



**International Convention on
the Elimination of All Forms
of Racial Discrimination**

Distr.: General
19 February 2013

Original: English

Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
Eighty-second session

Summary record of the 2211th meeting

Held at the Palais Wilson, Geneva, on Thursday, 14 February 2013, at 3 p.m.

Chairperson: Mr. Amir (Vice-Chairperson)

Contents

Consideration of reports, comments and information submitted by States parties under article 9 of the Convention (*continued*)

Combined twentieth to twenty-second periodic reports of the Russian Federation

This record is subject to correction.

Corrections should be submitted in one of the working languages. They should be set forth in a memorandum and also incorporated in a copy of the record. They should be sent *within one week of the date of this document* to the Editing Unit, room E.4108, Palais des Nations, Geneva.

Any corrections to the records of the public meetings of the Committee at this session will be consolidated in a single corrigendum, to be issued shortly after the end of the session.

In the absence of Mr. Avtonomov (Chairperson), Mr. Amir (Vice-Chairperson) took the Chair.

The meeting was called to order at 3.05 p.m.

Consideration of reports, comments and information submitted by States parties under article 9 of the Convention (*continued*)

Combined twentieth to twenty-second periodic reports of the Russian Federation (CERD/C/RUS/20-22 and Annex; CERD/C/RUS/Q/20-22; HRI/CORE/1/Add.52/Rev.1)

1. *At the invitation of the Chairperson, the delegation of the Russian Federation took places at the Committee table.*
2. **Mr. Osintsev** (Russian Federation) said that his Government had signed or ratified a number of international human rights treaties over the previous few years, including the European Social Charter, Protocol No. 14 to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, amending the control system of the Conventions, the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography, and the Convention of 19 October 1996 on Jurisdiction, Applicable Law, Recognition, Enforcement and Co-operation in respect of Parental Responsibility and Measures for the Protection of Children.
3. His delegation expressed its support every year for a United Nations General Assembly resolution “on the inadmissibility of certain practices that contribute to fuelling contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance”. His Government also contributed around US\$ 2 million to the annual budget of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights.
4. Alongside the Federal Commissioner for Human Rights, the positions of Commissioner for the Rights of the Child and Commissioner for the Rights of Business-Owners had been established within the Office of the President of the Russian Federation in 2006 and 2009 respectively. A commissioner for the rights of the child operated in all 83 regional entities of the Russian Federation, and a commissioner for human rights in 67 of those entities. A system of “open government” had been established in 2012 to facilitate cooperation between the authorities and civil society. Four presidential councils dealt with human rights and civil society organizations, matters affecting Cossak communities, and relations with and between religious and ethnic groups. Representatives of religious organizations, ethnic and cultural associations, and indigenous minorities were represented on similar councils at the regional level.
5. A long-term strategy to direct policy regarding ethnic groups until 2025 had been adopted after broad consultation in December 2012. Its goals included: the strengthening of public awareness of the multi-ethnic make-up of the Russian Federation; the consolidation and development of ethnic and cultural diversity; the harmonization of relations between different ethnic groups; the upholding of the human and civil rights and freedoms of all, regardless of their race, ethnic origin, sex, language or religious beliefs; and the speeding-up of social and cultural integration of immigrants. A programme of measures to put the strategy into practice, which had been discussed beforehand by members of the Government, experts and leaders of various religious and ethnic communities, was due to be approved by April 2013.
6. Offences motivated by political, ideological, racial, ethnic or religious hatred or hostility towards particular social groups drew severe penalties under the Criminal Code. An interdepartmental commission had been established to combat extremism. The

participation of civil society organizations in those efforts was encouraged. Similarly, working groups were active at the regional level and efforts were being made to cut off sources of funding to extremist, terrorist and xenophobic groups.

7. Political, religious, ethnic and nationalistic radicalism was primarily the domain of persons aged 25 and under, whether they were nationalists or left-wing extremists. The suppression of radical groups was a priority for law enforcement agencies, whose conduct was monitored by the Office of the Procurator-General. The mass media were monitored by a federal communications regulator in order to track the dissemination of materials designed to exacerbate ethnic and religious tensions, and incite or justify terrorism. In 2012, 17 warnings had been issued to media outlets for such activities.

8. The Federal Press and Mass Communication Agency provided support for media projects designed to foster cultural diversity, overcome xenophobia, promote the culture of indigenous communities and combat terrorism, extremism, nationalism, and racial and religious intolerance. Some Rub 61 million (more than US\$ 2 million) of State funding had been channelled into such projects in 2012. The Agency had also organized a television film competition that had attracted more than 200 films from more than 30 different regional entities.

9. A federal migration policy framework for the period until 2025 had been launched in 2012 and designed to foster the integration of immigrants into Russian society. Legislation had been passed in the same year to facilitate the acquisition of Russian nationality by citizens of the former Soviet Union who had remained as long-term residents in the territory of the State party. The law applied equally to their offspring. The State programme for assisting the voluntary resettlement in the Russian Federation of ethnic Russians living abroad had been renewed and simplified in 2012. Of the 126,000 people who had benefited from the programme since its launch in 2006, 63,000 had arrived in the State party in 2012 alone. Deadlines for resettlement had been dropped and candidates could freely choose where in the State party they wished to settle. The programme was now also open to job-seekers, self-employed persons and students.

10. With regard to the Caucasus region, he said that Rub 120 billion had been spent on programmes for social and economic development in Chechnya between 2008 and 2011. Around Rub 235 billion would be spent between 2013 and 2020 to develop the economy and raise living standards in the entire northern Caucasus region.

11. A comprehensive two-year plan for the social, economic and cultural development of Roma people had been launched in January 2013. It was expected that regional entities would follow suit with similar programmes. The Russian Federation was also participating in the European Mediation for Roma programme.

12. Considerable work continued to be done to increase the human rights awareness of law enforcement officials and to improve their interaction with members of civil society groups, migrants and representatives of ethnic groups. Cases of the use of force by those officials, including against indigenous persons and migrants, were thoroughly investigated.

13. Of the 277 languages and dialects spoken in the State party, 30 were used as the vehicle of communication in schools and a further 59 were taught.

14. The principle of non-discrimination was enshrined in the Constitution and legislation of the State party, and the norms of international law were directly applicable. Civil society organizations had flourished in recent years, with more than 60,000 associations and 400,000 non-profit groups spread across the country.

15. The State party was committed to the sustained development and protection of the rights of small indigenous population groups (50,000 members or fewer). The first phase of the outline plan for the sustainable development of indigenous peoples of the North, Siberia

and the Russian Far East had been carried out between 2009 and 2011. It was hoped that the indigenous population would increase by 30 per cent by 2020 and that their living standards would be raised to the average Russian level. Subsidies were provided at the federal and regional entity level for housing, schools, infrastructure, and equipment procurement for fish and meat processing. All indigenous children received free secondary schooling and in some regions higher education was also provided free of charge. As a rule, the regional entities provided more subsidies to indigenous peoples than the Federal Government. They included monthly payments to help them maintain their traditional way of life. Those who had been affected by the industrialization of their land received compensation. In all, indigenous communities had received Rub 12 billion in State aid between 2009 and 2011. Representatives of those communities sat on several bodies, including the Presidential Council on Inter-Ethnic Relations. Commissioners for indigenous peoples worked in several regional entities.

16. The Russian Federation was a secular State that supported the social initiatives of religious organizations and promoted interfaith dialogue. A new course on religions in Russia and the world had been introduced as part of the mandatory school curriculum in 2012. The Government acted systematically to counter anti-Semitism and anti-Islamic or anti-Christian sentiment. Aside from punitive measures, a group of top schools in seven major cities, including Moscow, had been involved in plans to promote and deepen Islamic religious education. More than 400 students had been selected with the help of the Muslim community to receive State aid to pursue various university courses, including theology. State aid had also been provided for the development of more than 3,500 textbooks and other religious learning materials. The Government supported traditional religious institutions that promoted the improvement of inter-ethnic and interfaith relations.

17. **Ms. Crickley** (Country Rapporteur) said that there had been a number of positive developments, including simplified procedures for obtaining Russian citizenship, in the State party since it had submitted its previous periodic report. The Committee was also pleased to note that work on the Evenkiiskaya dam had been stopped.

18. While noting that efforts to combat hate crime had been stepped up in recent years, she wondered whether the incidence of hate speech had decreased. Reported statements by officials of the Zenit St. Petersburg football club that it would only recruit white players were a source of concern. She asked to what extent legislation prohibiting acts of discrimination by law enforcement officials had been implemented.

19. The lack of comprehensive federal legislation prohibiting all forms of direct and indirect racial discrimination, as noted in paragraph 9 of the Committee's previous concluding observations, remained an issue. The absence of court reviews of discrimination cases involving women, national minorities, migrants and stateless people indicated that the existing, mainly declarative, norms on the prohibition of discrimination were impossible to enforce in the courts. The lack of a clear definition of racial discrimination in domestic legislation and the dearth of civil and administrative procedures to prevent and combat direct and indirect discrimination remained a major challenge.

20. It would be helpful if the delegation could provide information on measures to establish a mechanism for systematic data collection to assess the socioeconomic status of different ethnic groups in the State party, as recommended in the previous concluding observations.

21. In addition, she requested information on complaints of racial discrimination referred to and examined by the Office of the Human Rights Ombudsman, and on their outcomes. She asked for details of the relationship between the National Commissioner for Human Rights and the local ombudspersons, and enquired how national and federal legislation in that regard was implemented directly at the local and regional levels.

22. Concerns had been raised about the broad scope of the law on combating extremist activities and the fact that it had not been applied to ultra-nationalist groups. The Committee would welcome information on the application of the law and on preventive measures aimed at young people.

23. Although the report indicated that Chechens had been integrated, it did not contain information on the direct enjoyment by ethnic minorities, including persons from Chechnya, the Caucasus and Africa, of rights protected under the Convention, including the right to be free from discrimination. The reference to Africans was made in the context of reports of racism in sport.

24. She requested further information on measures under consideration to ensure that the expedited residence process applied to minorities, including persons from Chechnya and the Caucasus and former Soviet citizens.

25. In view of reports of discrimination against ethnic minorities by law enforcement personnel, she asked for information on the investigation, prosecution and punishment of such cases and on measures to eliminate them. Chechen nationals continued to be subjected to frequent arrests; they were reportedly ill-treated by prison staff and lacked access to medical care. Muslims were sometimes prohibited from performing their religious duties. How did the State party deal with such issues?

26. She requested information on procedures and criteria for obtaining direct support for the preservation of minority cultures, and on the effective involvement of minority representatives in decision-making in that and other areas. In addition, it would be helpful to have further information on access to secondary education in minority languages and the right to study and take State examinations in those languages.

27. The Committee would value information on special measures envisaged in the forthcoming national plan on the Roma to promote their access to employment, personal documents, residence registration, adequate housing with security of tenure, and other economic, social and cultural rights. Although the Committee had addressed those issues in its concluding observations of 2008, no direct measures appeared to have been taken to date. Would the plan address the attitude of the Roma towards the general population, or of the general population towards the Roma?

28. The participation in the Council of Europe's training programme for mediators was useful, but care was needed to ensure that mediators did not act on behalf of the State. How would mediators maintain their independence in order to be effective in their work and make a difference for the Roma? What new processes would be put in place under the national plan to enable Roma to carry out registration procedures or achieve outcomes such as exercise of the rights to freedom of movement, residence and social assistance? The denial of those rights to Roma because of a lack of documentation constituted a major challenge to implementation of the Convention.

29. A number of legal inconsistencies that undermined the rights of indigenous people had been brought to the Committee's attention. It would be helpful to know how the legislation was being made more coherent. In view of the 2008 and 2010 amendments to the legislation on the use of animal and aquatic resources, the Committee wished to know whether indigenous people were barred from engaging in non-traditional economic activities, which would appear to be a normal part of developing sustainable communities. How had the Federal Act on Areas of Traditional Resource Use adopted in 2001 been implemented, what obstacles to its implementation remained and what was the timeline for the elimination of those obstacles?

30. She asked whether mechanisms to ensure that the special subsidies for the socioeconomic benefit of indigenous people were used, as intended, in a transparent and

accountable manner. In addition, she sought additional information about the granting of licences to private companies for the extraction of natural resources and installation of pipelines, the ecological impact of their activities and their evaluation, and details of compensation provided to affected communities.

31. In view of the forthcoming action plan on integration as it pertained to non-nationals, including migrants, refugees, asylum seekers, internally displaced and stateless persons, she asked the delegation to give a clear outline of the plan and annual targets for implementation. She asked the delegation to clarify its use of the terms “cultural adaptation” and “integration of migrants”. Would policy and strategy aim to ensure that the above-mentioned people had a clear understanding of their rights, or would they aim to assimilate their cultures? In addition, the Committee would welcome information on the situation of internally displaced persons, in particular those in the Northern Caucasus, and on State assistance for persons who had fled Chechnya and lived in other regions.

32. The Committee was concerned that amendments to the Labour Code of 2006 could remove the right to make a complaint based on racial discrimination. It would appreciate information on decisions taken in court proceedings and measures to keep records of such cases.

33. The Committee would also value information on measures taken to promote awareness of the Convention throughout the Russian Federation and judicial recourse available in cases of direct and indirect discrimination. In addition, it would like to know more about the impact of amendments to the law relating to non-profit organizations on human rights defenders, NGOs and small religious groups. Lastly, it would welcome information on any direct measures taken to address racial discrimination experienced by women members of minority groups.

34. **Mr. Murillo Martínez** said that while commendable measures had been taken to counter extremism and ensure that the media did not use hate speech and promote enmity, as indicated in paragraph 17 of the report, they appeared to be insufficient; every day the media reported incidents that demonstrated the serious resurgence in the Russian Federation of racism, xenophobia and ultra-nationalism. The reactions of the authorities in some cases also gave cause for concern. In that context, he asked the delegation to provide official figures for homicides of foreigners, in particular foreign students, by extremist groups. What had been the outcome of investigations, what verdicts had been returned and what penalties imposed? At the same time, it would be useful to understand the philosophy behind the analysis used in such cases and the reasons for the resurgence of extremism.

35. Some 50,000 people in the Russian Federation were members of Nazi and neo-Nazi organizations, which held demonstrations fairly frequently in various regions. Were official figures available on membership of such organizations? It would also be helpful to know how those organizations were perceived by the Russian public at large.

36. Lastly, he asked whether the delegation considered the International Labour Organization Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention, 1989 (No. 169) and its eventual implementation useful for the Russian Federation in view of its ethnic diversity.

37. **Mr. Kut** said it was important to remember that the Russian Federation was a large and complex entity. While a number of problems were evident from the Committee’s perspective, considerable efforts were being made to resolve them.

38. The problem of residence registration affected only a few thousand people, but it was a serious issue that had a profound impact on their lives. Those affected were principally Roma, but also some Russian nationals, non-nationals and stateless persons. He asked why, as the numbers were relatively small, it was so difficult to resolve the problem decisively and durably by providing them with residence permits.

39. In connection with criminal law and anti-extremism measures, he wished to know whether or not the authorities had developed a policy and strategy to make the application of criminal law procedures more effective and to assess their implementation. Furthermore, in view of the dearth of civil legislation on discrimination, he asked whether there was a strategy to establish truly comprehensive civil administrative legislation that would focus clearly and solely on combating racism.

40. The figures on racist violence provided by the Russian authorities in April 2012 indicated that the number of deaths and injuries caused by such violence had fallen sharply in 2010 in comparison with 2007, which was a positive development. Had any analysis been made of the reasons behind that trend, and were figures available for 2011 and 2012?

41. Racist discourse in politics was on the rise all over Europe and elsewhere. It was known that in Russia some political parties and figures used racist statements to gain political support and that sometimes that strategy paid off. What were the authorities doing to counter racist discourse in that context?

42. Ample information had been given on vulnerable groups such as the Roma. However, it would be helpful to know which institution, if any, identified which groups in society were the most vulnerable, and whether the Government had a particular policy for dealing with those groups.

43. Lastly, the federal nature of Russia posed certain difficulties from the standpoint of constitutional law. How could any federal policy or strategy apply, or be applied, to federal subjects in the same manner in order to obtain the same results? What mechanisms were available to ensure that they did? How could good practices at local levels be expanded to apply to the larger federal entity in order to achieve the desired result of combating racism?

44. **Mr. Diaconu** said it was evident from the report that the Russian Federation had copious sectoral legislation in numerous fields. The report indicated that a number of activities aimed at the elimination of racial discrimination, in addition to a number of cultural activities, targeted young people. Although Russian legislation was evolving rapidly, which could create discontinuity, it did not contain a definition of racial discrimination and was thus not in conformity with the Convention. First, while Russian legislation spoke only of restriction as discrimination, the Convention also referred to distinction, exclusion and preference. Second, the Convention spoke of the direct and indirect purpose and effect of discrimination, which appeared not to be covered in Russian legislation.

45. He asked about the basis on which it had been decided that indigenous peoples should be defined as having a population of less than 50,000. Were there no indigenous peoples with a population of more than 50,000 persons, and should they not also be protected as indigenous?

46. Some bodies that dealt with indigenous issues had been disbanded. The Russian Association of Indigenous Peoples of the North had been suspended for procedural reasons. Central and regional departments for indigenous peoples had been abolished. Who had taken over their tasks, and why had they been disbanded?

47. Various United Nations treaty body reports had noted the problems of indigenous people, including the precariousness of indigenous communities under the existing land and forest codes, which deprived them of their traditional rights to land and authorized companies to exploit their resources. The multiplicity of legislation on a range of issues affecting indigenous peoples should recognize and respect their rights and should be coherent and easy to interpret and apply. As the delegation had indicated, the priority should be to recognize and respect the priority access of indigenous peoples to the natural resources in their areas.

48. Against that background, it was unclear why communities were not able to have communal land rights. In all other parts of the world, indigenous peoples administered and used land communally because they live as communities. They and their rights should be protected, and they should not be forbidden to exercise rights in common.

49. Specific and determined measures were needed to normalize the situation in the Northern Caucasus from the standpoint of all human rights. No investigations had been conducted on the cases of torture, inhuman treatment and enforced disappearance reported by the Committee against Torture in the Northern Caucasus in December 2012. Children in that area remained outside the public school system and women were doubly discriminated against given the levels of violence they suffered.

50. As Mr. Kut had indicated, the Committee had recommended in its previous concluding observations that the State party take measures to solve the problem of personal documentation and residence registration as it pertained to the Roma. However, the problem remained unsolved, with serious consequences for many. As the Roma tended not to approach the authorities, the Russian Federation might wish to consider the pragmatic approach adopted by his own country, Romania, where the authorities had directly approached the minorities: teams of officials from the Ministry of the Interior and the civil registry had gone to the places where Roma lived in order to determine whether or not they possessed the requisite documents and, if they did not, had issued them.

51. The Committee remained concerned at the number of hate crimes, racially motivated attacks and reports of racial profiling and harassment by law enforcement personnel in the State party. Equally worrying was the failure on the part of the police and judicial authorities to investigate, prosecute and punish hate crimes and racially motivated attacks against ethnic and religious minorities. He asked whether there was a reason for the apparent increase in those phenomena and urged the State party to increase its efforts to provide effective training that would ensure that the police respected human rights.

52. The increase in hate speech in political discourse was also alarming, as illustrated by the statement Mr. Pakhomov, the mayor of Sochi, had made in 2009 to the effect that all Roma and homeless persons should have been expelled from the city and forced to work on the construction of facilities for the 2014 Winter Olympic Games. He would welcome the delegation's comments on the fact that the courts had found Mr. Pakhomov not guilty in a case brought by a member of the Roma community. In the light of newspaper articles warning citizens against contact with members of the Roma community, which went as far as to describe them as dangerous criminals, he called on the State party to introduce a professional code for journalists that would prevent the publication of such statements.

53. He asked why the special measure promoting the political representation of minority groups on locally elected bodies had been discontinued. Similarly, he wished to know what action had been taken in response to the President's call in 2011 to introduce ethnic preferences when making appointments to the State and municipal civil service.

54. In accordance with United Nations practice, people who had been forced to migrate within a State were classified as internally displaced persons (IDPs) and, as such, had the right to protection under United Nations guidelines. The fact that many IDPs in the State party were classified as migrants hindered their rights to register as residents and return to their homes. He called on the authorities to take steps to address that anomaly, particularly as more than 10 years had passed since the conflict that had displaced those people. There was also an urgent need to put a stop to the upsurge in police action against people of Georgian and Tajik descent; ordinary citizens should not be punished because of worsening relations between States.

55. **Mr. de Gouttes** commended the State party for its regular submission of periodic reports to the Committee. He asked which federal autonomous ethnic cultural

organizations, human rights organizations and religious organizations had participated in the preparation of the periodic report. He requested clarification of the assertion, in paragraph 72 of the report, that the adoption of special anti-discrimination legislation was not in keeping with the logic or the sectoral nature of Russian law or its application in practice. That would appear to contradict the obligations under articles 1 and 4 of the Convention.

56. It was clear that mainstream politicians were increasingly endorsing the ideas of extremist groups because that won them votes. However, he would welcome the delegation's comments on the reasons for the rise in hate speech among the general public, particularly young people, which was directed against numerous ethnic minorities, the Roma, people of African descent, Muslims and Jews, and appeared to be greater in the Russian Federation than other countries.

57. It would be useful to learn whether data were available on the number of Roma living in the State party. He asked whether measures had been taken to increase the Roma community's access to employment, personal documents, residence registration, adequate housing with legal security of tenure, education and other economic, social and cultural rights.

58. Given the numerous allegations of frequent identity checks, arrests, detentions and harassment by the police and other law enforcement officials of members of ethnic minorities, he requested additional details of the Federal Act on the Police, which had entered into force in March 2011. It would also be useful to know what steps were being taken to train the police and other law enforcement officials to ensure that they respected ethnic diversity.

59. He remained unconvinced that the provisions of the Criminal Code and other domestic legislation prohibiting acts of racial discrimination were fully compatible with articles 1 and 4 of the Convention. In that regard, he asked whether the federal bill amending several pieces of legislation, to which reference was made in paragraph 113 of the periodic report, had been adopted.

60. The Committee would welcome data on the number of complaints of racial discrimination the Human Rights Ombudsman had received and how many had been investigated. It would also appreciate information on cases of racial discrimination brought before civil and administrative courts. He asked whether the State party made use of the jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights, which constituted an extremely useful source of information in the field of discrimination.

61. **Mr. Calí Tzay** asked whether some members of the Roma community resided illegally in the State party while others were there legally, and if so, why that was the case. He wished to know whether the State housing made available to members of the Roma population was culturally appropriate.

62. Given that the right to protection of the native habitat and traditional way of life of the small indigenous peoples was enshrined in the State party's Constitution, he asked which body was responsible for defining their traditional way of life. He would welcome the delegation's comments on the compatibility of the Federal Act on Areas of Traditional Resource Use with that provision of the Constitution, given that the Federal Act had reportedly resulted in restrictions on indigenous communities' traditional fishing rights. He requested additional details of the updated version of that Act, which was apparently being implemented despite not yet having come before the State Duma.

63. The Committee would appreciate additional information on the definition of the term “nationalities” and an indication of whether that definition had been amended. With regard to the definition of small indigenous peoples, he shared the concerns voiced by Mr. Diaconu.

64. In the light of reports that human rights defenders were being silenced on the basis of anti-extremism legislation, he asked whether that legislation was used to stifle criticism of State policy.

65. It would be useful to know whether the State party planned to gather statistics that would serve to measure economic and social development.

66. **Mr. Kemal** asked what forms of international cooperation had been encouraged under the framework of the Second International Decade of the World’s Indigenous People. He suggested that ecotourism initiatives could be established in order to improve the living conditions of the small indigenous peoples of the North, Siberia and the Russian Far East while respecting their traditional ways of life. He wished to know what measures were being taken to ensure that part of the profits from oil production and other extractive industries benefited small indigenous peoples and helped to preserve the State party’s biodiversity for future generations.

67. It would be useful to learn whether the Government was taking steps to conserve and refurbish historic places of worship, including churches, mosques, synagogues and Buddhist temples, which often belonged to minority groups.

68. **Mr. Vázquez** welcomed the State party’s commitment, made in conjunction with the United Nations universal periodic review (UPR), to comply with the principles contained in the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples. He requested updated information on progress made in that regard, particularly as the Committee had received reports that indigenous peoples’ rights had not yet been incorporated into domestic legislation. He also asked what steps were being taken to implement the “Outline for the sustainable development of the small indigenous peoples of the North, Siberia and the Russian Far East”. He requested additional information on the content of the new version of the Federal Act on Areas of Traditional Resource Use and the current status of that version.

69. He would appreciate clarification of whether the State party had accepted the recommendations, made under the UPR, to: review the extremism and NGO laws to ensure their compatibility with international human rights obligations and standards; revise the anti-extremism legislation so as to clarify the definition of extremism; and consider a review of the NGO law. If so, he wished to know what measures had been taken to implement those recommendations.

70. He asked whether data were available on the number of refugees who had been granted citizenship of the State party.

71. **Mr. Lindgren Alves** asked whether results of the 2010 census had been published and, if so, requested that they be sent to the Committee as they would provide useful information on the situation of the various ethnic groups in the State party. He commended the State party for the focus of its periodic report and its efforts on the ground to ban extremist groups and prevent extremist acts, particularly those involving violence.

72. **Ms. Dah** commended the Government for its periodic report, which followed the Committee’s reporting guidelines. However, she urged the Government to submit an updated core document, as the current one dated back to 1996.

73. She asked what measures the State party was taking to ensure that all forms of education — in the family, at school, at university and in the media — contributed to

efforts to curb the tendency towards extremism which currently seemed to have a significant hold over many young people.

The meeting rose at 6 p.m.