

Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women

Distr. GENERAL

CEDAW/C/1995/3/Add.3 7 October 1994

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

COMMITTEE ON THE ELIMINATION OF DISCRIMINATION AGAINST WOMEN Fourteenth session
16 January-3 February 1995
Item 7 of the provisional agenda*

IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 21 OF THE CONVENTION ON THE ELIMINATION OF ALL FORMS OF DISCRIMINATION AGAINST WOMEN

Reports provided by specialized agencies of the United Nations on the implementation of the Convention in areas falling within the scope of their activities

Note by the Secretary-General

Addendum

UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION

Introductory note

On behalf of the Committee, the Secretariat invited the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) on 13 June 1994, to submit to the Committee, by 1 September 1994, a report on information provided by States to UNESCO on the implementation of article 10 and related articles of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, which would supplement the information contained in the reports of those States parties to the Convention which will be considered at the fourteenth session. These are the latest reports of Argentina, Bolivia, Chile, Finland, Mauritius, Norway, Peru, Russian Federation, St. Vincent and the Grenadines, Tunisia and Uganda.

221194 221194

CEDAW/C/1995/1.

CEDAW/C/1995/3/Add.3 English Page 2

Other information sought by the Committee refers to the activities, programmes and policy decisions undertaken by UNESCO to promote the implementation of article 10 and related articles of the Convention.

The report annexed hereto has been submitted in compliance with the Committee's request.

Annex

REPORT SUBMITTED BY THE UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION TO THE COMMITTEE ON THE ELIMINATION OF DISCRIMINATION AGAINST WOMEN AT ITS FOURTEENTH SESSION*

[Original: English/French]

GENERAL INTRODUCTION (Para. 1-3)

PART ONE : IMPLEMENTATION OF UNESCO DECISIONS CONCERNING WOMEN SINCE THE 13TH SESSION OF CEDAW

Chapter I : Resolution adopted by the Twenty-Seventh Session on "Women" RESOLUTION 11.1 (Para.4-6)

Chapter II: The Study On "The use of rape as a weapon of war" (Para.7-13)

Chapter III: Activities for the reinforcement of the implementation of normative instruments within U.N. and UNESCO (Para.14-16)

PART TWO: Analysis of State reports to CEDAW on Article 10 Introduction (para.17-42)

Chapter I : Bolivia (point 20)

Chapter II : Chile (Point 22 - 24)
Chapter III : St Vincent and the Grenadines (Point 25-26)

Chapter IV : Mauritius (Point 27 -28) Chapter V : Uganda (Point 29 - 30) Chapter VI : Tunisia (Point 31 - 32)
Chapter VII : Peru (Point 33 - 34)
Chapter VIII : Argentina (Point 35 - 36) Chapter IX : Finland (Point 37 - 38)

Chapter X : Norway (Point 39 - 40)

Chapter XI : Russian Federation (point 41)

This report has been reproduced in the form in which it was received.

GENERAL INTRODUCTION

- 1. In accordance with article 22 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women, specialized agencies are encouraged to submit a report on the implementation of the Convention in their areas of competence. Accordingly, the Committee has asked UNESCO to submit comments on article 10 and its application in the countries whose report will be presented at the fourteenth session. Moreover, the Committee has decided to study in greater detail at each of its sessions some articles of the Convention. The fourteenth session will be devoted to articles 7 and 8.
- 2. Overall, may be stated that all UNESCO activities have a part in the implementation of the Convention. Accordingly, UNESCO wishes to communicate to the members of the Committee its most recent activity report, which relates to the years 1992 and 1993*. That document, was submitted by the Director-General to the UNESCO General Conference at its twenty-seventh session.
- 3. Furthermore, UNESCO wishes to provide some information with regard to the items of the agenda of the fourteenth session and in accordance with article 22 of CEDAW.

Annex 1* 27/C 20 (English, French and Spanish)
Additional documents will be distributed to members of CEDAW

PART ONE:

UNESCO DECISIONS SINCE THE 13TH SESSION OF CEDAW CONCERNING WOMEN

CHAPTER I: RESOLUTION ADOPTED BY THE TWENTY-SEVENTH SESSION OF THE GENERAL CONFERENCE OF UNESCO ON WOMEN (Resolution 11.1)

- **4- This resolution** considers different subjects concerning the women's programme in UNESCO (see ref. Annex.2 Resolution 11.1) Unesco wishes to inform CEDAW's members of two particular decisions of the General Conference and of activities undertaken for their implementation:
- 5 Paragraph 6 of the resolution requests the Director General to undertake a study on the "Use of rape as a weapon of war, its causes and consequences' and that, in view of the situation in Bosnia and Herzegovina, it focus on a rehabilitation plan, to be prepared in co-operation with WHO and UNICEF, for Bosnian women who have been the victims of systematic rape and for their children; to facilitate hands-on training for women refugees in order to enable them to become active agents in their own problems;
- 6- paragraph 9 of the resolution invites the Director General
- a) to ensure that from 1994 onwards all updated editions of UNESCO publications related to human rights teaching, peace and international education contain information and knowledge about existing instruments relating to women's rights, in particular, the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against women.
- b) To provide information about the mandate and procedures of access to the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations in dealing with questions relating to violation of women's rights in UNESCO's fields of competence.

CHAPTER II: THE STUDY ON " THE USE OF RAPE AS WEAPON OF WAR"

7. During the 27th session of the General Conference of UNESCO (25 October -16 November 1993), Resolution 11.1 inviting the Director General to continue the study undertaken in accordance with 141 EX/Decision 9.3, on "The use of rape as a tool of war-its causes and consequences", and that, in view of the situation in Bosnia and Herzegovina, its focus be on a rehabilitation plan, to be prepared in co-operation with the World Health Organization (WHO) and the United Nations

Children's Fund (UNICEF), for Bosnian women who have been victims of systematic rape and for their children (Decision 140EX/8.4 and Resolution 11.1 of 27th session of General Conference in annex 3).

To facilitate hands-on training for refugee women in order to enable them to become active agents in solving problems pertaining to refugees.

- 8. To this end, consultations took place with authorities for refugees, with the Office of UNICEF in Zagreb(Croatia), and representatives of associations and qualified persons who are in direct contact with rape victims. On the initiative of the President of the Permanent Committee of Non Governmental Organizations to UNESCO, consultations had also been carried out with representatives of world societies and Ad Hoc groups of Non Governmental Organizations had been set up for this purpose.
- **9** .A Working Group met at UNESCO Headquarters on 23-24 June 1994 in which participated psychotherapists, psychoanalysists, anthropologists , historians, jurists from Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, Serbia and also from France. Several observers , representatives from Permanent Delegations to UNESCO and from Non Governmental Organizations followed the discussion.
- 10 Besides the facts established by the international community and especially the report addressed to the Ministers of Foreign Affairs of the European Community concerning the treatment of Muslim women in the former Yugoslavia by the investigating mission of the European Community, presented to the United Nations Secretary General by the Danish representative to the Organization in his quality as a representative of the presidency of the European Community and in reference to paragraph 4 of resolution 798 (1992) of the Security Council (ref.S/25240, 3 February 1993), as well as the report on the situation of human rights in the former Yugoslavia, presented to the United Nations' Commission of Human Rights in pursuance of 1992/s. 1/1 of the Commission dated 14 August 1992 (Ref. E/CN4/1993/50 of 10 February 1993 Report Mazoviecki), and the final report of the Commission of Experts set up in accordance with resolution 780 (1992) of the Security Council (Ref. S/1994/674 of 27 May 1994 the 5 members Commission, first presided by Professor Frits Kalshoven and later presided by Professor Cherif Bassiouni called the Bassiouni report), the objective of the working group was to bring to light at one and the same time, the political, human and legal consequences of sexual crimes committed in Bosnia and Herzegovania and to help determine a plan of action to be drawn up in considering all these different aspects.
- 11 The experts Commission established by the Security Council was able to identify and name nearly 800 rape victims. Some 1500 reported cases included the identification of 600 presumed rapists (Bassiouni's report n°232 to 253). But crimes

committed between autumn 1991 and the end of 1993, especially in between April to November 1992 were much more frequent, some estimates place the figure at 20.000 or more rapes. It is very difficult to give a precise number, since in nearly 80% of the cases the victims are prisoners of their own rapist, Often they are victims of repeated rape and held in specially for this purpose places. It should be noted that the word victim should not only apply to victims of rape and sexual abuse, but also to the witnesses of these crimes who often have family or neighbourhood relations with the original victims. Also the question of numbers had deliberately been put aside in this report precisely because of the special character of these crimes, and the extreme difficulty for the victims to make themselves known, both for the inherent reasons that characterizes rape (to be developed in the report) and also for fear of reprisals.

12. The variation in figures does not modify the gravity of these crimes, nonetheless, the figures are still to be considered important. It could be, as in past conflicts, that revisionist theories that attempt or will attempt to deny the fact that the rape of women was systematic and massive. The Executive Board's decision and the General Assembly's resolution will in this way allow UNESCO to contribute to efforts of the international community to show the real consequences of using rape as a weapon of war and so to identify ways of prevention and for the education which are fundamental for the construction of peace, which recognizes and respects women's dignity and that of all human beings.

13. UNESCO's report on the use of rape as a weapon of war is attached in annex 2)

CHAPTER III: Activities for the reinforcement of the implementation of normative instruments of United Nations and

14- Cooperation with CEDAW

In paragraph 9, in view of the implementation of this request, especially dissemination of information and the programme of education on the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women, UNESCO has consolidated its cooperation with CEDAW following the visit of Ms Ivanka CORTI, President of CEDAW to UNESCO.

Consequently, a working group was formed to study the implementation of the CEDAW Convention on articles within the competence of UNESCO in co-operation with CEDAW. A meeting is to be organized on 2-5 November 1994 at UNESCO Headquarters in Paris.

15- Action on Normative Instruments of UNESCO
The Resolution invites the Director General to ensure that
from 1994 onwards all updated editions of UNESCO publications

related to human-rights teaching, peace and international education contain information and knowledge about existing instruments relating to women's rights, in particular, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women.

16-To prepare and disseminate an informative synthesis of UNESCO's normative instruments pertaining to women; information about the mandate and procedures of access to the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations of the Executive Board in dealing with questions relating to violation of women's rights in UNESCO's fields of competence.

A study was undertaken as well as all necessary measures for the implementation of these requests.

PART TWO: Analysis of States reports to CEDAW on Article 10

Report on the implementation of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women, Article 10 (Education) for: Bolivia, Chile, St. Vincent and the Grenadines, Mauritius, Uganda and Tunisia; Peru, Argentina and Finland; and Russian Federation and Norway.

Introduction

17- Article 10 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women calls for comprehensive efforts to promote equal participation of girls and women in all forms and levels of education, educational management and planning as well as educational decision-making. At the same time, it calls for overall gender equity and improvement in the quality of all public education. Thus, several basic principles are used in this report on the implementation of this article with respect to the ten countries under review: (1) Are girls and women obtaining increased access and full participation in mainstream formal education? Do non formal, alternative and shorter forms of education actually lead girls and women to the best available public provision? (2) Is educational policy in the country under review conceived as a lifelong issue with real possibilities for re-entry in various forms of continuing education available at different points in girls' and women's lives? (3) In secular countries, separate educational provision for minorities or girls and women is not considered conducive to equality of opportunity. To what extent are both secular and religiously-oriented governments increasing their efforts to provide mixed education or reduce the disparities linked to segregation? In other words, what legal or implicit barriers still exist to full participation of girls and women in the best available education and career development in educational planning and management?

18- In addition, the statistics contained in the annex of this report are taken essentially from UNESCO's 1993 World

Education Report and the 1993 OECD Education at a Glancec OECD Indicators. The figures, are based on official government statistics supplied to UNESCO and do not necessarily represent the result of independent, research-based surveys or studies. They vary in time, method of calculation and are in no way comparable across countries. They are, at best, an indication of the best available information which Member States are able to provide UNESCO's Office of Statistics for purposes of analysing long-term trends rather than short-term conditions and improvements.

General Trends

19 - With overall world-wide economic austerity, the quality of educational provision has suffered in both developing and industrialized countries. Initiatives to promote gender equity in formal education are constrained both by the lack of resources as well as lack of political will. Thus, in each of the countries under review, it is not surprising that the reduction of discrimination has been of limited significance in recent years. Countries which have suffered most from the economic crisis and those which are undergoing major political transformations have also made little or no progress in improving education for girls and women. It is true to say, however that they have had considerable difficulty in maintaining or improving other social services as well. Some countries (eg. Finland and Norway) appear to reach a plateau beyond which it is difficult to go further. Other countries undergoing major political (Russian Federation) transformations have found it difficult to maintain their previous high levels of equal opportunity. Countries of Latin America and the Caribbean have reduced some of the most overt forms of discrimination but are unable to extend their efforts to issues of retention at secondary level or participation in long forms of higher education, let alone educational planning and management. Countries of North and Sub-Saharan Africa (Mauritius, Uganda, Tunisia) do not lend themselves to generalisations as the North African country under review, Tunisia, has made the greatest progress in the promotion of educational opportunity for girls and women within the countries of the Maghreb and the Arab States, whereas Mauritius is not typical of other African countries either. It made considerable progress in spite of economic constraints and several successive educational policy reforms that were not fully implemented. Finally, Uganda has suffered major political and economic difficulties which have had a direct impact on gender equity.

CHAPTER I BOLIVIA

20 - Illiteracy rates: Men: 15.3 per cent, Women: 29.3 per cent

Primary education gross enrollment ratio:

Men Women

1980: 90; 1990: 89 1980: 78; 1990:81

Secondary education gross enrollment ratio:

Men Women

1980: 40; 1990: 37 1980: 31; 1990: 31

Higher education: Unavailable

21 -The Bolivian initial report stresses the fact that education is co-educational, a necessary but insufficient precondition for equality of opportunity as the figures above already indicate. Indeed, the Bolivian report indicates that there are "4.7 and 2.25 illiterate women for every illiterate man in urban and rural areas, respectively. In general, the illiteracy rate for women is 2.5 times higher than for men". The situation in Bolivia as described in the report is frank and critical as the distance between official policy and actual practice are analysed. The main obstacles appear to be traditional undervaluation of women in society as well as the political and economic conditions in the country which affect overall social policy.

CHAPTER II CHILE

22 - Illiteracy rates: Men 6.5 Women: 6.8

Primary education gross enrollment ratio:

Men Women

1980: 110 1990:99 1980: 108 1990: 97

Secondary education gross enrollment ratio:

Men Women

1980:49; 1990: 70 1980: 56; 1990: 75

Higher education

1980: 14.0 1990:... 1980: 10.8 1990:...

23 -The Chilean report also frankly reports high levels of gender discrimination with respect to education at all levels. It points to the creation of the National Office for Women's Affairs (SERNAM) as the government machinery which should guide policy and practice to reduce educational as well as other

forms of discrimination. It appears, nonetheless, that Chile has to make considerable effort to provide basic education for all children, both boys and girls as the current provision is characterized by wastage in the forms of drop-out, grade repetition, and problems of access, especially in rural areas. The official illiteracy rates are fairly low but, as with all such figures, no clear picture is available as to the quality of reading, writing and numeracy skills among the officially-identified literate population.

24 - UNESCO's Regional Office (OREALC) has undertaken a number of projects and joint studies with Chile and other Latin American countries to address this dimension. There is also some attempt to address the impact of transition from more than twenty years of lack of democratic institutions and current efforts to promote pluralism. Social policy in all areas including education has neglected during this period while the initiatives to introduce mass literacy and popular education programmes prior to 1973 have been thwarted. Nonetheless, as with many other Latin American countries, political pluralism is not sufficient to guarantee gender equity as the weight of traditional roles for women seems to permeate all political persuasions (a similar situation exists beyond Latin America with respect to Europe as well);

CHAPTER III st. Vincent and the Grenadines

25-Illiteracy rates : No figures available Primary education : No figures available Secondary education : No figures available Higher education, : No figures available

26- St Vincent and the Grenadines has not been able to provide basic data to UMESCO's Office of statistics regarding educational provision and the country thus receives only sparse reporting in the World Education Report. Similarly, the country report for CEDAW is extremely brief and stresses the critical state of education for girls and women.

CHAPTER IV

27- Illiteracy rates: Men: 14.8 Women: 25.3

Primary education gross enrollment ratios:

Men: 1980:98; 1990:104 Women: 1980:98; 1990:108

Secondary education gross enrollment ratios:

Men: 1980:45; 1990:52 Women: 1980:42; 1990:54

Higher education

Men: 1980:1.1 1990:2.9 Women: 1980:0.5; 1990:1.5

28- The report for Mauritius points out that equal access has been achieved at primary level while some disparity still occurs at secondary level. The greatest disparities appear at the level of higher education. The report as well as

independent studies indicate that girls are as likely as boys to complete primary education and if they enter secondary education, to complete examinations successfully. Mauritius has both co-educational and single-sex schools. Women are less likely to reach managerial levels in both co-educational schools and boys schools. They appear to be confined to girls schools. This pattern is prevalent across countries and the situation in Maritius is typical both for the region and for other regions. No positive discrimination measures are apparently being taken to address equality of career opportunity. Rather, the government action and policy focuses on action to benefit both boys and girls. Other country experience would indicate that improvements which are not targeted to benefit girls (or other disadvantaged groups) are rarely actually implemented for all the population.

CHAPTER V

UGANDA

29- Illiteracy rates: Men: 37.8 Women: 65.1

Primary education gross enrollment ratios:

Men: 1980:60; 1990:-- Women: 1980:45; 1990:---

Secondary education gross enrollment ratios:

Men: 1980:7; 1990:--- Women: 1980:3; 1990:---

Higher education

Men: 1980:0.8; 1990:1.6 Women: 1980:0.2; 1990: 0.6

30- The Ugandan report traces disparities in treatment of girls to the education system introduced by Christian missionaries. The missionaries sought to subjugate girls and women to traditional western domestic roles and their schools emphasized girls' roles as wives and mothers rather than full members of the community. This analysis is also shared by many researchers concerning the impact of colonial and missionary education in Africa. Clear gender distinctions based on imported role models have strongly influenced attitudes both towards girls' participation in schooling and the nature of that education "for domestication" rather than "empowerment". While overall educational provision in Uganda may well suffer from the weight of colonial tradition, there is also a conflict between Christian and animist attitudes towards children born in monogamous or polygamous contexts. The Ugandan report stresses the lack of reliable gender sensitive data rather than lack of political will to redress the disparities. It also notes the lack of special measures to make educational facilities safe and appropriate for both boys and girls. As Uganda is among the countries struck by both severe economic and political difficulties, it is clear that the scarce resources should be directed at the most severe problems, i.e. basic literacy and numeracy of girls and boys,

men and women, and secondly a broader basic education. As the infrastructures are fragile, it is also important that international aid is not short-sighted or in contradiction with Uganda's development of internal capacity and continuity of educational provision.

CHAPTER VI TUNISIA

31- Illiteracy rates: Men:25.8 Women 43.7

Primary education gross enrollment ratios:

Men: 1980:118; 1990:123 Women: 1980:88; 1990:109

Secondary education gross enrollment ratios:

Men: 1980:34; 1990:51 Women: 1980:20; 1990:42

Higher education:

Men: 1980:6.7; 1990:10.0 Women: 1980:3.0; 1990:6.8

32-Tunisia has provided a very comprehensive report on the state of education at all levels for girls and women. It frankly analyses the disparities in access to all levels and forms of education for girls and women. It stresses that policies have had the greatest impact on young people rather than adults or older women. The official figures for all levels of education substantiate this analysis. The report signals a pilot project carried out with UNESCO to encourage girls in Nabeul and Monastir to undertake technical studies at secondary level heretofore reserved for boys. Tunisia has also been the host for a number of regional workshops and conferences organized jointly with UNESCO on educational issues, including a workshop on the preparation of literacy materials for women in Arabic in 1993. Tunisia appears to be making greater progress than some other countries in its region with respect to equality of opportunity for girls and women. Greater efforts need to be made, however, in terms of encouraging highly-qualified women to accede to positions of management and planning within schools and within governments agencies.

CHAPTER VII PERU

33- Illiteracy rates: Men: 8.5 Women: 21.3

Primary education gross enrollment ratios:

Men: 1980:117; 1990-- Women:1980:111; 1990:--

Secondary education gross enrollment ratios:

Men: 1980:62; 1990:-- Women: 1980:55; 1990:--

Higher education:

Men: 1980:22.1; 1990:-- Women: 1980:12.4;1990:-

. . .

34-The Peruvian reports gives cursory attention to gender disparities in education at all levels. There appear to be few programmes or policies in place to improve both access and equity in education for girls and women. The emphasis seems to be placed on improving educational opportunity in general and expecting that women and other disadvantaged groups (such as linguistic minorities) will eventually benefit. Previous international experiences does not indicate that this approach leads to much success in improving gender equity. According to official figures, Peru has achieved fairly high access to primary education but disparities appear at all levels of education and in terms of basic literacy. It is probably true, as is the case elsewhere, when women and girls also belong to linguistic or ethnic minorities, their situation is one of even greater disadvantage. Also, rural and urban disparities in Peru have been accentuated by political and economic instability as elsewhere in the region. The nature of that instability has undoubtedly affected girls and women disproportionately.

CHAPTER VIII ARGENTINA

35-Illiteracy rates Men: 4.5 Women: 4.9

Primary education gross enrollment ratios:

Men: 1980: 106; 1990:108 Women: 1980:106; 1990:115

Secondary education gross enrollment ratios:

Men: 1980:53; 1990:67 Women: 1980:62; 1990:74

Higher education:

Men: 1980: 21.0; 1990:36.7 Women: 1980:21.9 1990:43.1

36-The Argentinian report stresses major progress in equality of opportunity for girls and women with respect to education at all levels. This progress appears especially significant at the level of higher education according to figures reported to UNESCO are more focused on urban areas as the actual levels of total illiteracy are considerably higher in rural zones. As in most developing countries, secondary education is not compulsory. Hence, it is interesting to note that there is fairly high participation of girls in spite of a lack of legal compulsion. Since Argentina has achieved fairly good female participation in higher education, it would appear that universities might take a lead role in promoting analysis necessary to provoke progress at other levels. For example, women's studies departments or courses might provide a focus for such debate. Similarly, Argentina also needs to deal with same issues of segmentation and segregation in the education system as other Latin American countries. Thus, universities and other community or popular education sites might stimulate reflection in this area. This is particularly clear in that Argentina has a long tradition of such popular education.

CHAPTER IX

37- Illiteracy rates: Men:--- Women:---

Primary education gross enrollment ratios:

Men: 1980:96; 1990:99 Women: 1980:96; 1990:98

Secondary education gross enrollment ratios:

Men: 1980:94; 1990:107 Women: 1980:105; 1990: 107

Higher education:

Men: 1980:32.5; 1990:45.4 Women 1980:31.8; 1990: 51.2

38- The Finnish report indicates a high level of gender equity in all levels of education. The country does not report on literacy issues to UNESCO (as is frequently the case among industrialized countries). Nonetheless, it is highly probable that there is a residual number of adults with limited basic literacy and numeracy in Finland just as in all other countries. Generally, this residual "functional" illiteracy affects men more than women and linguistic minorities more than the dominant linguistic group. In Finland, as in other countries under study, women do not reach the higher levels of management and the senior faculty in universities except in small numbers. Also, the report signals clear gender segregation in terms of fields of study in higher education. Thus, Finland needs to concentrate on the more subtle forms of discrimination which remain.

CHAPTER X NORWAY

39- Illiteracy rates: Men: --- Women: ---

Primary education gross enrollment ratios:

Men: 1980:99; 1990:100 Women: 1980:99; 1990:100

Secondary education gross enrollment rations:

Men: 1980:92; 1990:100 Women: 1980:96; 1990:100

Higher education:

Men: 1980:25.9; 1990:38.4 Women: 1980:25.0; 1990: 45.8

40- The Norwegian reports highlights specific legislation to ensure equal status for girls in all levels of education. It also points to a specific secretariat in the Ministry of Education and Research to coordinate and stimulate further initiatives. Since the previous report, measures have been taken to include equal status issues in school curicula,

teacher training and research. The major breakthrough appears to be in the number of women studying more and for a longer period of times, as nearly fifty per cent of women according to figures supplied to UNESCO participate in some form of higher education. As with other countries, however, and as analysed in the OECD Educational Indicators at a Glance, it is still more likely that women will participate in the shorter forms of higher education in Norway as in other industrialized countries. It is also not clear from the report whether Norway has successfully tackled the issue of access for highly-qualified women to managerial and decision-making post in education and educational administration.

CHAPTER XI

RUSSIAN FEDERATION

41- The information forwarded for this report concerns the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics. The actual situation in the Russian Federation as in the other states of the former U.S.S.R. is more difficult to analyse based on this type of data. Independent studies and reports which cannot be considered definitive indicate, however, that the major political and economic transformation taking place have had a very negative impact on all areas of social policy, including education. Whereas women and girls were officially promoted as a policy aiming at maximum human resource development and social justice in the past, the transition has led to a breakdown in many social services. As with other countries experiencing rapid social transformation. It is most frequently women and girls who suffer most and it is to be expected that the Russian Federation will have increased difficulty in the foreseeable future to maintain basic educational services as well as promote gender equity. It is to be hoped that the analysis in the Third Periodic Report for the U.S.S.R. as a whole can be applicable in the current context and certainly, it is to be hoped that the major accomplishments of the previous socialist system can be maintained and developed.

42-Note. The gross enrollment ratio referred to in figures on education in the above countries does not distinguish between overage pupils, pupils who have repeated a grade, etc. Hence, the figure can be over 100 per cent and is not an adequate indication of a country's ability to educate its children effectively. It is used as one of a number of indicators, which taken together, give a clearer picture of the effectiveness of school systems. The GER was used for reasons of brevity in this report.

References

Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development. (1993)
Educational Indicators at a Glance, Paris. OECD
United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural
Organization. (1993)
World Education Report, Paris, UNESCO

Country reports provided by CEDAW for Bolivia, Chile, St Vincent and the Grenadines, Maritius, Uganda, Tunisia, Peru, Argentina, Finland, Russian Federation, Norway.

Female literacy in Uganda: selected data

Item	Years	Total	Men	Women
Illiterate population: ratio (in %)	1990	51.7	37.8	65.1
Change in the number of illiterates	1980-1990	23.6		

Source: World Education Report (UNESCO, 1993).

Education

Schooling	Year	Total*	Men*	Women*
First level education: gross ratio	1980 1990	52.0 80.0	60.0	45.0
First level education: net ratio	1980	39.0	43.0	35.0
Second level education: gross ratio	1980 1990	5.0 14.0	7.0	3.0
Enrolment ratio at the primary level**	1988	84.0		80.0

Source: World Education Report (UNESCO, 1993).

* Data in %.

** <u>Source</u>: <u>Human Development Report</u> (UNDP: Editions Economica, 1993).

Teaching staff	Year	Total (%)	Men (%)	Women (%)
First level	1980			30
Second level	1980			28
Registration ratio at the third level (gross)	1980 1990	0.5 1.1	0.8 1.6	0.2 0.6

Source: World Education Report (UNESCO, 1993).

Third level education: percentage of women in each field of study

Field	Year	Percentage
Natural sciences, engineering and agriculture	1990	12.0
Medical sciences	1990	22.0
Law and social sciences	1990	35.0
Humanities	1990	33.0
Education	1990	29.0
All fields	1990	28.0

Source: World Education Report (UNESCO, 1993).

Gaps between men and women:

Data for women as a percentage of the average data for men (= 100). A figure under 100 means that the datum for women is lower than the average for men; a figure over 100 means that the datum for women is higher than that for men. The smaller the ratio of the figure to 100, the larger the gap between the two sexes.

	Year	Gap (%)
Population	1990	102
Literacy	1970 1990	58 56
Average number of years of study	1990	41

Schooling

Primary	1988-1990	88
Secondary	1988-1990	44

Third level education: percentage of women in each field of study*

Field	Year	Percentage
Natural sciences, engineering and agriculture	1990	12.0
Medical sciences	1990	22.0
Law and social sciences	1990	35.0
Humanities	1990	33.0
Education	1990	29.0
All fields	1990	28.0

Source: World Education Report (UNESCO, 1993).

* <u>Translator's note</u>: This table is a duplicate of the one on p. 19.

Gaps between men and women:

Data for women as a percentage of the average data for men (= 100). A figure under 100 means that the datum for women is lower than the average for men; a figure over 100 means that the datum for women is higher than that for men. The smaller the ratio of the figure to 100, the larger the gap between the two sexes.

	Year	Gap (%)
Population	1990	102
Literacy	1970 1990	58 56
Average number of years of study	1990	41

Schooling

Primary	1988-1990	88
Secondary	1988-1990	44
Higher	1988-1990	36

Source: Human Development Report (UNDP: Editions Economica, 1993).

Miscellaneous

	Year	Ratio (for women)
Maternal mortality (per 100,000 births)	1988	700
Nurses per doctor	1984-1989	10.7
Female workforce (as % of total workforce)	1990	41

Source: Human Development Report (UNDP: Editions Economica, 1993).

ANNEX I



General Conference Twenty-seventh Session, Paris 1993

27 C

27 C/20 3 September 1993 Original: French

Item 6.3 of the provisional agenda

UNESCO'S CONTRIBUTION TO THE IMPROVEMENT OF THE STATUS OF WOMEN REPORT BY THE DIRECTOR-GENERAL

SUMMARY

Under the terms of resolutions 16.1 and 13.2 adopted by the General Conference at its nineteenth and twentieth sessions respectively, the Director-General is invited to present at biennial intervals, to the Executive Board and then to the General Conference, a special report describing the activities carried out by the Organization in its fields of competence as a contribution to improving the status of women.

In addition, resolution 13.2 adopted by the General Conference at its twenty-first session, resolution 14.2 adopted at its twenty-second session, resolution 14.2 adopted at its twenty-third session, resolution 14.1 adopted at its twenty-fourth session, resolution 109, paragraph 3(a), adopted at its twenty-fifth session and resolution 11.1 adopted at its twenty-sixth session, invite the Director-General 'to broaden and deepen the examination of obstacles to female participation in UNESCO's activities and to intensify his efforts to remove such obstacles, and to improve the career opportunities for women currently employed by UNESCO both at Headquarters and in the field' and 'to submit regular ... reports to the Executive Board and the General Conference on the results of these efforts'.

This report has been drawn up in pursuance of these resolutions. It follows on from documents 20 C/17, 21 C/16, 22 C/17, 23 C/18, 24 C/16, 25 C/15 and 26 C/15 and covers the period 1992-1993. It describes all that the Organization has done inside the Secretariat, in Member States and within the framework of the United Nations system to contribute to improving the status of women.

INTRODUCTION

- 1. This report has been prepared in accordance with the resolutions adopted by the General Conference since its nineteenth session (see cover page) and is the eighth of its kind. The Medium-Term Plan for 1990-1995 has confirmed the Organization's commitment to promoting equality between women and men, thereby charting a further stage in the activities already undertaken during the second Medium-Term Plan (1984-1989), while the Draft Programme and Budget for 1994-1995 devotes Chapter 1 of Transverse Themes, Programmes and Activities' to 'Women', with total budget estimates amounting to \$6,940,000.
- 2. Since its inception, UNESCO has endeavoured, in response to the objectives enshrined in its Constitution, to promote equality between the sexes and to improve the status of women in its fields of competence. This action has undoubtedly grown in scale in recent years, even if, owing to financial constraints, the Organization has not always been able to carry out all its projects. The issue of respect for human rights is today at the core of international relations, and is one of the prerequisites of peace; however, the specific question of women's rights, all too frequently overlooked, is itself at the core of the rights of the human being. The United Nations is fully aware of this, and is preparing for the fourth World Conference on Women, to be held in Beijing in 1995, on the theme 'Action for equality, development and peace'. UNESCO is associated in this project, and is working directly with the United Nations Commission on the Status of Women. For that purpose, the Director-General has set up a consultative committee which, meeting under his chairmanship, will closely monitor the preparations for the Beijing Conference within the Secretariat.
- 3. In the past biennium, UNESCO's action has highlighted two major objectives: on the one hand, that of involving women fully in the processes of democratization currently under way in many regions of the world, and, on the other, combating the violence of which women are still all too frequently victims. The Organization's long-established action in the field of education remains crucial. Moreover, while UNESCO's programmes are still inadequate as a result of the financial constraints that continue to weigh on the Organization, its *standard-setting activities* are taking on ever greater importance, not only in ensuring that existing instruments are applied but in setting new standards where these are necessary, in particular to protect women from violence. In this connection, the fourth World Conference on Women should be a new milestone on the road to progress.

I. STANDARD-SETTING ACTION

4. UNESCO'S standard-setting action embraces both the instruments specific to the Organization itself, especially all matters relating to action to combat sex discrimination in education, and the instruments underlying the action of the United Nations in matters of human rights, whether affecting the exercise of their right by women or the assaults upon their dignity of which they are still victims.

A. Discrimination against women in education

5. The international standard-setting instruments adopted by the General Conference since the founding of UNESCO or on the occasion of special intergovernmental conferences convened on UNESCO's initiative, or again, the conventions of which UNESCO is the depository, are indeed numerous: as at 29 February 1992 they comprised 31 agreements. conventions or protocols as well as 28 recommendations and five declarations. Several of them concern women.

- 6. This is true of the Convention against Discrimination in Education, adopted in Paris on 14 December 1960, which entered into force on 22 May 1962 and which is currently binding upon 76 States; of the Protocol instituting a Conciliation and Good Offices Commission to be responsible for seeking the settlement of any disputes which may arise between States Parties to the Convention against Discrimination in Education, adopted in Paris on 10 December 1962, which entered into force on 24 October 1968 and which is currently binding upon 29 States; of the Convention on Technical and Vocational Education adopted in Paris on 10 November 1989, which entered into force on 29 August 1991 and which is as yet binding on only four States (Oman, United Arab Emirates, Zimbabwe and Mongolia). Its Preamble reaffirms 'the need to make a special effort to promote the technical and vocational education of women and girls', while its Article 2.3 provides that Contracting States should endeavour to ensure equal access and equality of opportunity to study (for both sexes) throughout the educational process.
- 7. The same is also true of several recommendations, for example the Recommendation on the Development of Adult Education (1976), and the recommendation adopted by the International Conference on Education at its forty-second session (Geneva, September 1990), on the struggle against illiteracy.
- 8. The Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers (1966), which comprises special provisions to prevent all forms of discrimination based on sex (provisions 7, 10(b), 54 to 58, 102 and 103) continues to be the focus of special attention, even though financial constraints have seriously restricted the Organization's scope of action. Subregional symposia organized in Accra (Ghana, 1991), San José (Costa Rica, 1992) and Abidjan (Côte d'Ivoire. 1993) led to studies being undertaken by a working group composed of representatives of government administrations, professional unions and private education. On the basis of case-studies conducted at national level in a number of countries, a comprehensive report will be presented in 1994 at the sixth session of the Joint ILO/UNESCO Committee of Experts on the Application of the Recommendation, and will be submitted to governments for consideration.
- 9. The Revised Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education (1974) has itself been the subject of a second consultation of Member States since 1989. A second questionnaire, sent to Member States in July 1990, included questions concerning measures aimed at fostering access by women and girls to vocational education, in particular:

the laws or regulations applicable:

the measures designed to attract girls into technical and vocational education, in order to help them to complete their studies and to adjust to the occupations for which they are aiming; and

the measures designed to redirect into vocational training any girls who drop out before completing their secondary schooling.

Member States' replies show that, despite the efforts made, including some highly innovative measures, girls and women are still far from enjoying equal opportunities, whether in technical and vocational training or in the world of work.

B. Women's rights in practice

- 10. Taking as its main point of reference the 1979 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, the Organization has continued, throughout the biennium, to explore the concept of the equality of the sexes in the various cultures, and to strengthen the effective application of women's acknowledged rights, particularly in political matters.
- Following a meeting of women's associations located in the countries of the Maghrib. held in Rabat on 25 and 26 October 1991, a group, 'Collective 95 Maghrib Egalité', was set up with the aim of strengthening the application of international standard-setting instruments relating to women in these countries. Funded by a private foundation, the group has set up workshops with UNESCO assistance, whose work will be the subject of a report to the Forum of Non-Governmental Organizations on the occasion of the fourth United Nations World Conference to be held in Beijing in 1995. The group is supporting the action to secure ratification of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women by all the countries of the Maghrib, Tunisia being at present the sole country to have ratified it. The Secretariat assisted in the preparation of guides for drawing up progress reports on the application of international treaties and conventions on the occasion of the third meeting of the working group, in Tunis, in December 1992; it also contributed to the organization of a workshop on violence against women in the context of the Declaration against Violence currently being prepared by the United Nations. The group is also continuing the study on the personal status of women in the Maghrib, and will propose a unified Code for the countries of the Maghrib based on the international standards applicable. Concomitantly, UNESCO has produced, as a joint publication with the Institut du Monde Arabe (Paris), a booklet recapitulating the conclusions of an international symposium on women's rights in the Maghrib.
- 12. In view of the fact that women's participation in the media is an important right for present-day societies, a study was carried out on the benefits that women have derived from the development of communications during the past decade (1981-1991), and was submitted to the Executive Board at its 139th session (May 1992). A decision (4.2.1) invited the Director-General to strengthen the women's component as an essential part of the entire communication programme, to facilitate their access to sectors from which they are all but excluded, in particular the new technologies, to increase their participation in UNESCO's programmes and to strengthen their networks.

C. Assaults on the dignity of women

- 13. Whether the issue is violence against girls or women, particularly in urban areas prostitution or sexual mutilation, UNESCO's action has been developing for many years, with the active participation of Member States and of intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations. Growing world poverty has meant that problems involving assaults on the dignity of women are becoming ever more acute. UNESCO has broadened the scope of its action during the biennium by laying the foundations for an international network and by making provision for the establishment of new international standards.
- 14. UNESCO provided support for an exhibition organized by the city of Lille (France) on prostitution. The fact that many young people questioned on that occasion no longer regard prostitution as inevitable, and believe that it may well disappear, suggests that future trends may follow a normative path.

- 15. A working group which met on 9 and 10 April 1991 at Penn State University set itself the task of analysing the 1949 Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of others, and proposing means of strengthening its application and monitoring. Following a study on the causes of prostitution, the experts expressed the view that new international standards should be adopted on this question. A report, entitled 'Penn State Report', published in English and in French, was widely disseminated and led in particular to an open debate within the Council of Europe. Following the report's publication, and in response to a request addressed by the Working Group on contemporary forms of slavery set up by the United Nations Commission on Human Rights, another working group met in New York in order to frame new international standards; besides UNESCO representatives, its participants included academics and representatives of non-governmental organizations, in particular the 'Coalition against Trafficking in Women'. The Group's findings were presented at a lecture delivered to the 'Women's Group' of non-governmental organizations at the Headquarters of the United Nations, a group which has shown great interest in UNESCO's activities.
- 16. On the occasion of International Women's Day, an International Conference on the Sex Trade and Human Rights was held in Brussels, on 6 March 1993. Organized by UNESCO, the Communauté française de belgique, the International Federation of Human Rights and the International Council of Women, it attracted very considerable attention. In order to contend with a traffic in persons which has reached proportions and is conducted by methods that are little short of barbarous, participants urged that the international instruments designed to combat it be strengthened. A campaign to collect signatures was launched in order to support the proposal for a new Convention against the exploitation of human beings which might be presented at the fourth World Conference on Women to be organized by the United Nations in 1995 in Beijing (China).

D. The activities of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations

17. Having regard to UNESCO's specific responsibilities in the field of human rights, while at the same time recognizing that the Organization 'is prohibited from intervening in matters which are essentially within [the] domestic jurisdiction [of Member States]', the Executive Board instructed the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations (104 EX/Decision 3.3, 1978) to 'consider communications received by the Organization concerning cases and questions of violations of human rights within UNESCO's fields of competence', whether these originated from a person or from a group of persons, with a view to 'helping to bring about a friendly solution', and to submit confidential reports to the Executive Board. This is a procedure which should be used to deal with questions relating to violations of women's rights specifically. To date, such has not been the case: no women's organization has as yet availed itself of this possibility, no specific violation has been cited, and the alleged victims of human rights violations have included only three women in the past two years.

II. PROMOTION OF EQUALITY BETWEEN WOMEN AND MEN

A. Universality of women's rights

18. Several major meetings organized in various regions of the world have served to emphasize the universal nature of women's rights and aspirations. In Prague (Czechoslovakia), a regional symposium was held from 3 to 6 December 1991 on women and democracy in the countries of Central and Eastern Europe. Bringing together women from both Eastern and Western Europe, whose backgrounds were consequently quite different, the symposium

highlighted the fact that, behind the legal and institutional apparatus of the old régimes which aimed to protect women by means of specific quotas and electoral systems, traditional attitudes had endured in Eastern European countries. With the new situation, and in particular the advent of the free market and competition, including competition in the labour market, the status of women has frequently become extremely precarious, even in countries which opted officially for equality decades ago. The participants urged that measures be adopted on behalf of women, but also drew attention to the importance of promoting a new awareness among the women concerned.

- 19. In Mamaia (Romania) in July 1992, the first session of the Women's University was held, at the invitation of the Romanian National Commission for UNESCO, on the theme 'Feminism: international experience and solidarity'. Organized with the assistance of the Communauté française de Belgique, and with the participation of French public and private institutions, this first session brought together women from intellectual and academic circles in Belgium, France, Romania and Russia, who were thus able to undertake a searching inquiry into the status of women in Romania; the report on the session, disseminated by UNESCO, now constitutes an important working document for Romanian associations. The proposal is currently being explored to set up a Black Sea Women's Summer University, whose permanent secretariat would be provided by the Romanian National Commission, but which might be itinerant.
- 20. UNESCO lent its support for the 'Mediterranean Women's Forum', held in Valencia (Spain) from 24 to 28 November 1992. Organized by the Institut Valencia de la Dona in Valencia and by the Spanish National Commission for UNESCO for the purpose of affirming the community of interests shared by the women of the region, the Forum urged that a Mediterranean Women's Institute be established in Valencia, a project that is already supported by Spain, Italy and Tunisia. A permanent working commission, on which UNESCO is represented, and which met in Venice (April 1993) and then in Rabat (June 1993), is currently preparing a forthcoming Forum in Tunis, and undertaking a feasibility study for the future institute.
- 21. In collaboration with the Lebanese Commission for UNESCO, the Secretariat organized, from 29 to 31 March 1993, the first national meeting on women's rights in Lebanon. The discussions were all the more interesting in that women have borne the burden of the civil war, during which they have taken a full part in political debates, acting to promote peace, whereas customarily they are conspicuous by their absence from political life. Likewise, although the level of their participation in economic life is the highest in the region the proportion of working women is as high as 23 per cent they still suffer the consequences of a personal status dictated by membership of a particular religious community. A law on inheritance, based on the principle of equality, has been adopted; however, it concerns only non-Muslim women. The participants also urged that a legal definition of the duties and responsibilities of spouses in marriage be drawn up in order to enable Lebanon to accede to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women.
- 22. Organized to coincide with the campaign for the first legislative elections in the newly reunified Yemen, a regional symposium on 'Arab Women, Modernity and Democratization' took place in Sana'a (Yemen) from 13 to 18 April 1993. It brought together specialists from Yemen as well as from three countries of the Maghrib (Algeria, Morocco and Tunisia). It was the focus of particular attention inasmuch as six of the women participants were candidates in the elections. The point was clearly brought out that, while the guarantee afforded by the rule of law in a country was a *sine qua non* for ensuring observance of women's rights the

winning of which had been a lengthy and arduous battle - the role of civil society was none the less essential in order to secure their effective exercise. In a society in which law is in essence religious, and where one of the fundamental questions concerns the sources of the applicable law, it was proposed that a 'panel of wise women' be set up in order to enable women to play a direct role in determining these sources and their different interpretations.

23. A new concept has emerged in regard to the exercise of political rights, namely, that of democracy based on sexual parity; this should in the near future renew and enrich the approach to democracy. A study on 'Women and democratization in Africa: the case of Burkina Faso' produced by the Regional Office in Dakar (BREDA) highlights the difficulties involved in a process that is aimed at overcoming, simultaneously with the battle for democracy, the traditional subordination of women.

B. Women's participation in development

- 24. The first international meeting of the research and action network concerning the role of women in the informal sector of the economy was held in Bogor (Indonesia) from 2 to 5 November 1992, with the assistance of the Indonesian Government and the support of the regional Participation Programme. Discussion focused on the concept of the informal sector and its future, on the impact of structural adjustments on women working in the informal sector, and on the strategies to be implemented in order to make such women less vulnerable. Attention was also focused on the consequences of the transition of the countries of Central and Eastern Europe to a market economy. The participants recommended that UNESCO set up a permanent international network, and stressed the need to establish regional networks to work out strategies that were geared to local conditions but appropriate to a macro-economic perspective. A publication will shortly be issue with the assistance of the Indonesian National Commission.
- 25. A regional seminar for Asia was held in Bangalore (India) from 10 to 13 December 1991 for the purpose of integrating women's issues into development strategies. The sheer scale of the informal sector, which encompasses between 50 and 90 per cent of the population in developing countries, and the crucial role it plays, were highlighted.
- 26. A book entitled 'Les femmes dans le développement économique: rendre visible 'invisible' (Women in economic development: making the invisible visible) was published by Berg Publications, with UNESCO's assistance. Its purpose is to alert planners and decision-makers to the importance of integrating women's contribution into development strategies, and to suggest methodologies designed to make better use of their socio-cultural experience and their know-how. Another book is currently being published on 'Poverty in the 1990s: the responses of urban women'. It is a collection of case-studies concerning Zimbabwe, Ghana, Mexico and Costa Rica, Guyana, Peru and Ecuador, the Philippines and India.

C. Education and vocational training

27. The priority given to the education of girls and women in the Programme and Budget for 1994-1995 is apparent, under the general heading of the Programme 'Towards basic education for all', in the project to bring together women occupying positions of responsibility within their communities, in particular in Africa, the Arab countries and South-East Asia, in order to review the legislation, policies and programmes in this area and to devise a worldwide framework of action to promote basic education for girls and women.

1. Literacy and basic training

- 28. An initial assessment of the impact of the Jomtien Conference on basic education for girls and women worldwide reveals a more pronounced interest in this matter. Nevertheless, despite the progress recorded, especially in primary education, the disparities between words and deeds remain flagrant. Very few countries have reported a political commitment to literacy training for girls and women, or have formulated a strategy for the purpose. Successful literacy projects targeted at women have been few and far between. As regards the main sources of funding, these generally continue to disregard literacy training for adult women.
- UNESCO's activities in the field of literacy training for women initially received relatively substantial financial support. Nevertheless, despite the priority that was to be given to them, stringent budget cuts considerably inhibited the implementation of such activities. It was, however, possible to introduce the new dimension of literacy teaching for women, namely. developing their potential by helping them to gain an awareness of their status and of the rights, authority, responsibilities and power of which they are usually dispossessed, by enabling them to acquire greater self-respect and by convincing them of their ability to play a full part in public life. Several activities have, for example, been focused directly on literacy for women: the organization of two seminars at the UNESCO Institute for Education in Hamburg (February and December 1991); pilot projects on literacy teaching for women belonging to ethnic minorities in China and in Viet Nam; a similar project targeted at women living in rural areas in Ecuador, Uganda and Burundi; a regional workshop currently being organized to prepare post-literacy materials intended for women living in rural areas (Tunisia). Action and research schemes have been undertaken in order to ensure that schooling for girls is in future governed less by the social context, particularly in Indonesia, in Ethiopia and in Jamaica, that schooling is more in harmony with the cultures and communities themselves, and that girls positively wish to succeed.
- 30. In addition, case-studies on the enrolment of girls in primary education have been carried out in 14 African countries: Benin, Burkina Faso, Cameroon, Central African Republic, Chad. Guinea, Guinea Bissau, Malawi, Mauritania, Mozambique, Niger, Sierra Leone, Sudan and Togo.
- 31. A publication entitled 'Literacy for rural women in the Third World' has been translated into Arabic and Chinese. A booklet entitled 'Knowing and doing: literacy for women' has been published in English, French, Arabic and Vietnamese.

2. Pan-African Conference on the Education of Girls

32. Organized as a follow-up to the World Conference on Education for All, within the framework of the Priority: Africa programme, with the assistance of the UNESCO/UNICEF Committee for Education, in co-operation with the Government of Burkina Faso, this Conference brought together in Ouagadougou, from 28 March to 1 April 1993, the representatives of 41 countries, and was the first of its kind to be held in Africa. The Ouagadougou Declaration, which amounted to a reasoned defence of high-quality education accessible to all, was adopted, together with a Framework for Action, provision being thereupon made for follow-up activities in many countries. The Ouagadougou Declaration recognizes that 26 million young Africans do not have access to schooling, mainly in rural areas, and that this figure is expected to rise to 36 million by the year 2000. Africa lags behind all other regions, illiteracy rates exceed 60 per cent for women, while rapid population growth cancels out all efforts to reduce the disparities between boys and girls in the education system. Schooling for girls is, however, essential both for expanding production and for developing

health care and reducing prenatal and infant mortality; it is also the pre-condition for lowering the fertility rate. Recalling a priority that has been affirmed in many contexts, in particular in the Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989), the Declaration invites governments to increase the range of their partners, women representatives of the population, traditional chiefs, women's associations and non-governmental organizations with a view to eliminating disparities between boys and girls by the year 2000, by adopting as the primary planning objective in this area the schooling of very young girls as a matter of priority. Teachers should receive appropriate training as part of the normal curriculum. Governments will need to take the necessary measures in order to prevent very young girls from entering domestic service and being thereby denied the opportunity to attend school. Educators will be required to place emphasis on the positive aspects of the cultural, religious and historical heritage in order to improve the quality of teaching. The wives of Heads of State and of ministers and members of parliament should form a pressure group to make schooling for girls compulsory.

33. As regards the Framework for Action, this focuses in particular on the role of the community, on formal and non-formal education, on the need for regional policies, on the specific role of women teachers, on the fate of very young women who become pregnant, on the institutionalization of research, and on the establishment of networks both at international and at regional and national levels. It stresses the need for governments to regard the status and role of women in society as an indivisible whole, attaching particular importance to revising the laws applicable in all areas (status of the family, inheritance law, property law, banking law, labour law), in order to guarantee equal rights for men and women.

3. Scientific and technical education

- 34. UNESCO provided assistance to enable a Zambian woman teacher to attend the 11th International Conference on Chemical Education, held in London in August 1991. The teacher was a member of a working group, organized under UNESCO auspices, to consider the assistance that international agencies and professional associations can provide in this area. In December 1991, UNESCO organized, in collaboration with WISTAR (Women in Science and Technology in the Asian Region) a workshop in Delhi (India) on women's participation in science and technology. The pupils of more than 20 schools located in the disadvantaged neighbourhoods of Delhi and in the region were involved in a project in which women scientists from India, Bangladesh, Pakistan and Sri Lanka served as exemplars of such participation.
- 35. UNESCO contributed to the organization of the sixth meeting on scientific technological and medical education for girls (Accra, Ghana, August 1992). The participants who came from seven African countries (Côte d'Ivoire, Gambia, Ghana, Namibia, Nigeria, Sierra Leone and Togo) sought to identify ways and means of increasing the numbers of girls embarking on a scientific career. A comparable seminar was organized in Tunis (January 1993), and was attended by a specialist from the Ecole Normale Supérieure in Senegal.
- 36. A project is under consideration to improve the technical and vocational qualifications of young people, for the most part girls, in religious schools in Indonesia.
- 37. Two seminars devoted more particularly to environmental protection were organized in Delhi (India) in March 1992. The first was attended by 50 women participants from Bangladesh, Bhutan, India, Nepal, Pakistan and Sri Lanka; the second was attended by 60 participants from ten countries in the region. The specific role of women in matters of environmental protection was highlighted.

4. Higher education and research

- 38. Two networks aimed at promoting women's participation in the management of higher education have been set up for Africa and Asia (in co-operation with the Association of Commonwealth Universities) and Latin America (in co-operation with the Inter-American Organization for Higher Education). The possibility of setting up a European network is being explored.
- 39. Generally speaking, efforts have continued to enhance participation by women in scientific activities. For example, there are many more women participants in training activities in the field of the earth sciences or in the International Geological Correlation Programme, seven of them being project leaders in 1992, as compared with two in 1989. In the marine sciences, out of a total of 2,000 persons taking part in the Organization's activities, the proportion of women is 14 per cent. Specific programmes are devoted to promoting women in the marine sciences (COMAR, PROMAR, TREDMAR), examples being the training of 16 women students on board a floating university, seven women from Central Europe studying for doctorates in Venice, 18 young scientists in Africa and 23 pollution control technicians in Asia.
- 40. Women's participation is higher in Asia, the Pacific, Latin America and Europe than in the other regions. Moreover, there are more women in biology and the marine sciences, with fewer in geology and geography, and far fewer still in physics and mathematics. Five out of seven subventions were granted to women in connection with the activities of the molecular and cell biology network. A special effort is being made in the field of ecology, while in technology and in engineering, priority has been given to activities that concern Africa.
- 41. As regards research, a number of projects relating to resource management and environmental protection have been designed to fit the role devolving on women, a typical example in this respect being the network of biosphere reserves, which requires considerable involvement on the part of grass-roots communities for the purpose of reconciling the need to conserve resources with local development requirements. Another example concerns the urban and suburban environment, in which women play a crucial role, in particular in developing countries. A project launched by the Mayor of Santiago (Chile) Chile's first woman mayor designed to improve the living conditions and circumstances of women in the city's fringe areas has attracted considerable support, above all from mothers with families.
- 42. There would seen to be a significant increase in the numbers of women involved in research activities and in their management, as well as in the spread of scientific knowledge and in ethical debate on the problems posed by science. For example, of the 562 participants attending an international symposium organized at UNESCO Headquarters in March 1992 on 'Cancer, AIDS and society', 170 were women.

III. WOMEN'S PARTICIPATION IN CULTURE AND COMMUNICATION

A. The cultural scene

43. Many women took part in major meetings organized by UNESCO or with its support, as for example the meeting on cultural data bank networks in Europe, expert meetings on the cultural industries in Africa and Asia, a consultative meeting of African publishers, distributors and booksellers, a meeting to evaluate cultural policies in South-East Asia, a meeting to take stock of the cultural dimension of development in Africa, meetings on copyright problems at

the dawn of the twenty-first century, an international seminar on author's rights, etc. In the field of training, UNESCO provided support to enable women to take part in the international training programme organized by France on the design, implementation and evaluation of cultural policies and projects: five women candidates from Central and Eastern European countries applied for the award of the European training certificate in cultural project management.

- 44. In 1992, UNESCO published a work on 'La participation des femmes à la vie culturelle et artistique' (Women's participation in cultural and artistic life), which gathers together a selection of the studies that the Organization has devoted to the topic over the past ten years. The work highlights the fact that women are still a long way from being able to exercise their rights freely in cultural and artistic matters. It also gives an account of UNESCO's efforts to promote the female dimension of cultural development. For instance, the measures taken since the Nairobi Conference to give concrete expression to women's issues have been many and varied, ranging from educational programmes and courses forming part of experimental projects aimed at fostering women's effective participation in cultural life, to the publication of texts showing how women are portrayed in the intellectual and cultural works of the world's different cultures, to various measures designed to ensure that women are better represented in all bodies responsible for research, higher education and educational planning and management.
- 45. The Fez Festival, which has been organized with UNESCO's assistance since 1989 and constitutes a unique event in the Arab world aimed at promoting the role of women in culture, was held for the second time in June 1991 on the theme of 'Arab Women and Creativity', and for the third time, in March 1992, on 'Arab women and fiction'. In the space of a few years, this event has won for itself a considerable following throughout the Maghrib and the Mediterranean region. The third international symposium on 'Writings by Latin American women' took place in Paris from 23 to 25 January 1992. Organized in connection with the commemoration of the Five-Hundredth Anniversary of the Encounter between Two World's. it was attended by 60 women participants, both writers and literary critics.

B. Communication

46. UNESCO provided assistance for the publication of:

a report on Women and communication technologies', based on 13 case-studies carried out in ten countries (Bolivia, Burkina Faso, Canada, Chile, France, Egypt, India, Singapore, Sweden and the United States of America), designed to gauge the impact of these technologies on women;

a report on the media and the female dimension of development.

- 47. UNESCO lent its support for the organization of numerous training courses and workshops, including the following:
 - 12 Indian women professionals were enabled to take part in the second seminar organized in Kampur (India) by the Indian Institute of Technology on 'Asian languages and computer language' (12-16 March 1992);
 - a round table on the problems encountered by women film directors and producers was organized on the occasion of the International Festival held in Karlovy Vary (Czechoslovakia) (9-18 July 1992);

in October 1992, a seminar organized by the Vietnamese News Agency, open to South-East Asian Women journalists, received UNESCO assistance;

a meeting of women television producers organized in Ramotonga (Cook Islands) from 16 to 20 November 1992, under the Pacific Women's Television Exchange Programme;

a workshop organized for Asian women journalists in Kuala Lumpur (Malaysia) under the aegis of the International Federation of Journalists;

in Malawi, a workshop on the use of low-cost technologies in programmes targeting specific audiences, in particular women and young people in rural areas;

the organization by the International Association of Women in Radio and Television in Stockholm (Sweden), from 15 to 19 June 1992, of an international conference on the theme 'People on the move'; this conference provided an opportunity for women in radio to pool their experiences in regard to women migrants and refugees.

- 48. UNESCO assisted the Association de Professionnelles Africaines de la Communication, admitted to category C in 1993, in setting up national associations in southern Africa. It contributed to the establishment of a women's information network in Central America. It also provided support for women's organizations working at the University of the West Indies.
- 49. In order to encourage women working in the media, UNESCO provided assistance for the following: the production of video-films in Cuba; a pilot project set up by three radio/television/video networks (Cook Islands and Fiji) designed to facilitate the exchange of women's television programmes; the production of sketches featuring women's liberation struggles in the Caribbean; the production of video cassettes aimed at national minorities in Viet Nam; and videos on 'Women and national development' in collaboration with UNIFEM.
- 50. The evaluation of communication activities on behalf of women carried out during the past decade (1981-1991), together with decision 4.2.1 adopted by the Executive Board at its 139th session, have led to a reorganization of these activities. This priority task, assigned to a women staff member of the Communauté Francophone de Belgique seconded to the Communication Division, is aimed at integrating women into production, exchange and training projects and schemes to establish or strengthen existing networks. This should be facilitated through collaboration involving various organizations belonging to the United Nations system, certain donor countries, other international organizations and the media themselves.

IV. INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION AND CO-OPERATION WITH MEMBER STATES

51. Every year, UNESCO submits its contribution to the report by the United Nations Secretary-General on the system-wide implementation of the 'Nairobi Forward-Looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women'. In February 1993, it contributed to the Secretary-General's report on the implementation of the 'System-Wide Medium-Term Plan for Women and Development', covering the period 1990-1995, which was discussed at the 37th session of the Commission on the Status of Women, held in Vienna on 15 and 16 March 1993, to which UNESCO sent a representative.

- 52. At the United Nations/Organization of the Islamic Conference (OIC) Sectoral Meeting on Basic Education and Training, held in Jeddah on 17 and 18 May 1992, UNESCO and the Islamic Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (ISESCO) were assigned the task of preparing a document on pilot projects relating to 'the education of girls and women in Islamic countries, with special attention to their participation in literacy and vocational training programmes: Pakistan, Yemen and Burkina Faso'. This document was discussed at the meeting of focal points of the lead agencies of the United Nations system and of the Organization of the Islamic Conference, in Geneva, from 27 to 29 October 1992. UNESCO recommended a number of consultants to ISESCO for the implementation phase of the project, and is currently pursuing its consultations with that organization for the purpose of carrying out the activities identified.
- 53. Women's issues feature prominently in the work of the National Commissions for UNESCO. Many Commissions are currently headed by women, and virtually all have a section dealing with questions relating to the status of women. All meetings organized by the National Commissions have included the issue on their agendas, in-depth reflection leading to proposals for innovative action having been a feature in particular of the meetings of the Commissions of Asia and the Pacific, in December 1992, and of the European Commissions, in April 1993.
- 54. The movement of UNESCO Clubs, Centres and Associations, which in 1993 boasts over 4,000 members in more than 110 countries, plays a considerable role in alerting the public to the need to improve the status of women, while at the same time carrying out activities designed to promote their status. There are many UNESCO Clubs particularly in Africa, Asia and the Arab States that celebrate International Women's Day by organizing public events such as conferences, round tables and exhibitions, securing media coverage so as to enhance the impact of their action. As was the case in Morocco, events have been organized in women's associations and centres in order to foster dialogue among their members. More generally, it is worth pointing to the increase in the proportion of women members in UNESCO Clubs, and to the fact that more women than in the past have taken on positions of responsibility in these Clubs. All-female Clubs have been established, particularly in rural areas, while in Bulgaria, for example, a women artists' and intellectuals' club is currently endeavouring to promote a more accurate and positive image of women's role in culture and the transmission of values.
- An original form of consciousness-raising was adopted by the UNESCO Clubs in Bamako (Mali), whose women's sports teams competed for the UNESCO Fair-Play Cup for football, a traditionally male sport. The final was held on International Women's Day, in order to demonstrate by example the role that women and girls can play in eliminating violence from sports stadia. It is in the field of education that activities have attracted most attention: the National Federation of UNESCO Associations in Japan singled out illiterate women living in rural areas as one of the priority target categories of its wide-ranging scheme under the UNESCO Co-action Learning Centres programme. The latter provides financial assistance for 86 literacy projects in 41 countries covering all continents. In Rajasthan (India), a UNESCO Association has set up, in a disadvantaged neighbourhood, a Centre for non-formal education at which some 40 women are receiving basic education, while sewing and knitting centres are enabling approximately 100 girls and women to acquire training and at the same time to engage in income-generating activities. The Togolese Federation of UNESCO Associations and Clubs has selected the improvement of women's living and working conditions as one of its major objectives; it is organizing a women's co-operative in one of the country's farming regions aimed in particular at developing cotton-related work. Similar objectives lie at the heart of the action of the Senegalese Federation, which numbers among its members several UNESCO women's clubs situated in rural areas, set up for the purpose of developing literacy and general training for women.

- 56. Established in order to improve the status of refugees from Liberia and Sierra Leone in a camp in Guinea, one UNESCO Club set itself as a priority task the provision of literacy and vocational training for women; it also organized several home economics and health education courses for the women and girls living in the camp, and built up a library that has rapidly become a valuable source of post-literacy materials.
- 57. Under the Participation Programme in 1992-1993, 78 out of 2,467 requests presented by Member States were aimed at improving the status of women, representing 3.16 per cent of the total. Of these 78 requests, 47 (that is, 60 per cent) were approved, for a total amount of \$587.200. Although these requests emanated from 50 countries, the situation was deemed to be most unsatisfactory by the Executive Board, which at its 141st session considered it 'desirable for Member States to ensure that at least 25 per cent of their requests under the Participation Programme be for activities aimed at the promotion of women', an objective that it will be possible to attain only in the medium term.

V. REPRESENTATION OF WOMEN IN THE SECRETARIAT

- With a view to developing a policy capable of making considerable improvements in the situation of women in the Secretariat of the Organization, the Director-General set up during the previous biennium an Ad Hoc Working Group on Equal Opportunities for Women in UNESCO's Secretariat, assigning it the task of studying recruitment conditions, careers. working conditions and staff training as well as any form of discrimination that might be based on sex. Established on 17 December 1990, the Ad Hoc Working Group has had its mandate renewed until 31 December 1993, and its terms of reference have been broadened. It is required in particular 'to submit ... a plan of action, with detailed objectives and reasonable targets, for the achievement of equality within the Secretariat, and also the procedures and timetables for its implementation'. One of the new areas upon which the Ad Hoc Group is required to reflect is that of sexual harassment, concerning which a statement of principle making it clear that certain types of behaviour will not be tolerated, and outlining the responsibilities of staff members, is to be prepared. Attention is, moreover, specially focused on the recruitment of women, in particular to positions of responsibility. Likewise, the study of the problems involved in ensuring that administrative language is non-sexist is to be pursued. in association with the Co-ordinating Unit for Activities relating to Women.
- 59. A study on the career patterns of UNESCO women staff members was carried out in May 1993 by a Swedish specialist, seconded to UNESCO by her government. The study brings out a significant difference between the respective career patterns of men and women within the Secretariat: whereas 62 per cent of the men recruited according to the same criteria women between 1961 and 1977 have reached the grade of P-5, only 9 per cent of the women have received the same promotion. A new study should be undertaken on the establishment of a programme that will guarantee equal opportunities for women and men within the Secretariat.
- 60. An increase should be noted in the proportion of women in the Professional category and above, which rose from 26.6 per cent as at 30 May 1991 to 28.8 per cent as at 30 June 1993. The proportion had risen from 22.9 per cent as at 31 December 1986 to 26.6 per cent is 30 May 1991, but it already stood at 23.3 per cent as at 31 December 1984. UNESCO has made considerable progress in the matter of appointments of women to decision-making posts more than 10 per cent of posts at D-1 level and above are currently occupied by women, a percentage that is higher than that obtaining in the United Nations, where the figure is 7.28 per cent.

ANNEX II

B. Transverse Themes, Programmes and Activities²

Transverse Themes, Programmes and Activities

11.1 Women³

The General Conference,

Referring to 26 C/Resolution 11.1 and reaffirming the inclusion of women as a priority target group in UNESCO's Programme and Budget for 1994-1995 (27 C/5),

Taking due note of the fact that relevant resolutions coming within the transverse theme 'Women' have been submitted and adopted on important matters pertaining to women in all the fields of competence of UNESCO,

Taking account of the recommendations and conclusions arising from the first review and appraisal of the implementation of the Nairobi Forward-Looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women to the Year 2000 (E/1990/15),

Considering also the importance of UNESCO's preparation for and participation in the United Nations Fourth World Conference on Women: Action for Equality, Development and Peace (Beijing, 1995),

Emphasizing the need, within UNESCO, to strengthen the programme relating to women in all the Organization's fields of competence and to dedicate to this end the necessary human and budgetary resources and the necessary structures,

Recognizing that physical, mental and emotional violence against women worldwide causes distress and affects women and children in all walks of life, particularly those in the informal sector, families and individual women in processes such as that of migration, in the context of the fast-changing global economy,

Recognizing further the contribution made by women in the informal sector, which comprises between 50 and 90 per cent of the general population in developing countries, and their growing vulnerability within that sector,

- 1. Resolution adopted on the report of Commission V at the thirty-first plenary meeting, on 15 November 1993.
- 2. As regards the UNESCO Publishing Office and the UNESCO Courier Office, see resolution 13.21, 'UNESCO's policies regarding public information and publications'.
- 3. Resolution adopted on the report of Commission I at the twenty-seventh plenary meeting, on 12 November 1993.

- Reiterating the accepted truth that the human being, woman or man, is the centre of human resource development, which is an effort to enlarge people's choices by increasing their capabilities and reducing their vulnerabilities,
- Emphasizing that UNESCO should be the lead Specialized Agency of the United Nations system particularly well suited to develop, in collaboration with other agencies, strategies at all levels involving the social, cultural and economic aspects of the life of women in the informal sector.
- Noting the trend towards the casualization and informalization of labour and the violence likely to be bred by such processes,

I

- 1. Draws the attention of the World Conference on Women (Beijing, 1995) to the increasing vulnerability of women in the informal sector and the fact that their numbers are steadily growing;
- 2. Invites the Director-General to:
 - (a) take further cognizance of these trends and propose measures to ameliorate this fragile situation and to act as a catalyst for the dissemination of awareness of the deteriorating condition of women;
 - (b) continue his work of strengthening the international network for research and action on the role of women in the informal sector;
 - (c) reinforce the work, in conjunction with other United Nations agencies and donor organizations, through training workshops and other means, of creating networks at regional levels;
 - (d) devise new educational content and strategies for education and training suitable for the target group of women working in the informal sector;
 - (e) include in UNESCO's contribution to the World Conference on Women (Beijing, 1995) a report on research and action undertaken in the above areas;
- 3. Further Invites the Director-General to organize a high-level consultation of government experts and decision-makers within the Organization's spheres of competence as an interdisciplinary and intersectoral approach to the preparation of UNESCO's contribution to the Beijing Conference, and recommends that US \$200,000 be allotted to this end from the savings achieved through the reduction in staff costs;
- 4. Recommends to the World Conference, through the Director-General, that it devise a framework for international co-operation that includes action:
 - (a) to collect, disseminate and share information, and arrange for regular meetings for consultation, in order to increase exchanges on policies, programmes and experience among women working in the informal sector;
 - (b) to encourage the establishment of regional and subregional forums with a high level of participation by NGOs from developing countries and to exchange knowledge and expertise;
 - (c) to provide facilities for the training of decision-makers, planners and those responsible for women's programmes and concerns in relevant aspects of informal-sector activities and in gender awareness;
 - (d) to invite UNESCO, other United Nations agencies and donors to seek funding for an international network for research and action concerning the role and status of women in a changing socio-economic situation;
 - (e) to organize an international symposium under the auspices of UNESCO to make planners aware of the various aspects of the issues of women working in the informal sector, as a central concern of human resource development;
- Requests that UNESCO's World Education Report (1995) focus on all aspects of girls' and women's education and training worldwide, duly reflecting education within all the spheres of competence of UNESCO;

II

- 6. Requests the Director-General:
 - (a) under the transverse theme 'Women' (27 C/5, para, 11108, Major Programme Area V), to continue the study undertaken in accordance with 141 EX/Decision 9.3, on 'The use of rape as a tool of war its causes and consequences', and that, in view of the situation in

- Bosnia and Herzegovina, its focus be on a rehabilitation plan, to be prepared in cooperation with the WHO and UNICEF, for Bosnian women who have been the victims of systematic rape and for their children;
- (b) to facilitate hands-on training for refugee women in order to enable them to become active agents in solving problems pertaining to refugees;
- 7. Also requests the Director-General to promote studies on 'women and peace';
- 8. Invites Member States and National Commissions, in particular the focal points of National Commissions or other institutions concerned with the improvement of the status of women, including the transverse theme 'Women' and women's concerns in all major programme areas:
 - (a) to promote knowledge and understanding of the instruments relating to women's rights, to disseminate them and translate them into national and local languages and further their inclusion in curricula, textbooks and other teaching materials;
 - (b) to promote research and comparative studies on the legal and religious aspects of women's rights in all regions, e.g. in university co-operation programmes, by networking in relation with the UNITWIN and UNESCO chairs programme;
- 9. Invites the Director-General:
 - (a) to ensure that from 1994 onwards all updated editions of UNESCO publications related to human-rights teaching, peace and international education contain information and knowledge about existing instruments relating to women's rights, in particular, the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women;
 - (b) to prepare and disseminate:
 - (i) an informative synthesis of UNESCO's normative instruments pertaining to women;
 - (ii) information about the mandate and procedures of access to the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations in dealing with questions relating to violation of women's rights in UNESCO's fields of competence;

Ш

10. Requests the Director-General to ensure that women benefit from and participate in all programmes related to communication and to promote in particular their access to new technologies, and to include the issues of institutional safeguards for women in the media in the agenda of the pre-Beijing international seminar on 'Women and the media';

IV

- 11. Invites the Director-General, in the programme for the 1994-1995 period, to strengthen the autonomous co-ordinating unit reporting to the Director-General with sufficient financial and human resources to enable it to carry the overall responsibility for co-ordinating issues relating to women, including the dissemination of information, working in close co-operation with co-ordinators appointed by the programme sectors, Regional Offices and National Commissions;
- 12. Calls upon the Director-General to prepare an in-depth inquiry and implement through a proposed plan of action a strategy that will enable equal career opportunities to be established for women and men within the Secretariat, at the level of both norms and practice, and invites Member States to present to this end female candidates for posts in the Secretariat;
- 13. Supports strongly the Director-General's proposal that he form a consultative committee, under his chairmanship, with the task of formulating new strategies, thereby building the gender dimension into the analysis of all issues within the fields of competence of UNESCO, working in close co-operation with the co-ordinating unit;
- 1-1. Requests the consultative committee to be set up by the Director-General to report at every session of the Executive Board on UNESCO's preparatory activities for the Beijing Conference;
- 15. Further invites the Director-General to request the proposed consultative committee. In co-operation with the autonomous co-ordinating structure for these issues within UNESCO, to examine amongst other matters:

- (a) the adoption of policy guidelines on gender equality for use in the preparation of plans, programmes and projects for all UNESCO's major programme areas, transverse themes and transverse programmes;
- (b) the preparation of a gender-sensitive monitoring system so as to facilitate the monitoring of participation of women:
 - (i) as agents, both quantitatively and qualitatively (in what fields and at what levels, including decision-making levels);
 - (ii) as beneficiaries, in all the fields of competence of UNESCO and at all levels;
- 16. Urges Member States to ensure that the necessary number of women-specific projects is submitted in order to enable full utilization of the 25 per cent of the Participation Programme earmarked for women as recommended by the Executive Board (141 EX/Decision 4.1, para. 13);

٧

17. Notes that activities for women have often been cut, as stated in document 27 C.3. paragraph 17, and therefore urges the Director-General to do his utmost to ensure that the activities planned for women in the Programme and Budget for 1994-1995 are implemented for the full benefit of women;

VI

18. Invites the Director-General to strengthen his efforts in developing multi-agency projects for women with the UNDP and other financial institutions, such as the World Bank.

11.2 The least-developed countries¹

The General Conference,

Considering the Executive Board's recommendations on the Draft Programme and Budget for 1994-1995 (27 C/6) requesting, in paragraph 9, that the least-developed-countries priority group be made the subject in document 27 C/5 of a transverse theme,

Noting with satisfaction that the Executive Board has emphasized the need to build up the Least Developed Countries Unit and to renew the 26 C/5 budget appropriation,

Welcoming the proposals made by the Director-General in document 27 C/5 Rev.1 Add. to increase the means of the Organization for its programme activities benefiting these countries.

Noting the decision by the General Assembly of the United Nations to carry out a mid-term evaluation, in 1995, of the activities undertaken in the bodies and Specialized Agencies of the system as a whole,

Decides to include the LDCs under transverse themes, programmes and activities.

ANNEX III

UNESCO

IMPLEMENTATION OF 141 EX/DECISION 9.3 OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD AND RESOLUTION 27 C/11.1.II.6 OF THE TWENTY-SEVENTH SESSION OF THE GENERAL CONFERENCE:

THE USE OF RAPE AS A TOOL OF WAR

"The use of rape as a tool of war - its causes and consequences! - and that, in view of the situation in Bosnia and Herzegovina, its focus be on a rehabilitation plan, to be prepared in co-operation with the WHO and UNICEF, for Bosnian women who have been victims of systematic rape and their children».

CO-ORDINATION UNIT FOR ACTIVITIES RELATIVE TO WOMEN

SUMMARY

General Considerations	(paragraphs	I	to	VI
------------------------	-------------	---	----	----

ı.		national law and rape in war-time agraphs)		
	A. B.	From silence to recognition The qualification of systematic rape in Bosnia-Herzegovina as a crime against	1-4	
	c.	humanity International Tribunal of War Crimes	5-8 9-16	
II.		es of the use of rape as a tool of war osnia-Herzegovina		
	A. B.	The construction of a culture of hate The destruction of the «Other»	17-23 24- 29	
III.	 Characteristics of the use of rape as a tool of war and consequences for individuals, groups and community 			
	Α.	Disclosure and psychosomatic consequences of silence for the		
	B.	victims Consequences for the family and the community	30 - 39 40 - 42	
IV.	Concl	lusions and Recommendations		
	A. B. C.	Preserving the collective memory Fulfilling the duty of justice Action for peace taking into account the specific aspects of the conflict	43-50 51-59	
	D.	in former Yugoslavia Conditions and modalities of assistance to victims of	60-63	
	E.	sex crimes Priority action: Programme for teenage girls in refugee camps, or	64-69	
		displaced	70-76	

GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS

- I. By Resolution 11.1 approved by the twenty-seventh session of the UNESCO General Conference, the Director-General was invited to continue the study undertaken in conformity with Decision 141 EX/9.3 of the Executive Board on "The use of rape as a tool of war its causes and consequences' and that, in view of the situation in Bosnia and Herzegovina, its focus be on a rehabilitation plan to be prepared in co-operation with the WHO and UNICEF for Bosnian women who have been the victims of systematic rape and for their children".
- II. To this end, consultations took place with authorities responsible for refugees, the UNICEF Office in Zagreb (Croatia), representatives of associations and qualified persons having been directly involved with the victims of rape. On the initiative of the President of the Permanent Standing Committee of Non-Governmental Organizations to UNESCO, consultations were also undertaken with representatives of associations and an ad hoc group of non-governmental organizations was set up.
- III. A Working Group met at UNESCO Headquarters on 23 and 24 June 1994. The participants were psychotherapists, psychoanalysts, anthropologists, historians and lawyers from Bosnia-Herzegovina, Croatia, Serbia, as well as from France. Observers from Permanent Delegations to UNESCO and non-governmental organizations attended the meeting. The discussions and reflections of this two-day meeting have largely contributed to this report.
- IV. Beyond establishing the facts, as noted by the International Community and in particular by the Report sent to the European Community of Foreign Ministers on the treatment of Muslim women in the former Yugoslayia by the investigating mission of the European Community, as well as the Report on the situation of human rights in the territory of the former Yugoslavia presented to the Commission on Human Rights of the United Nations, in application of the Commission's Resolution 1992/S-1/1 of 14 August 1992, and the Final Report of the Commission of Experts established in accordance with Resolution 780

See Annex 1: Decision 141 EX/9.3 and Resolution 11.1 of the Twenty-seventh session of the General Conference.

See Annex 2: List of participants.

Report submitted to the Secretary-General of the United Nations by the Representative of Denmark to the United Nations representing the Presidence of the European Community and by reference to para.4 of Resolution 798 (1992) of the Security Council Conference (reference S/25240, 3 February 1993).

Reference E/CN4/1993 (10 February 1993)(Mazowiecki Report).

(1992) of the Security Council 5 , the aim of the working group was to bring to light the real consequences - human, legal and political - of the sexual crimes committed in Bosnia-Herzegovina in order to enable a plan of action to be drawn up that would take these different aspects into account.

The Commission of Experts established by the Security v. Council identified by name nearly 800 victims and some 1500 aggressors of whom 600 have been identified . But the aggressors of whom 600 have been identified 6. But the acts committed between the autumn of 1991 and the end of 1993, with particular frequency from April to November 1992, are far more numerous, the figure of 20,000 having been suggested. It is in any case difficult to give a precise figure as the victims were, in 80 per cent of the cases, prisoners in the hands of their torturers and very often they underwent repeated rape, particularly in places set aside for this purpose. It must be stated that the term "victim" should be applied not only to those who suffered rape and sexual assault, but also to those who witnessed these crimes and who often had family ties with or were neighbours of the first victims. The question of their number was deliberately left out of this report precisely because of the specific character of these crimes, the circumstances in which they were committed and the extreme difficulty faced by the victims in making themselves known, for the reasons inherent in the characteristics of rape which shall be developed in this report, and for fear of retaliation.

VI. The variations in these figures does not alter the characteristics of the crimes perpetrated but these figures do have an importance. They could serve, as in other conflicts, as an opening for revisionist theories that try and will continue to try, to deny the reality of systematic and widespread rape. The UNESCO Executive Board decision and the General Conference resolution thus enable UNESCO to contribute to the efforts of the international community to show the true extent of the use of rape as a tool of war with a view to identifying modalities of prevention and education of the foundations of peace, namely the recognition and respect of the dignity of women and of all human beings.

Bassiouni Report, paras. 232 to 253.

Reference S/1994/674 (27 May 1994). The five-member Commission, first presided by Professor Frits Kalshoven was, after his resignation, presided by Professor Cherif Bassiouni (Bassiouni Report).

My sleep is very light, it is a veil

It is an intense pleasure, physical, inexpressible, to be at home, among friendly people and to have so many things to recount: but I cannot help noticing that my listeners do not follow me. In fact, they are completely indifferent: they speak confusedly of other things among themselves, as if I was not there. My sister looks at me, gets up and goes away without a word.

A desolating grief is now born in me, like certain barely remembered pains of one's early infancy. It is pain in the certain and the certain barely remembered pains of one's early infancy.

in its pure state, not tempered by a sense of reality and by the intrusion of extraneous circumstances, a pain like

that which makes children cry; «

Primo Levi, If This is a Man, Abacus, London, 1987.

I. INTERNATIONAL LAW AND RAPE IN WAR-TIME

A. FROM SILENCE TO RECOGNITION

- 1. Sexual violence inflicted on women is historically inseparable from the passions unleashed by war. Rape of women has been and still is commonly presented as an ordinary fact of life in every war. Even the most enlightened expressions of public opinion contain the conviction that rape is a form of instinctual excess dating back to the beginning of time, a debt that has to be paid by the conquered city or village and that forms part of the warrior's reward and recreation.
- 2. It should be remembered that from the First World War, the rape of women was used systematically as an arm of war and propaganda. This practice aimed at provoking terror among the civil population. The Enquiry Commission of the Allied Armies established the facts. But once the war was over, the accusation of this crime, seen as "the easiest to make and the most difficult to prove" was refuted: tales of rape were silenced in the interest of everyone except the women who had been raped. This phenomenon occurred also during the Second World War.
- 3. However, the Nuremberg Charter drawn up in London on 8 October 1945 by France, Great Britain, the Soviet Union and the United States of America does not mention rape as a war crime, whereas the Tokyo Tribunal installed by decision of the Commander-in-Chief of the Occupational Forces in Japan on 19 January 1946 established it as a war crime.
- 4. To qualified sexual crimes (rape, sexual torture and brutality), should be added the institutionalisation of prostitution. In line with the official doctrine that troops should be supervised and satisfied at all times, recreation zones have been made available to American soldiers. To date, this form of sexual persecution is still the subject of claims by associations of victims.

B. THE QUALIFICATION OF SYSTEMATIC RAPE IN BOSNIA-HERZEGOVINA AS A CRIME AGAINST HUMANITY

5. Inquiries conducted in former Yugoslavia at first raised the question as to whether rape occurring during the course of hostilities was a "by-product of war", but it was observed, particularly as far as the Serb attacks against Muslim localities and villages were concerned, that rape had been systematic, that it had been committed by order of higher authorities and under their supervision; that it had thus been used as a tool of war seeking to make the inhabitants leave their homes and clearly falling into the

framework of an expansionist strategy. Collective rape was thus an integral part of the policy of "ethnic cleansing" carried out by the Serb forces in Bosnia-Herzegovina .

- 6. It is clear that violence, including rape and sexual brutality, was committed by the fighters belonging to all parties in the conflict but the conclusions drawn by the observers, and in particular the experts sent by the United Nations, are clear: it was the Bosnian Serbs, supported by their co-believers, who made systematic use of terror in order to chase non-Serb populations from these territories in what they themselves called "ethnic cleansing".
- 7. In a letter dated 24 May 1994 to the Security Council, the Secretary-General of the United Nations, transmitting the Report by the Commission of Experts , wrote: «The ... ethnic cleansing and rape and sexual assault, in particular, have been carried out by some of the parties so systematically that they strongly appear to be the product of a policy...».
- 8. The interpretation and qualification of the facts themselves leave hardly any doubt in the case of sexual crimes committed in Bosnia-Herzegovina by the Serbian forces. "Many more seem to be part of an overall pattern whose characteristics include: ... simultaneous commission of other international humanitarian law violations; simultaneous military activity; simultaneous activity to displace civilian populations, common elements in the commission of rape, maximizing shame and humiliation to not only the victim, but also the victim's community; and the timing of rapes" . "These patterns strongly suggest" added the United Nations experts 1, "that a systematic rape policy existed in certain areas. It is clear that some level of organization and group activity was required to carry out many of the alleged rapes... rape and sexual assault should be examined in the context of the practice of "ethnic cleansing".

C. INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNAL OF WAR CRIMES

9. Faced with the magnitude of the crimes affecting men as well as women on a large scale, the Security Council deemed it to be the case that these "generalised violations of international humanitarian law" notably the massive killings and the pursuit of "ethnic cleansing", constituted a threat to international peace and security and declared that it was determined to put an end to such crimes and to

cf. Mazowiecki Report, paras. 82-89.

cf. Bassiouni Report.

cf. Bassiouni Report, para. 252

cf. Bassiouni Report, para. 253

take effective steps so that those responsible would be brought to justice. To this end, it decided to create the International Tribunal of War Crimes whose competence would extend to all "...persons responsible for serious violations of international humanitarian law committed in the territory of the former Yugoslavia since 1991..."

The International Tribunal of War Crimes has the power to prosecute grave breaches of the Geneva Conventions of 1949 13, violations of laws and customs of war and a crimes against humanity and, in particular, the crime of genocide 16, "whether the guilty had committed them directly or not, that it had been heard that they had the intention to commit them, that they had or not directly and publicly incited them to be committed, that they had attempted to commit them or lastly that they had been an accessory".

- 10. The creation of the ad hoc International Tribunal of War Crimes in the former Yugoslavia in 1991 the ITWC reflects a major step in the evolution of the conscience of nations as regards the problem of rape.
- 11. Whereas the Nuremberg Tribunal does not mention rape, and the Tokyo Tribunal considers rape as a war crime, the ITWC considers rape as a crime against humanity: "Crimes against humanity refer to inhumane acts of a very serious nature, such as wilful killing, torture or rape, committed as part of a widespread or systematic attack against any civilian population" (Art.4, para.45, of the ITWC Statutes).
- 12. Rape is specifically cited among the acts constituting crimes against humanity that the Tribunal will have to obtain knowledge of, namely "crimes against humanity of an extreme gravity, such as genocide, torture or rape committed in the framework of a generalized or systematic attack against the civil population with intent to destroy, in whole or in part, a national, ethnic, racial or religious group!" (Article 4 of the Statutes)
- 13. The attitude adopted by the international courts and its importance in individual cases as well as in principle should be emphasized here.
- 14. Until today, the implementation of humanitarian international law, apart from the exceptional case of

See Annex 3: Statutes of the International Tribunal on War Crimes (Article 1).

Article 2 of the Statutes.

Article 3 of the Statutes.

¹⁵ Article 5 of the Statutes.

Article 4 of the Statutes.

Article 5 (f. g, i) of the Statutes.

Article 4 (1) of the Statutes.

crimes committed during the Second World War, is still the responsibility of national tribunals and moreover it is before the latter that the indefeasibility of crimes against humanity was first affirmed in an interpretation of the agreements of London of 8 August 1945 instituting the Nuremberg Tribunal. But the conditions for exercising this kind of international justice are rarely obtained following a conflict, and are not at all present in former Yugoslavia where the conflict is continuing. The creation of the International Tribunal of War Crimes to decide on punishment for the crimes committed in the Yugoslav conflict since 1991 is therefore a major event. If the Tribunal is ultimately able to fulfil its mandate effectively there is no doubt that its decisions will make law, and no doubt that, in other circumstances, international justice will be invoked.

- 15. Today numerous voices are being raised, asking for an international jurisdiction to be set up to judge the crime of genocide perpetrated in Rwanda in 1994.
- 16. Is "humanity", against which these crimes are committed, aware that it is now at a decisive turning point. Either it will find in itself the strength to oppose the process of destruction at work in more and more regions or it will undergo a phenomenon of regression wherein, in an initial stage, vast territories will be abandoned to themselves and will then sink into lawlessness.

II. CAUSES OF THE USE OF RAPE AS A TOOL OF WAR IN BOSNIA-HERZEGOVINA

A. THE CONSTRUCTION OF A CULTURE OF HATE

- 17. A whole analysis is needed of the process of the brainwashing of a population, in order to understand the mechanisms that led to the unleashing of violence on a scale considered to be no longer possible in Europe since the horrors of the Second World War and the catchphrase «Never again» that the victorious nations seemed to have made their own.
- 18. It is in the depths of history that the origins of human conflicts must be sought. It is as if humanity were to be pursued by its past well beyond its efforts to build a society organized in accordance with the rules to protect the rights of peoples and of communities. In the former Yugoslavia, nationalistic feelings, fomented by ambitions at a time of crisis when the institutions inherited from national communism were unable to withstand changes in Central and Eastern Europe, were like salt rubbed into an unseen but open wound.

- 19. Serbia, one of the oldest nations of the continent, independent from 1180 and having reached the height of its power in the XIVth century, came under Ottoman rule following the defeat of Kosovo Polje in 1389. It did not gain its freedom again until the XIXth century and its full independence was re-established only in 1878 with the first Congress of Berlin. Championing the liberation of the Southern Slavs, it gradually enlarged its boundaries by occupying most of Macedonia following the two Balkan wars of 1912-1913. Then in 1918 it formed the «Kingdom of Serbs, Croatians and Slovenians» to which Slovenia and Bosnia-Herzegovina asked to be attached, according to a historical vulgate that is now contested 19, before becoming the Kingdom of Yugoslavia in 1931, under King Alexander I. It is this country that, in 1946, became the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia which thereafter strove to maintain a balance among the republics of Bosnia-Herzegovina, Croatia, Macedonia, Montenegro, Serbia and Slovenia. With Communism and its atheist doctrine, religious problems appear to be papered over, even if the influence of the Serbian Orthodox hierarchy never really waned. Few were those who could still discern on the map, as so many signs of a tragic destiny, the former frontiers of the Western and Eastern Empires opposing Roman and Orthodox Catholics and the former frontiers of the Austro-Hungarian Empire and the Ottoman Empire opposing Christians and Muslims: Yugoslavia, this «mixture» of peoples and communities appeared more as a cross-roads than as a place for future inexpiable confrontation.
- The end of Communism brought hopes for political democracy, hopes that were partially fulfilled - including Serbia. Nevertheless, «nationalitarian» problems (pertaining to nationalism and totalitarianism) soon came to the fore, in particular when the Serbs decided, at the beginning of the 1980s, that the autonomous region of Kosovo was gradually escaping from their influence. Kosovo, in their view, was the heart of Serbia and its civilisation, with its many churches and famous monasteries; many had difficulty admitting that it was progressively becoming the homeland of non-Serbs, close to the Albanians who were mostly Muslim. The high birth-rate of the Albanian community of Kosovo, the low birth-rate of Serbs and the migration to Belgrade of numerous Serbs, meant that the latter now represented a very low percentage of the population, hardly 10 percent, just when there was the prospect of democracy giving effective power to the majority which up to now had never been the case. The government in Belgrade put a brutal end to the autonomy of

See, for example: « La Croatie et la creation de l'Etat yougoslave » (Croatia and the creation of the State of Yugoslavia) thesis presented at the University of Geneva by Jasua Koulischer-Adler in 1994. At the end of the war, in 1918, many future Yugoslavs would in any case have preferred the setting up of a confederal or multinational State.

Kosovo. Since then a **policy of Serbianisation at any price** has been implemented, most notably by the prohibition of the Albanian language and culture, with very serious violations of human rights that have been regularly noted by non-governmental organizations for the last ten years 20

21. This policy of all out «Serbianisation» has been carried out since the beginning of the 1980s. This has been accompanied, especially in the media controlled by the Belgrade government, by a catastrophic approach to the demographic situation as if the survival of a certain notion of Serbia was being seriously challenged. Without doubt it is in the light of this deep fear as well as that of other motives that will be presented in this report that the following phenomenon, which stupified and appalled international public opinion, should be seen: in a certain number of camps where women were kept as prisoners to be raped day after day , the rapists did not hesitate to say that their aim was to make these women pregnant so that they would give birth to a Serb child. Women were in fact kept in the camps until such time that their pregnancy was too advanced for abortion to be possible. If they did not become pregnant, an examination took place and the doctors were instructed to see if they had a contraceptive diaphragm; if this was not the case, an investigation took place, to which the rapists were convened, to find out if the women had been able to obtain condoms. These practices were also developed outside the camps, in the villages: a woman was kept prisoner by her neighbour - a soldier - for six months. She was raped almost daily by 3 or 4 soldiers who told her that she would give birth to a little Christian who would kill Muslims when he grew up and who kept repeating that it was their President who had told them to do this 22. This unbelievable regression of the . This unbelievable regression of the human spirit goes back to antiquity when people thought like Aristotle - that the male was the only true source of life and that woman was only "the oven where the bread was baked». It had other tragic consequences; many of these women who had been raped, if they had been unable to end their pregnancy, did not want to see their child at birth and abandoned it.

22. To this Serbian fear another "proof" was gradually added: Bosnian Muslims would be only instruments of Islamism in this part of Europe and, after having asserted that "Muslim Bosnia does not in fact exist", that "(Muslims) have no territory, no population, no effective power in the real sense of the word, which constitutes the basic elements of a state", Radovan Karadzic added:

²² Ibid.

See, for example, the appropriate section in each Annual Report of Amnesty International

of Bassiouni Report, para. 248.

"because (the Muslims) have the ambition to dominate all of Bosnia, and perhaps even the obligation towards certain of their allies, to put all of Bosnia at the service of certain Islamic interests in Europe, which led to this war and to its continuation", not hesitating to state: "the profound ideal (of Muslims in Yugoslavia) is to be Turkish"

23. It would seem that this is the mental background of the players in the reduction of Bosnia-Herzegovina who see themselves as outraged defenders of a besieged citadel. It is this Manichaean view of reality that unceasingly feeds the cruelty of the combatants in a war that is both civil and international.

B. THE DESTRUCTION OF THE OTHER

- 24. In many of its aspects, the violence that was unleashed in former Yugoslavia was aimed at wiping out the identity of the «Other»; in this respect the systematic destruction, on all fronts, of cultural property and places of worship was significant. The target was the symbol of the other's presence.
- 25. The sexual violence, in which the Serbs indulged in Bosnia as part of the policy of ethnic cleansing, did however represent an additional step towards the negation of the «Other» and cannot at all be seen to be an inevitable misfortune of war but as a psychological weapon designed to create a vacuum in face of the invader as surely as, and perhaps more effectively than, fire arms. It was the identities of the victims and of the community that formed the target and that was sought to be destroyed.
- 26. At the individual level, the humiliations inflicted on women, men and children, mostly in public and with wideranging cruelty, were evidently aimed at disturbing their sense of being human when they were not subjected to mutilation that marked them physically for life. The fact that such maltreatment was usually the work of the victims' neighbours, childhood friends or children who had been to the same school, could only confuse their minds, their world view, forever: it would seem that this was the conscious will of their torturers.

[«] La Bosnie un enjeu tragique » (Bosnia, a tragic struggle) published by l'Age de l'homme.

Lausanne, 1994. In this pamphlet R. Karadzic, President of the « Serb Republic of Bosnia », talks to journalists from the Tanjug Agency, Belgrade.

Not only have men not been spared, but they were made to rape women, to perform sexual acts with their companions or their guards, some having been circumcised, emasculated or had their genitals mutilated in various ways (cf. Bassiouini Report, para, 235).

- 27. At the family level, the sexual maltreatment often affected the whole family. Rape was or is carried out in front of the entire family, it concerns successively all the members of the family and in some cases old women were raped «in front of all the inhabitants of the village» others in the presence of younger sisters or their children all with the complicity of the «local authorities» or the camp commanders . A case has even been reported where father and son were forced by guards to perform sexual acts with each other .
- 28. It is the community identities that are targeted: according to numerous testimonies, some of which were given during the meeting of the Working Group on 23 and 24 June, the Bosnian Muslims were even questioned about the choice of religion of their ancestors. Many of them are Serbs converted to Islam obviously there is no Muslim ethnic group and "ethnic" cleansing is only a bad play on words. They are asked why their families converted to Islam during the Ottoman occupation, and are harshly reproached, without any acknowledgement that every religion practised in this region has always been linked to a foreign influence, as is the case nearly everywhere in the world.
- 29. The links that united communities were also the target of these inhuman actions. These actions were often aimed at the direct destruction of everything that had hitherto united the Bosnians: thus it was reported during the meeting on 23 and 24 June 1994 at UNESCO, that a Muslim primary teacher had been raped by his former Serb pupils in front of the whole village a drastic opportunity to deny publicly that there could ever exist the smallest human link between men belonging to different communities. Everything tends to the conclusion that the Serbo-Bosnian leaders have consciously sought to create a deep divide between the Serb, Croatian and Muslim communities, for generations to come so as to realise their dream of a Greater Serbia entrenched in its contempt for the other populations of the region.

cf. Bassiouni Report, para. 246.

²⁶ Ibid. Para. 245.

²⁷ Ibid. Para. 252.

²⁸ Ibid. Para. 247.

- III. CHARACTERISTICS OF THE USE OF RAPE AS A TOOL OF WAR AND CONSEQUENCES FOR INDIVIDUALS, GROUPS AND THE COMMUNITY
 - A. DISCLOSURE AND PSYCHOSOMATIC CONSEQUENCES OF SILENCE FOR THE VICTIMS
- 30. In all cases, rape is met with silence or denial. There remains a sense of shameful unhappiness, a stigma that usually leads to an assertion of inexistence. The victims keep quiet from fear of the disgrace that rape could bring them, their near ones, and even the community as a whole.
- 31. This diagnosis thus raises the problem of the disclosure of rape and sexual violence carried out against women in Bosnia-Herzegovina and Croatia and explains the silence of the majority of the victims. From the discussions on 23 and 24 June, it would appear that some women, who have been identified and/or have talked about the rape and sexual maltreatment to which they were subjected, came into the following categories:
- either, they had symptoms of psychic illness that necessitated being hospitalised in a psychiatric centre;
- or, they asked to be treated for gynaecological problems subsequent to rape (infection, haemorrhage, abortion);
- or, after becoming pregnant, they refused the child;
- or, they needed to obtain, for themselves and their families, the benefits of an emigration programme specially for women who had been raped or had been kept prisoner in a detention camp which generally amounted to one and the same situation.
- 32. However, from the testimonies gathered generally, it would appear that the majority of women who have been raped have had the strength of will not to speak about their rape so as to achieve psychological survival. The victim sets up defense mechanisms to try and forget the irrepresentable.
- 33. These are defense mechanisms organized by each individual depending on factors that need to be clearly differentiated in a readaptation programme. These factors are as follows:
- age, sexual development and sexual maturity of the victim: the impact is different if the victim has

been informed about sexual matters, and if she has had sexual relations or not;

- type of aggression: individual or collective rape, death threats, blackmail, sadism, links with the known or unknown aggressors;
- reactions of the family and social environment.
- 34. These mechanisms of forgetting and attempts at masking bring about the appearance, in the course of time, of post-traumatic symptoms. This is why some women will be led to disclose their rape months or years afterwards, following the emergence of problems when a doctor may perhaps understand the link between these problems and the rape. But there is the risk that rape will remain untold, thus aggravating the trauma.
- 35. To this deliberate silence chosen by the victim, must be added that of denial by persons close to the victim, a refusal to believe the unbelievable. It can even be said that the negation of the crimes stems from their unbelievable, unparalleled barbarism. The victim thinks that no one will be able to believe what she has lived through.
- The problem of non disclosure, of denial and of the victim's silence, raises the problem on the aggressor's side, of the impunity of a crime. This impunity deserves to be considered first of all in its legal aspects and secondly in its psychoanalytic aspects. This must be done from an anthropological viewpoint, «because it has the effect on the aggressor of headiness and legitimation», and that for the aggressed wit increased her shame and the feeling of irreality that she has lived through» (Veronique Nahoum Grapp, in "Report of the multidisciplinary symposium on the International Tribunal of War Crimes» organized by the `Initiative Citoyens Européens' (ICE) (European Citizens Initiative), Paris, 18 and 19 June 1994 (to be published shortly in French)). The effects of this impunity on the victims is strongly reinforced by the attitudes in which all parties are considered to be equally responsible and in which it is felt that there are neither victims nor aggressors.
- 37. At this stage of the analysis, another point should be emphasized concerning the way in which the media have used the rape of women in the conflict in the former Yugoslavia. First of all, it is necessary to recognize the important role played by the media in making public opinion conscious of the breadth of the disaster and that it is partly thanks to the combined action by the media and non-governmental organizations that the crimes committed are known to the international community.

- 38. Nevertheless, the way in which the media makes use of rape raises other questions: the public confession by the victim of rape is given world-wide publicity by the media, resulting in additional anxiety for the victim, all the more so as this type of testimony has sometimes been elicited in ways that overstep the bounds of decency.
- 39. In the present conditions and in the absence of real legal recourse, the victims should have, as much as they so desire, a genuine right to secrecy; they could, in any case, prefer to remain silent, if they can shoulder the consequences on the psychological level. This silence can equally respond to the desire to preserve family relationships. Doctors have reported that, for the victim, the fear of destroying the family was overwhelming in the case of married women and it is known that more than half the women who have been raped subsequently divorce and that often the traumas are irreversible for the relationship of the couple.

B. THE CONSEQUENCES FOR THE FAMILY AND THE COMMUNITY

- 40. For, it is also at the family and community levels that there will be catastrophes likely to put the cohesion of the community as a whole in peril and make it difficult for the victims to return from a receiving country. In all societies there are still many who see rape as the indelible sign of a great shame. In Bosnia and also in Croatia, numerous testimonies emphasize this traumatic situation in both individual and collective terms. Doctors from the former Yugoslavia reported cases, during the meeting on 23 and 24 June, of a husband and a brother-in-law having killed their wife or their sister-in-law and then killing themselves.
- 41. In addition to the destruction of people and cultural property and places of worship, there is added the transmission of shame to future generations because these traumas are not worked out since they are cloaked in silence born of shame and aimed at the destruction of the group's identity. It is useful here to understand the effect of the role played in the defeat suffered by the Serbs against the Turks in the month of June 1389 and its important place in the construction of hate. The memory of this defeat has been transmitted as an indelible imprint serving as a basis for building a reference of identity.

42. On the consequences of the use of systematic rape, it is important to note that, on the aggressors' side, while undertaking a scorched-earth policy, the Bosnian Serb authorities have succeeded in creating a homogeneous group of war criminals, thus asserting that war should be waged to the end and that there is no place for negotiation.

III. CONCLUSIONS AND GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS

A. PRESERVING THE COLLECTIVE MEMORY

- 43. If disclosure sets in train a negative process, the question can be asked WHAT CAN BE DONE ABOUT SHAME? What is the most important objective? Should the victims be left immured in a silence whose destructive effects on the person are known? Should everyone be helped to forget? What are the roles and duties of the Bosnian institutions as well as of the international community and UNESCO?
- 44. At the collective level, it is necessary to undertake a task of "unbinding" to release the victims from silence so that the community identity is not restructured around this "shame" and so that a true pathology of genealogy (effect on future generations) is established. It must be emphasized here that raising the question of disclosure is almost always a theoretical matter inasmuch as it is known that rape has in fact been carried out publicly, in front of family, friends, the district and that more than disclosure, the terms that should be mentioned here are those of suppression and of the deliberate and collective establishment of something that cannot be spoken about.
- 45. Collective silence would have negative effects on the women who have been raped because the silence would hide "the defilement" by trying to circumscribe the effect of the spread of shame. It has been underlined by doctors that it is necessary for the women to feel that what they are going through is shared with the others. The danger, at the individual level, is that a social conspiracy of silence is set up.
- 46. The Bosnian secular and religious authorities became aware of this problem when they refused to admit that so many women, who had been victims of the worst violence, were also marked by a social stigma. This is how women victims of rape have been pointed out as heroines. "Fatwas" in line with this approach were promulgated by the Islamic authorities. This community response to the challenge from an implacable enemy deserves to be noted: it is the best hope for the future at the same time that it brings about greater awareness of the rights of the human person.

- 47. The public and official recognition of the sufferings of raped women should be encouraged. This approach does not contradict the victims' right to silence. Taking the experience of the Shoah as a basis, one participant has shown the role that the Organization could play in organizing a collective memory. She nevertheless recalled that a collective memory does not exist spontaneously. It has a purpose that transcends itself. But it can, as we have just seen, bring help to the victim in as much as it allows her not to place herself or not to be placed outside the community. In addition, this "attention" to the collective memory will play a part in the work of unbinding, of the deconstruction of hate inasmuch as the crime is rid of the shame which it brings at both the individual and the collective level.
- 48. To constitute this collective memory is a complex task that should be undertaken with precaution with a prior definition of the goals of this action which should take account of the victims' interests and aim at the restoration of community links.
- 49. Bosnian authorities must seek testimonies to constitute a Memorial or a Documentation Centre that will have the hallowed character of a symbolic depository of the sufferings of raped women. These testimonies will be collected under oath of secrecy and respect for privacy will be guaranteed. It is significant that victims have spoken about their sufferings just before embarking on a plane journey to a life of exile. It is important that what has happened should be known. These people who made confidences often at the door of the aircraft seemed to fulfil a duty to themselves and those who were not able to speak because they were staying on or because they were dead.
- 50. The question of collecting testimonies with the goal of building up this collective memory comes up against an obstacle that preoccupies the Bosnian authorities. Apart from the deliberate silence of the victims who could be overwhelmed by the solemnity of the Memorial or of the Documentation Center, it should be known that numerous women victims of sexual crimes have benefited, together with their families, from a reception programme in a third country, mainly the USA. Their place of residence is kept secret and the Bosnian authorities do not know where they are.

B. FULFILLING THE DUTY OF JUSTICE

51. The responsibility and tasks of the international community are vital today for the readaptation of the

victims. This could be humanitarian, but what is most important in the victims interest is the **duty of justice** that the community should fulfil.

- 52. The therapists of the Working Group have insisted on the links between the legal aspects and the therapeutic aspects. The fact of judging and condemning brings back the psychic universe that has been destroyed in the victims by restructuring the world around law and the legal system. It is by naming the guilty party, condemning and recording the crime in law and the legal system, that the international community can put an end to the denial of rape with its destructive effects on the victims.
- 53. The legal solution, apart from being apparently the solution that is capable of clearing up the complex issue of disclosure, is the basis for an unreserved expression of forgiveness which alone can put a stop to hatred.
- 54. The question of **forgiveness** is divisive, and it is of course a difficult question. In the eyes of some, the victims of such unimaginable violence against their physical and moral integrity have a **"right to hate"** that is supposed to enable them to withstand impulses of death, destruction and personal annihilation. "Neither forgive, nor forget", is the motto of many of the victims of the genocide of Jews and of Gypsies during the Second World War.
- 55. Nevertheless, the majority of psychotherapists have estimated that in certain conditions a pardon could be given to the torturers and that it would be desirable that this be the case since it is the sole path not only to reconciliation but also towards the return of inner peace to the victims.
- 56. But this **forgiveness** is effective and unreserved only if it complies with two requirements:
- 1. As Vladimir Jankelevitch has said many times since 1945, "I will forgive them if they ask me for forgiveness". Forgiveness implies firstly this step by the torturers and of those who gave them orders: that they admit to their crimes and begin to feel repentant.
- 2. Such an action would not bring about forgiveness without reservation if it remained confined to the secrecy of a confessional: it should take the solemn form of the judicial process with an admission of the crime, the passing of the sentence and the application of the sentence, thus providing the victims with the steps for their own reconstruction not in a spirit of vengeance which, once again, will leave behind only

- a desert of hate, but in a spirit of justice and ultimately in a spirit of love.
- 57. This underlines, if necessary, the importance of legal recourse for the effective re-establishment of peace in the former Yugoslavia, and specially the importance of an international means of legal recourse. For this reason the creation of the ITWC is important for the victims' interests even if doubts (very widely shared by the participants and public opinion) are expressed and need to be genuinely taken note of, given the difficulties of implementation. This is because, with regard to the definitions proposed by the ITWC, a large number of those responsible are, to date, the very persons who are negotiating with the international community and participating in the peace negotiations.
- 58. In any case, it is necessary to emphasize the fact that it is important and urgent for the International Tribunal of War Crimes to start working. The symbolic importance of this Tribunal may be hailed, but what must be called for is its real implementation as each day that passes is a day of tolerance (in the negative sense) of crime and a part of this collapsing symbolic force. Waiting sets in motion mechanisms of delegitimation. effective functioning of the International Tribunal for War Crimes to judge war crimes and crimes against humanity will be of capital importance in a world threatened everywhere by unbridled violence which is the sign of a fatal and historic regression. In addition, while the war continues to rage in Bosnia, there is already a rampant revisionism suggesting that ethnic cleansing does not exist. The legal approach will in any case permit the preservation of the now indelible marks of relentlessness in the destruction of a community. To allow the facts resulting from extreme violence and the most brutal denial of humanity to go unpunished would be very unwise with regard to the future.
- 59. Concerning the collecting of testimonies for evidence at the trials of the International Tribunal for War Crimes, it is well-known that certain victims are left waiting and that in the absence of the receiving of the testimony by an "authority" for use by the ITWC, they do not wish to speak. Some non-governmental organizations do this work of collecting but it is not enough. This problem is all the more crucial as it is accentuated by the fact that the ITWC Statutes do not take account of the victim and that there is a great imbalance between the importance given to rights of the accused and to the fate of the victim. It is thus that the protection of the victims is not assured. The Clerk of the Tribunal seems in this case to rely on non-governmental organizations. Support could be given to the non-governmental organizations that work in this field.

C. ACTION FOR PEACE TAKING INTO ACCOUNT THE SPECIFIC ASPECTS OF THE CONFLICT IN FORMER YUGOSLAVIA

- 60. Another proposal in view of the work that UNESCO could undertake and which will contribute to the instauration of a Culture of peace in the region.
- 61. Action for peace, of which the main objective would be the restoration of community and intercommunity links, should take account of the specific nature of the conflict in the former Yugoslavia and should be oriented first of all towards the work of unbinding as was seen previously, but also to questions about the magnitude of sexual crimes in this war and their specific nature and to setting up and making available informed and preventive education programmes on these themes.
- 62. It is necessary to undertake pedagogic work on citizenship, its history in Europe, the status of women as citizens, denouncing the implicit indulgence with which every institution treats problems of rape, brutality, psychosexual torture: systematic rape was also possible because the reporting of rape came up against the general denial of rape in societies in peace time.
- 63. This particular attention to the status of women, apart from meeting the request of the Executive Board and General Conference, leads to the observation that the use of rape is related to an idea of the relationships between the sexes, because while it is true that men have also been raped, and in large numbers, it must be emphasized that this has happened implicitly with regard to a retrograde and barbaric idea of women or of "femininity". A woman doctor cited the case of a man who had been raped who collapsed saying "they raped me like a woman, with women". Many testimonies support this idea that it is to bring a man who has been raped to the status of a woman that he is chosen as a victim.

D. CONDITIONS AND MODALITIES OF ASSISTANCE PROGRAMMES TO VICTIMS OF SEXUAL CRIMES

64. Any programme to benefit victims of rape and sexual torture should never in any way stigmatize women and children, mainly children born as a result of rape. The need for this strict rule was recognized only after errors in analysis and strategies that marked the first actions undertaken and in particular those of certain NGOs financed by the European Community. "Programmes for women who have been raped" did not succeed. Mobile clinics and so-called reception centres "for women who have been raped" remained

empty. Considerable sums were used up in hasty and badly planned operations. It was in line with the rule that victims should not be stigmatized that UNESCO and the Croatian Ministry of Public Health have brought out an information document addressed to women and to various socio-professional groups in hospitals entitled «It is sometimes difficult to become the mother of an infant in war-time»

This document has been distributed in hospitals in Croatia by the Ministry of Public Health and will be used to establish contact with women who had unwanted pregnancies so that they can talk about their problems with the nursing staff.

- 65. This action, which has been judged useful in the context of refugees in Croatia and will be implemented through the hospitals of this country, will be proposed to medical practitioners and those responsible in Bosnia itself. Awareness and training seminars, bringing together different socio-professional groups, will be organized on the basis of this initial experience so as to adapt it to the particular conditions. It should be emphasized that the representatives of the Bosnian community in Croatia as well as representatives of Bosnian associations such as the MEMRAMET Institute (Bosnian Red Cross) were present in the discussions for the preparation of the working document mentioned above (see Annex 3 for the text of this leaflet which will be distributed in Croat, English and French versions).
- 66. The support of the victims requires individual psychological therapy but this individual treatment should be completed by a programme of taking care of the concerned group. The therapists in the field realise that, apart from the fact that there are not enough of them, they have had no training to manage this situation and that they need information about experiments made in other countries for this type of therapy. UNESCO can find out which institutes or people would be able to provide this information and thus help in an exchange of experience in the field of treatment of trauma resulting from sexual torture. Training and exchange programmes between Bosnian therapists and scientists and those of other countries will be organized in collaboration with institutes or organizations of certain Member States.
- 67. With regard to a programme of activities for the victims, we have seen that it is not in their interest to be treated differently. Hence no proposals will be made for action programmes for readaptation that would stigmatize and set apart the women who have been raped.

This document has been prepared following a suggestion by Dr Catherine Bonnet during a mission to Croatia for the Foundation of France.

- 68. It is action undertaken as a whole on behalf of victims or of refugees that must be kept in mind for the appraisal of this report. Thus, in the educational programmes for children, it should be remembered that there could have been sexual violence within the family and the group, and that this violence will induce traumas for the child which will have an effect on "education" and teaching. These children's' teachers should be kept informed and made aware of the effects that could resurface or of behaviour that could be the sign of the effects of sexual trauma and violence. Thus, it will be useful to organise this type of information for teaching personnel.
- 69. Furthermore, particular activities of expression and creation will be proposed to children so as to allow the metabolization of violence and the taking into account of sequels, if any, to the sexual violence that they have encountered in one way or another. The special programmes for children will be used in schools built by UNESCO, and the programmes initiated by UNESCO will be used in the refugee camps.

E. PRIORITY ACTION; TRAINING PROGRAMME FOR TEENAGE GIRLS IN REFUGEE CAMPS, OR DISPLACED

- 70. The information and suggestions presented were based on a mission to refugee camps in Dubrovnik, mainly in the Isle of Korcula (February 1994), in Zagreb at the Governmental Office of the Refugees Centre, with humanitarian associations such as the "Agencija za humanitarnu Promoc" (Egyptian association) and with a refugee camp near Zagreb run by the Bosnian Red Crescent MERHAMET as well as with the Zagreb Office of UNICEF.
- 71. It emerges, from the various interviews and surveys, that while much attention has been paid, and rightly so, to victims of violence and brutality, little or nothing has been done for other people. Apart from the fact that it is known that it is difficult if not impossible to identify the victims of rape, a large part of the refugees, women and young girls, pose problems not only for the present but also for the future, whether with regard to the prospect of their returning, or with regard to that of their assimilation in the host country.
- 72. On the basis of the data already collected, priority has been given to training programmes for teenage girls. Why teenage girls? Because it is a striking fact that in refugee camps, the number of teenage girls is higher than that of boys. Where are the latter? Are they fighting? Have they been killed? A difference in population figures for males and females can be seen after every war.

- 73. The teenage girls are at a loose end and have no money. They are partly excluded from secondary schools. All that the Croatian government is required to ensure for the refugee children is primary school education. Behind the noisy tragedy of this war, there is the silent tragedy being enacted of teenage girls without a future.
- 74. The girls who stay in the camps are nearly always of rural origin as the displaced urban populations have generally adapted better and have left the camps to become integrated in the nearby towns.
- 75. UNESCO will organize training programmes for young girls, mainly oriented towards building and communication jobs, these programmes being geared to the level of those who follow them. As a complement to these training activities, activities of cultural expression will be organized, taking account of the recommendations presented in previous items of this report.
- 76. To conclude, UNESCO will transmit this report to the Judge of the International Tribune of War Crimes as well as to the Committee for the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women at its 14th session, in February 1995, and to the United Nations Fourth World Conference for Women that will be held in Beijing (China) in 1995.

9.3 Report by the Director-General on the implementation of 140 EX/Decision 8.4 (141 EX/31)

The Executive Board,

- 1. <u>Bearing in mind</u> the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the International Covenants on Human Rights, and the International Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination,
- 2. <u>Taking note</u> of the resolutions adopted by the United Nations General Assembly and the Security Council, and by many other international bodies, on Bosnia and Herzegovina,
- 3. Recalling its previous decisions on the subject taken at its 139th and 140th sessions,
- 4. <u>Deeply concerned</u> about the continuing massacres of and aggressions against innocent human beings and destruction of the cultural heritage in Bosnia and Herzegovina under the abhorrent policy of 'ethnic cleansing',
- 5. Endorsing the statement issued by UNESCO's Director-General Federico Mayor on 13 January 1993 stressing that 'the atrocities committed in Bosnia and Herzegovina are damning and heartrending', and 'acts of savagery are intolerable', that 'when these acts are systematic, when they form part of a strategy, they arouse universal loathing and disgust', and that 'it is time to defend the dignity of every woman, the integrity of every man and the security of every child; it is time to arm the human conscience against such affronts to human worth'.
- 6. Expresses its dismay over the damage done to the religious and secular heritage of the Republic of Bosnia and Herzegovina (including mosques, churches and synagogues, schools and libraries, archives, cultural and educational buildings): also expresses its dismay over the blowing up of two important historic mosques (Ferhat Pasha, 1583, and Arnaudija, 1587) on 6 May 1993 following the demolition of five other mosques simultaneously in one day in April 1993, and strongly condemns the perpetrators of these heinous acts;
- 7. Takes note with satisfaction of resolution 827, adopted unanimously on 25 May 1993 by the United Nations Security Council, which sets up the International Tribunal of War Crimes empowered 'to prosecute persons violating the laws or customs of war' including but not limited to 'seizure of, destruction or wilful damage done to institutions dedicated to religion, charity and education, the arts and sciences, historic monuments and works of art and science' (Article 3, para. (d) of the annex to the Secretary-General's report (S/25704)):

- 8. Requests the Director-General to organize, under the transverse theme Women' in document 27 C/5, paragraph 11108 (Major Programme Area V), a UNESCO study on 'The use of rape as a tool of war its causes and consequences' and that, in view of the situation in Bosnia and Herzegovina, its focus be on a rehabilitation plan to be prepared in cooperation with the WHO and UNICEF for Bosnian women who have been the victims of systematic rape and for their children;
- 9. <u>Commends</u> the round-table dialogue (in February 1993) among intellectuals, artists, and religious representatives of the former Yugoslavia at the initiative of the Director-General and the meeting organized (in March 1993) by 'Collectif UNESCO solidarité avec la Bosnie-Herzegovine', and requests that such meetings and humanitarian initiatives be continued and strengthened;
- 10. Reiterates its 139 EX/Decision 7.5, inviting The Director-General, as soon as the situation permits, to send a mission to Bosnia and Herzegovina to determine the damage to educational, historical, archaeological and cultural property in the region and to explore the feasibility of sending emergency assistance to Bosnia and Herzegovina', and requests him to report to it at the 142nd session.

EXTRACTS OF RESOLUTION 11.1 OF THE TWENTY-SEVENTH SESSION OF THE GENERAL CONFERENCE

WOMEN

Η

- 6. Requests the Director-General:
 - (a) under the transverse theme 'Women' (27 C/5, para. 11108, Major Programme Area V), to continue the study undertaken in accordance with 141 EX/Decision 9.3, on 'The use of rape as a tool of war its causes and consequences', and that, in view of the situation in Bosnia and Herzegovina, its focus be on a rehabilitation plan, to be prepared in cooperation with the WHO and UNICEF, for Bosnian women who have been the victims of systematic rape and for their children;
 - (b) to facilitate hands-on training for refugee women in order to enable them to become active agents in solving problems pertaining to refugees;

ANNEX II

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

Dr. Izet AGANOVIC Chairman of the MERHAMET Movement Republic of Croatia Slavka Batusica 15 41000 ZAGREB

Ms. Meliha AGANOVIC

Director of the programme of assistance to families living outside the camps in Croatia

c/o MERHAMET

Slavka Batusica 15

41000 ZAGREB

Dr. Catherine BONNET Child psychiatrist 20 rue du Dr. Roux 75015 PARIS

Dr. Pierre BENGHOZI Psychiatrist 3 Villa Croix-Nivert 75115 PARIS

Mr. Jean-Pierre COLIN Professor of Law University of Reims 21 rue Gabriel Péri 91120 MONTROUGE

Dr. Vera FOLNEGOVICE Psychiatrist Klinika za Psihijatrijske bolesti Bolnika Vrapce Bolnika 32 41000 ZAGREB

Véronique NAOUM GRAPP Anthropologist 54 rue Lhommond 75005 PARIS

Dr. Dragica KOZARIC-KOVACIC Psychiatrist Klinika za Psihijatrijske bolesti Bolnika Vrapce Bolnika 32 41000 ZAGREB Mr. Michel LAVAL Jurist 1 rue Ville de l'Evêque 75008 PARIS

Dr. Narciza SARIJLIC "RUKE" Dobri Dol 23/1 Mme 41000 ZAGREB

Ms. Vesna STANOJEVIC c/o SOS Hot Line for Women and Children Victims of Violence Fax 38 1 11 402 283 BELGRADE

Ms. Annette WIEVIROKA Historian Director of Research at CNRS 7 rue Taylor 75010 PARIS

UNESCO

Wassyla TAMZALI Coordinator of activities relating to women

OBSERVERS

H.E. Mr. Nicolas KOVAC Ambassador of Bosnia in France

H.E. Mr. Pulat TACAR Ambassador of Turkey to UNESCO

Ms. Pascale DEPRE
Deputy Permanent Representative
of Belgium

NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS

Ms. Gilberte DJIAN World Jewish Congress

Ms. Vivian MOUNIER Fédération nationale Solidarité Femmes

Ms. Micheline GUITON
International Abolitionist Federation

Ms. Suzanne THIEBERT
Women's International League for Peace
and Freedom

.....

Ms. Juliette RENAULT
International Pax Christi

ANNEX III

II. COMPETENCE OF THE INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNAL

- 31. The competence of the International Tribunal derives from the mandate set out in paragraph 1 of resolution 808 (1993). This part of the report will examine and make proposals regarding these fundamental elements of its competence: ratione materiae (subject-matter jurisdiction), ratione personae (personal jurisdiction), ratione loci (territorial jurisdiction) and ratione temporis (temporal jurisdiction), as well as the question of the concurrent jurisdiction of the International Tribunal and national courts.
- 32. The statute should begin with a general article on the competence of the International Tribunal which would read as follows:

Article 1

Competence of the International Tribunal

The International Tribunal shall have the power to prosecute persons responsible for serious violations of international humanitarian law committed in the territory of the former Yugoslavia since 1991 in accordance with the provisions of the present Statute.

A. Competence ratione materiae (subject-matter jurisdiction)

- 33. According to paragraph 1 of resolution 808 (1993), the international tribunal shall prosecute persons responsible for serious violations of international humanitarian law committed in the territory of the former Yugoslavia since 1991. This body of law exists in the form of both conventional law and customary law. While there is international customary law which is not laid down in conventions, some of the major conventional humanitarian law has become part of customary international law.
- 34. In the view of the Secretary-General, the application of the principle nullum crimen sine lege requires that the international tribunal should apply rules of international humanitarian law which are beyond any doubt part of customary law so that the problem of adherence of some but not all States to specific conventions does not arise. This would appear to be particularly important in the context of an international tribunal prosecuting persons responsible for serious violations of international humanitarian law.
- 35. The part of conventional international humanitarian law which has beyond doubt become part of international customary law is the law applicable in armed conflict as embodied in: the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949 for the Protection of War Victims; $\underline{3}/$ the Hague Convention (IV) Respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land and the Regulations annexed thereto of 18 October 1907; $\underline{4}/$ the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide of 9 December 1948; $\underline{5}/$ and the Charter of the International Military Tribunal of 8 August 1945. $\underline{6}/$
- 36. Suggestions have been made that the international tribunal should apply domestic law in so far as it incorporates customary international humanitarian

law. While international humanitarian law as outlined above provides a sufficient basis for subject-matter jurisdiction, there is one related issue which would require reference to domestic practice, namely, penalties (see para. 111 below).

Grave breaches of the 1949 Geneva Conventions

- 37. The Geneva Conventions constitute rules of international humanitarian law and provide the core of the customary law applicable in international armed conflicts. These Conventions regulate the conduct of war from the humanitarian perspective by protecting certain categories of persons: namely, wounded and sick members of armed forces in the field; wounded, sick and shipwrecked members of armed forces at sea; prisoners of war, and civilians in time of war.
- 38. Each Convention contains a provision listing the particularly serious violations that qualify as "grave breaches" or war crimes. Persons committing or ordering grave breaches are subject to trial and punishment. The lists of grave breaches contained in the Geneva Conventions are reproduced in the article which follows.
- 39. The Security Council has reaffirmed on several occasions that persons who commit or order the commission of grave breaches of the 1949 Geneva Conventions in the territory of the former Yugoslavia are individually responsible for such breaches as serious violations of international humanitarian law.
- 40. The corresponding article of the statute would read:

Article 2

Grave breaches of the Geneva Conventions of 1949

The International Tribunal shall have the power to prosecute persons committing or ordering to be committed grave breaches of the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, namely the following acts against persons or property protected under the provisions of the relevant Geneva Convention:

- (a) wilful killing;
- (b) torture or inhuman treatment, including biological experiments;
- (c) wilfully causing great suffering or serious injury to body or health;
- (d) extensive destruction and appropriation of property, not justified by military necessity and carried out unlawfully and wantonly;
- (e) compelling a prisoner of war or a civilian to serve in the forces of a hostile power;
- (f) wilfully depriving a prisoner of war or a civilian of the rights of fair and regular trial;

....