel (for example, "Dancing Shoulders," "When Israel Left" and others). The IBA also purchased a movie and television series that portrays in a positive light the Arab community in Israel (the series "the screenwriter" for example).

353. The IBA also strengthened its cooperation with the Arab channel and supplies it with shows, movies and a series for the Arab population (mainly comedy and drama, including Arabic translations).

354. Attention is also given to the fight against racism and communal segregation amongst youth. Daily news covers social and legal racial discrimination and efforts to raise awareness of these issues.

355. The IBA Department of Broadcasts for New Immigrants and Abroad airs its broadcasts in a large number of languages, including Amharic, Russian, English, French, Spanish, Ladino, Yiddish. The Department offers extensive coverage and discussions of issues relating to the prohibition against racial discrimination, human rights, equality, and the legal issues of racial discrimination.

#### *The Second Authority for Television and Radio*

356. The franchisers of the Second Authority for Television and Radio consistently address human rights issues and issues regarding prohibitions against discrimination. Such content is continuously included in news magazines and current events programs, and opportunities for expression are afforded to persons of all regions, populations and socio-economic status in Israel.

357. In addition, since 2012 the Second Authority consistently publishes contact information for the Public Complaints Commissioner who deal with complaints regarding inappropriate content, behavior of employees, etc. These complaints are examined within a reasonable time period and the complainant receives a reply with the outcome of his/her complaint. The Commissioner's annual report includes examples of responses to complaints and steps taken.

#### *The Role of Mass Media in the Publication of Human Rights*

358. For additional information on this topic, please see Israel's 14-16th Periodic Report.

---