



International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

Distr.: General
7 March 2023

Original: English

Human Rights Committee 137th session

Summary record of the 3960th meeting

Held at the Palais Wilson, Geneva, on Wednesday, 1 March 2023, at 3 p.m.

Chair: Ms. Abdo Rocholl

Contents

Consideration of reports submitted by States parties under article 40 of the Covenant
(*continued*)

Third periodic report of Turkmenistan

This record is subject to correction. Corrections should be set forth in a memorandum and also incorporated in a copy of the record. They should be sent within one week of the date of the present record to the Documents Management Section (DMS-DCM@un.org).

Any corrected records of the public meetings of the Committee at this session will be reissued for technical reasons after the end of the session.



The meeting was called to order at 3 p.m.

Consideration of reports submitted by States parties under article 40 of the Covenant
(continued)

Third periodic report of Turkmenistan ([CCPR/C/TKM/3](#); [CCPR/C/TKM/Q/3](#);
[CCPR/C/TKM/RQ/3](#))

1. *At the invitation of the Chair, the delegation of Turkmenistan joined the meeting.*
2. **Mr. Hajiye** (Turkmenistan), introducing his country's third periodic report, said that many positive developments had taken place in Turkmenistan over the reporting period and that, in preparation for the current dialogue, a seminar had been held with an international expert and representatives of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) Regional Office for Central Asia and the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). Since the submission of the report, Turkmenistan had continued striving to improve the national human rights protection system. In 2022, it had initiated General Assembly resolution 77/32, pursuant to which 2023 had been declared the International Year of Dialogue as a Guarantee of Peace. On 3 March 2022, the Government and the United Nations had signed a memorandum of understanding on cooperation in the implementation of the National Programme for the Socioeconomic Development of Turkmenistan for the period 2022–2052, and, on 27 February 2023, 26 documents on subjects including media relations, gender policy and children's rights had been signed as part of the United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework between Turkmenistan and the United Nations for the period 2021–2025.
3. A national coordinating mechanism had been established to monitor the progress made towards achieving the Sustainable Development Goals, which had been incorporated into national, sectoral and regional programmes, strategies and development plans. The country was currently preparing its second voluntary national review report, having presented its first in July 2019. It was also developing a new national plan of action for children's rights and was implementing the National Plan of Action for Human Rights for the period 2021–2025 and the National Plan of Action for Gender Equality for the period 2021–2025.
4. On 10 December 2022, Turkmenistan had hosted and chaired the annual Dialogue of Women Leaders from Central Asian States, at which the participants had included representatives of other countries in the region and the heads of regional United Nations entities. On 25 January 2019, the National Plan of Action for the Elimination of Statelessness in Turkmenistan for the period 2019–2024 had been approved. In total, over 28,000 persons had become naturalized citizens of Turkmenistan, and over 4,000 foreign nationals and stateless persons had been issued with residence permits.
5. Civil and political rights played an important role in the system of constitutional rights and freedoms. Within that framework, the country's political system was naturally improving. On 21 January 2023, the Constitutional Act on Amendments to the Constitution of Turkmenistan and the Constitutional Act on the People's Council of Turkmenistan had been adopted. Under its new mandate, the People's Council, which was intended to ensure the representation of all segments of the population and inter-ethnic and political harmony in society, would facilitate cooperation with local representative bodies and serve a coordinating and balancing function. In addition, measures had been taken to facilitate interaction between the general public and government agencies. For example, a central website had been launched to provide a single point of contact for access to government services.
6. In accordance with national electoral law, elections to representative bodies were carried out on a multi-party basis. Steps had been taken to improve the electoral system, thereby laying the ground for further democratization. Parliamentary and local authority elections were scheduled to be held on 26 March 2023. Since 2018, elections had been held on a single day, which, among other benefits, served to increase voter engagement.
7. Turkmenistan had become a party to the International Labour Organization (ILO) Tripartite Consultation (International Labour Standards) Convention, 1976 (No. 144) in 2019; the World Intellectual Property Organization Marrakesh Treaty to Facilitate Access to

Published Works for Persons Who Are Blind, Visually Impaired or Otherwise Print Disabled in 2020; the ILO Employment Policy Convention, 1964 (No. 122) and the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization Convention against Discrimination in Education and Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions in 2021; and the Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications Concerning Higher Education in the European Region in 2022.

8. Effective measures had been introduced to combat the spread of the coronavirus disease (COVID-19) and a coordinated national pandemic response strategy had been adopted. In July 2020, a revised version of the national budget had been adopted to take account of pandemic control measures.

9. The Office of the Ombudsman submitted an annual report to the President of Turkmenistan and presented it to the parliament. Those annual reports were subsequently available for consultation on its official website. In October 2022, in accordance with a memorandum of understanding signed between the Office and the Asia-Pacific Forum of National Human Rights Institutions, a group of experts had conducted a capacity assessment of the Office. In December 2022, the Forum had provided the Office with recommendations on the steps that needed to be taken to secure its accreditation with the Global Alliance of National Human Rights Institutions.

10. Various new laws and new versions of existing laws had been adopted during the reporting period. Taking into account the provisions of the Covenant, the parliament had adopted a new version of the Criminal Code, thereby abolishing criminal liability for certain categories of offences. With due regard to the Committee's concluding observations on the previous periodic report of Turkmenistan ([CCPR/C/TKM/CO/2](#)), amendments had been introduced to several legislative texts, including the Social Protection Code, the Code of Administrative Offences and the Labour Code. In recognition of the critical role played by the judiciary in upholding human rights, the Constitution included provisions on the legal status of judges. Efforts were being made to strengthen the judiciary in accordance with the Framework for the Development of the Judiciary in Turkmenistan for the period 2022–2028 and, on 19 January 2019, the Conference of Judges had adopted a code of ethics.

11. **Ms. Kran** said that, since the consideration of its previous periodic report in 2017, the State party had continued to face serious challenges in the area of civil and political rights. She would like to know what steps would be taken to implement the Views adopted by the Committee under the Optional Protocol to the Covenant in cases concerning the State party and what legislation had been enacted since 2021 to ensure compliance with international human rights standards. Examples of court judgments in which those standards had been invoked would be welcome. She wondered why the State party had refused to allow special procedures mandate holders to visit the country, how such refusals were consistent with the promotion, protection and enjoyment of human rights and what measures were being taken to strengthen cooperation with United Nations human rights mechanisms in general.

12. It would be useful to learn how the State party planned to improve the accessibility of the Office of the Ombudsman; what action had been taken in follow-up to the capacity assessment carried out in 2022; what mechanisms other than annual reporting were in place to ensure the Office's transparency and accountability; and whether local and international non-governmental organizations (NGOs) would have a role to play in ensuring the Office's independence and impartiality.

13. With regard to the "replies of an advisory nature" sent to the authors of 85 of the 244 written complaints received by the Office in 2021 ([CCPR/C/TKM/RQ/3](#), para. 11), she would appreciate clarification as to what "legal remedies" had been suggested; what procedures were in place to assist complainants in pursuing such remedies; and whether any of the issues raised in the complaints had been taken up by the courts. She would also like to know what efforts would be made to ensure the Ombudsman's effective access to the Ovadan Depe maximum-security prison; what steps would be taken to raise public awareness of human rights protection and the possibility of submitting complaints to national and international human rights bodies; and how the State party was incorporating human rights education into the national curriculum. She wondered why the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances had been refused access to the State party and what steps were being taken

to develop a constructive working relationship with international human rights bodies and the European Union on human rights issues.

14. It would be helpful to know what steps had been taken to narrow the broad range of activities considered extremist under national law and ensure that the applicable provisions were consistent with the principles of legal certainty, predictability and proportionality. With specific reference to the period since 2017, she wondered how many persons had filed complaints of arbitrary detention and similar human rights violations with domestic mechanisms; how many of those complaints had been investigated and processed through the appropriate channels; what findings the investigations had produced and what the outcomes of the complaints had been; what steps would be taken to provide compensation to persons who had been arbitrarily detained for criticizing the Government and members of their families; how many persons were serving sentences for Islamic extremism at the Ovadan Depe maximum-security prison and how long their sentences were; and how many persons in the State party had been charged with Islamic extremism, detained on such charges and convicted of such charges, and under what laws. She would particularly like to know whether the State party planned to release Bakhran Saparov, the leader of an unregistered Muslim organization who had been sentenced to 15 years' imprisonment, as well as others detained in similar circumstances. Lastly, she wished to know how many persons had been made subject to national and international travel restrictions under counter-extremism legislation since 2017.

15. **Ms. Tigroudja** said that it would be helpful to know how the State party raised awareness of the need to combat corruption among public officials, including whether, for example, it ran training programmes for those at greatest risk of corruption, such as procurators, other justice officials and police officers; whether any persons, in particular judges, procurators, police officers, labour camp guards, civil servants and other public officials, had been prosecuted and convicted for corruption-related offences; what legislative or other measures had been taken to prevent conflicts of interest in the context of public procurement; whether judges and other public officials were required to file a transparent and public declaration of assets that was easily accessible; and how the bodies responsible for combating corruption operated in practice.

16. She wondered what progress had been made towards adopting a general law providing definitions of direct and indirect discrimination, discrimination by association and by perception and multiple and intersectional discrimination and setting out the list of prohibited grounds. Statistics on the number of registered complaints of discrimination, whatever the alleged ground, and on any resulting investigations, prosecutions and penalties would be welcome. It would be interesting to learn what remedies were available to victims and what measures had been taken to combat hate speech, including steps to bring it within the scope of the criminal law, and to receive information about any hate speech-related complaints, investigations, prosecutions and penalties.

17. She wished to know what steps had been taken to repeal article 135 of the Criminal Code, which criminalized sexual relations between same-sex adults. It would be useful to have data on the number of investigations, prosecutions and convictions and the type of sentences handed down on the basis of that article. She wondered what measures had been taken to combat stereotypes based on the notion that there was only one socially acceptable sexual orientation, and what punishments had been imposed on police officers and members of the security forces who had been responsible for homophobic or transphobic acts or speech.

18. **Ms. Bassim** said that she would appreciate clarification of the criteria under which a state of emergency might be declared under the State of Emergency Act. She would be interested to learn who had the authority to declare a state of emergency; how its duration was determined; whether any extension required parliamentary approval; and how the Government had ensured that the state of emergency during the COVID-19 pandemic was proportionate to the seriousness of the situation. She wondered how the state of emergency during the pandemic had affected the movement of people; whether a curfew had been introduced and, if so, what sanctions could be imposed in the event of a breach; and whether the State party had notified the Secretary-General of the declaration of the state of emergency

in accordance with the Committee's statement on derogations from the Covenant in connection with the COVID-19 pandemic (CCPR/C/128/2).

19. She would welcome the delegation's comments on reports that the State party had failed to protect health-care workers and individuals who had participated in State-organized mass events at which their attendance was mandatory. Noting reports of insufficient publicly available information about COVID-19, she asked whether any campaigns had been carried out in the media, schools and local communities to raise awareness of COVID-19 and how to prevent its spread. In addition, she wondered how many people had been infected by COVID-19 and how many had died as a result; what impact the COVID-19 Response Project of the Ministry of Health and the Medical Industry of Turkmenistan had had, particularly for vulnerable groups such as children, older persons, those with chronic diseases, pregnant women and those living in crowded areas; and how the State party had measured and tracked the Project's results.

20. **Mr. El Haiba** said that he would like to know what measures had been adopted to address women's underrepresentation in decision-making positions and in public and elected office; what the outcome of those measures had been; what legislative, policy and judicial measures had been introduced to implement provisions of the Constitution prohibiting discrimination on the basis of gender; whether any court cases had been brought based on those provisions; what the results of the survey on women's health and status in the family had been; and what steps had been taken to incorporate those results into future legislative and policy reforms related to gender equality. Detailed, up-to-date information on the outcomes and shortcomings of action taken to combat gender stereotypes would be useful, as well as an explanation of reports that the number of violations of women's rights had increased since the start of 2022; some reports even suggested that women had been prevented from driving road vehicles without any legal basis. He would like to know what measures were in place to address such violations and counter negative stereotypes affecting women.

21. He wondered how the State party followed up on the implementation of the National Plan of Action for Gender Equality and the National Plan of Action for Human Rights for the period 2021–2025; what indicators had been used to measure their impact; what improvements had been made since 2021; and what information, if any, showed that efforts to bring about gender equality had borne fruit. Noting that women with disabilities often faced multiple forms of discrimination, he asked what programmes were in place to ensure that those women had access to education and employment services and were protected from violence.

22. He would be interested to know the status of the amendment to the Criminal Code to punish unlawful acts against women and the bill aimed at ending domestic violence. He wished to know what measures had been taken to ensure that those pieces of legislation complied with international standards; what mechanisms and safeguards were in place to ensure that the legislation was effectively implemented; and what results the campaign to raise public awareness of the country's zero-tolerance approach to violence against women had yielded, particularly in the wake of the COVID-19 pandemic. It would also be helpful to have up-to-date information on the road map for bringing national legislation on the prevention of physical and sexual violence against women into line with international standards, as well as detailed, disaggregated statistics on the number of complaints, investigations and prosecutions related to domestic violence, and the penalties imposed on perpetrators, since 2017. Had the road map improved the way in which State institutions handled domestic violence cases?

23. **Mr. Yigezu** said that it was not clear how the Internal Affairs Agencies Act of 2011 complied with the Basic Principles on the Use of Force and Firearms by Law Enforcement Officials and the United Nations Human Rights Guidance on Less-Lethal Weapons in Law Enforcement. He wondered whether those principles and guidance had been taken into account when drafting the Act; whether the State party had operational guidelines in place to help law enforcement officials make appropriate decisions regarding the use of force; what training officials received in that connection; and whether the State party had established an independent mechanism to ensure that all reports of excessive use of force by law enforcement officials or prison staff were promptly, effectively and impartially investigated

and that victims were provided with redress and compensation. It would be helpful to have information about cases involving excessive use of force that had been investigated by the State party during the reporting period.

24. He wished to hear about the fate and whereabouts of a number of individuals, who had reportedly been subjected to enforced disappearance, including Pygambergeldy Bairamberdyevich Allaberdyev, Kasymberdy Garayev and Eziz Nurmukhamedovich Hudaiberdiev and Ogulsapar Garlyevna Muradova. He wondered what steps had been taken to allow all persons deprived of their liberty to receive visits from their families and to consult with their lawyers in confidentiality; whether the State party intended to carry out thorough, prompt and impartial investigations into alleged cases of enforced disappearances, incommunicado detentions and deaths in detention centres and prisons; and how many persons had been imprisoned as a result of their association with the Hizmet/Gülen movement. He would be interested to learn why Gulgeldy Annaniyazov, who had been imprisoned for illegally crossing the State border and forgery of documents and subsequently placed in internal exile, had not been released despite the amendment of the Criminal Code in 2010 that had reduced sentences for offences committed prior to that year. He would also welcome information about the fate and whereabouts of Omruzak Omarkuliyev, who had reportedly been imprisoned in 2018.

25. He wondered whether the amendment to the definition of torture contained in the Criminal Code had entered into effect on 1 January 2023 as scheduled; how torture was defined under that amendment; and whether the amendment explicitly excluded necessity as a valid defence for committing acts of torture. He wished to know how successful the installation of surveillance equipment and the visits conducted by the Central Supervisory Commission had been in identifying torture and ill-treatment; whether evidence from those sources had been made available for use in court; and to what extent the supervisory commissions attached to the Cabinet of Ministers could be considered to be independent monitoring bodies. He would be grateful to learn what measures the State party would take to ensure that all allegations of torture and ill-treatment, deaths in custody, inhumane detention conditions and denial of medical services were reported and were promptly and thoroughly investigated by an independent and impartial body, and that perpetrators were prosecuted. He wondered what measures would be introduced to prohibit forced confessions, ensure that evidence obtained through torture was inadmissible in court, establish an accessible and effective complaints mechanism for torture cases, and provide law enforcement personnel with adequate training on the prevention of torture and inhumane treatment. Lastly, he asked why the State party had not taken any steps to give effect to the Views adopted by the Committee concerning communication No. 2252/2013 (*Khadzhiyev and Muradova v. Turkmenistan*) or provided a clear timeline for doing so.

26. **Mr. Santos Pais** said that he would appreciate confirmation as to whether the OHCHR website and the webcast of the current dialogue were accessible to the general public in Turkmenistan.

The meeting was suspended at 4.20 p.m. and resumed at 4.40 p.m.

27. **A representative of Turkmenistan** said that strengthening democratic principles and guaranteeing the economic, political and social rights of all citizens were a policy priority for his country. All standards under the international treaties ratified by Turkmenistan had been incorporated into national law and numerous pieces of legislation had been enacted during the reporting period to ensure full compliance with the country's international obligations.

28. The partner institutions involved in the assessment of the Office of the Ombudsman conducted in 2022 had made various recommendations aimed at enhancing its capacity. An application to have the Office accredited by the Global Alliance of National Human Rights Institution would be submitted in the course of 2023, an annual workplan for bringing it into line with the Principles relating to the status of national institutions for the promotion and protection of human rights Principles relating to the status of national institutions for the promotion and protection of human rights (Paris Principles) having been agreed with UNDP in February of that year. There were also plans to improve legislation governing the timelines for the consideration of complaints by the Office, and the Office's accessibility and logistical operation were monitored on an ongoing basis. The COVID-19 pandemic had caused a

certain degree of disruption, but access to the Office was generally not a problem. That said, the possibility of establishing provincial branch offices was under consideration. In 2022, funding for the Office had been doubled and the Office had received more than 500 complaints. So far, the complainants had obtained satisfaction in 15 of those cases and the Office had issued recommendations to correct violations in respect of a further 3 of them.

29. The parliament of Turkmenistan was working to raise public awareness of human rights and the international human rights treaties to which Turkmenistan was a party. To that end, in the course of 2022 educational seminars and other events involving representatives of the Procurator's Office, the Supreme Court and the Ministry of Justice had been organized across the country for legal specialists, voluntary associations and local government officials.

30. Legislative amendments had been passed to ensure the equal treatment of persons with disabilities and changes introduced in 2021 had brought disability legislation fully into line with the Convention. Changes to the Tax Code had given persons with disabilities certain exemptions and they were also eligible to receive financial support to study at secondary and higher education institutions.

31. The parliament systematically monitored legislation relating to extremism and was endeavouring to improve it, taking international practice into account.

32. **A representative of Turkmenistan** said that Human Rights Information Resource Centres had been established throughout the country and were freely accessible to all citizens. The centres made a significant contribution to awareness-raising efforts, for example, by issuing publications and running workshops. Their databases were regularly updated with relevant materials sourced from the State and international organizations.

33. With the help of OHCHR and UNDP, the authorities were specifically working to raise awareness of the procedure for submitting complaints under the terms of the Covenant. With the assistance of special procedure mandate holders, seminars and workshops had been organized for members of the interdepartmental commission responsible for monitoring compliance with international human rights obligations with a view to explaining how practices might be improved.

34. The webcast of the current meeting with the Committee was freely accessible in Turkmenistan, and all persons could therefore watch the dialogue live.

35. No state of emergency had been declared in Turkmenistan during the COVID-19 pandemic but a series of restrictions and preventive measures, including physical distancing requirements, had been imposed in accordance with World Health Organization (WHO) recommendations. An epidemiological committee had been set up to keep the population informed, and a special working group comprising representatives of all relevant ministries established to monitor developments and identify and oversee the relevant courses of action. The Ministry of Foreign Affairs had established a consultation centre with an emergency helpline that had allowed a number of citizens to obtain information about relatives who had been abroad when the travel restrictions had entered into force. By presidential decree, Turkmen citizens had been permitted to enter and leave the country during the pandemic, thus allowing repatriation to take place. It had also been possible for citizens to extend the validity of their identity documents during the period.

36. **Mr. Haljanov** (Turkmenistan) said that the staff of the Permanent Mission of Turkmenistan to the United Nations Office at Geneva had worked closely with WHO officials during the COVID-19 pandemic. Representatives of WHO had travelled to Turkmenistan in 2020 to verify the preparedness of the country's medical facilities, visiting public health centres, laboratories and border crossing check points. In November 2021, another WHO delegation had visited Turkmenistan to assess the country's ongoing needs. The country had acquired over 22 million COVID-19 vaccines in 2021 and 2022 combined and 96 per cent of the population over 18 years of age had received a first dose, 95 per cent a second dose, 94 per cent a third dose and 93 per cent a fourth dose.

37. Turkmenistan had not refused to allow visits from special procedure mandate holders or representatives of working groups. All such requests were carefully considered in the light of the time and circumstances convenient for both parties. In 2020, online meetings with the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances had been organized in which

representatives of national law enforcement bodies, parliament, the Office of the Ombudsman and the Institute for State, Law and Democracy had taken part. A proposed visit to Turkmenistan by the Working Group had been postponed due to the COVID-19 pandemic but further working meetings had taken place in 2021. Communication was ongoing about possible visits by special procedure mandate holders. For example, alternative dates had been proposed for a visit by the Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights.

38. **A representative of Turkmenistan** said that issues of gender equality were duly reflected in all national programmes, including the Social and Economic Development Strategy for the period 2019–2025, which envisaged structural reforms that would open up new employment opportunities for the population, including for women. Women were well represented in public and political life, including in the parliament, where just over 15 per cent of the 150 members were women. The position of Ombudsman was held by a woman, women held leading positions in universities and the media, and nearly half of all justice officials and two third of public servants in the Ministry of Justice were women.

39. The 2020 survey on women's health and status in the family had been conducted among women aged between 18 and 59 years old using a methodological approach developed by WHO for surveys on domestic violence. The women had been interviewed individually and had been guaranteed confidentiality. The survey had revealed that around 12 per cent of women interviewed who were married or in a relationship had experienced domestic violence at least once in their life. The results had been published in a report and had been shared during seminars throughout the country, at a press conference and with relevant government and international agencies. The National Plan of Action for Gender Equality for the period 2021–2025 envisaged strategic action to combat domestic violence and the authorities were working with the United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA) to that end. A road map had been developed for the related Plan of Action, which encompassed legislative reform and improvements to data collection, analysis and other systems, and was already being implemented. Standards of care to be respected by health professionals and law enforcement officers had also been developed, with assistance from international experts. Legislation on social services had been adopted in 2021 and 45 social workers had since received training.

40. Pursuant to the National Plan of Action for Gender Equality, women were made aware of their right to approach international bodies such as the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women. Events were held regularly in collaboration with UNFPA and the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) during which the relevance of international law was explained. Her Government was working with UNDP to implement the National Plan of Action for Human Rights.

41. **A representative of Turkmenistan** said that Mr. Allaberdyev had been pardoned by the President in 2022. Mr. Omarkuliyev was living at his registered address and was not involved in any criminal or administrative proceedings. Mr. Garayev was not involved in any proceedings and was living at his registered address. Ms. Muradova had passed away in prison after hanging herself and the staff at the prison in question had been disciplined. Having been convicted of crossing the national border illegally and falsifying stamps and seals, Mr. Annaniyazov was serving a prison sentence and would be released in a year's time. Mr. Hudayberdiev had passed away in 2019 due to health problems in a specialized institution for sick prisoners.

42. The Ministry of Internal Affairs did not have the right to restrict the activities of the Office of the Ombudsman, whose representatives had unrestricted access to all places of detention. However, restrictions related to the COVID-19 pandemic had affected the Office's schedule of visits. Staff of the Ministry of Internal Affairs received human rights training as part of their initial and continuous training programmes.

43. With regard to the ban on the use of road vehicles by women, the authorities had been obliged to take action because an increasing number of women had been driving without a licence. The measures had been temporary and the women drivers involved had been released.

44. **A representative of Turkmenistan** said that his country had ratified the United Nations Convention against Corruption and had also enacted national legislation on combating corruption. The Civil Service Act prohibited public officials from misusing state

information or resources and taking part in other remunerated activities apart from teaching and research. A financial monitoring system had been set up to identify money that might constitute the proceeds of crime or be connected to money laundering or terrorism financing activities. An anti-corruption programme with measures running into 2024 had been established by presidential decree; a central commission had been established to coordinate anti-corruption efforts; awareness-raising activities were conducted among citizens; public officials were trained on preventing all aspects of corruption; and Government services were provided using a single window approach in order to reduce the risk of corruption. Anti-corruption legislation on the provision of services by enterprises had also been introduced. Turkmenistan was a member of the Eurasian Group on Combating Money Laundering and Financing of Terrorism and a national risk assessment had been carried out with assistance from the World Bank that had given rise to 40 recommendations for combating corruption. A second such risk assessment was planned. As a result of the Government's efforts to prevent corruption, there had been a twofold reduction in corruption convictions between 2018 and 2020.

45. The right to life was enshrined in the Constitution and the death penalty had been abolished. Under the Internal Affairs Agencies Act of 21 May 2011, internal affairs officers were permitted to use physical force as a last resort only and never against women or persons with disabilities. Members of the security forces could be held criminally responsible for any injury resulting from the unlawful use of force or firearms, with the Procurator being responsible for deciding whether criminal proceedings should be initiated.

46. **Ms. Kran** said that she would appreciate more specific and detailed information about how the legal framework in the State party was applied in practice. She would also like to know more about any national legislation enacted to integrate international human rights law into domestic legislation since the State party had submitted its replies to the list of issues in relation to its third periodic report (CCPR/C/TKM/RQ/3). It would also be interesting to hear about any court decisions in which international law had been invoked. While it was encouraging that the State party was planning to continue its cooperation with the special procedures mandate holders of the Human Rights Council, she wondered whether it might consider issuing a blanket invitation to all the Special Rapporteurs or making more concrete plans. More nuanced information about the role of the Office of the Ombudsman would likewise be welcome, including confirmation that its staff had access to prisons. She would particularly like to know whether the Ombudsman had been able to visit Ovadan Depe prison and report on the conditions there.

47. **Ms. Tigroudja** said that she would welcome the delegation's comments on reports that allegations of corruption was used as a means to undermine opponents of the Government. It would be useful to have more detailed information on the interdepartmental commission responsible for coordinating efforts to combat corruption and how its impartiality and independence were guaranteed. Furthermore, could the delegation explain how the new rules for businesses ensured that public tenders involving large sums of money were not awarded to individuals close to the President?

48. **Mr. El Haiba** said that he would like more detailed information about how the National Plan of Action for Human Rights was implemented and which stakeholders were involved. Since his understanding was that there were very few, if any, NGOs in the State party working to defend human rights and that the few NGOs that had been granted registration were not independent, he wondered how measures for the protection of human rights could be implemented in a participative manner in line with the Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action. He also wished to know more about the impact of the measures implemented to combat domestic violence. Had there been any decline in the incidence of such violence?

49. **Mr. Yigezu** said that he would appreciate the delegation's comments on the case of Ms. Muradova, taking account of the fact that, in its previously issued Views, the Committee had found a violation by the State party of articles 6 and 7 of the Covenant. He would also welcome confirmation as to whether the Internal Affairs Agencies Act was in line with the Basic Principles on the Use of Force and Firearms by Law Enforcement Officials.

The meeting rose at 6.05 p.m.