UNITED NATIONS



# Economic and Social Council

Distr. GENERAL

E/CN.4/1998/33 27 February 1998

ENGLISH

Original: ENGLISH and FRENCH

COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS
Fifty-fourth session
Item 8 of the provisional agenda

QUESTION OF THE HUMAN RIGHTS OF ALL PERSONS SUBJECTED TO ANY FORM OF DETENTION OR IMPRISONMENT

Security of United Nations personnel

Report of the Secretary-General

# CONTENTS

|              |   | <u>Paragraphs</u> | Page |
|--------------|---|-------------------|------|
| Introdu      | action  | 1 - 3             | 3    |
| I.           | Views and comments of United Nations specialized agencies   | 4 - 8             | 3    |
| II.          | Information provided by the staff representatives of the Association for the Security and Independence of International Civil Servants (ASIICS)   | 9 - 20            | 4    |
| III.         | Status of the Convention on the Safety of United Nations and Associated Personnel   | 21 - 24           | 7    |
| IV.          | Conclusion  | 25 - 27           | 8    |
| Annex :      | Final conclusions and recommendations of the Special Rapporteur of the Sub-Commission on Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities on the protection of the human rights of United Nations staff members, experts and their families (E/CN.4/Sub.2/1992/19) |                   | 9    |
| <u>Annex</u> | Consolidated list of staff members under arrest and detention or missing and with respect to whom the United Nations and the specialized agencies and related organization have been unable to exercise fully their right to protection                                     | ns                | 13   |
| Annex :      | List of staff members who have lost their lives since 1 July 1996   |                   | 17   |

# Introduction

- 1. The Economic and Social Council took note of Commission on Human Rights resolution 1997/25, of 11 April 1997, in which the Commission requested the Secretary-General to submit to the General Assembly at its fifty-second session a report on the situation of United Nations and other personnel carrying out activities in fulfilment of the mandate of a United Nations operation who are imprisoned, missing or held in a country against their will, on new cases which have been successfully settled and on the implementation of the measures referred to in the resolution.
- In its resolution 52/126 of 12 December 1997, the General Assembly took note with grave concern of the report of the Secretary-General (A/52/548) and the developments indicated therein, particularly the large number of new cases of arrest, detention and murder of international civil servants. In that resolution, it deplored the increase in the number of cases in which the security and protection of officials had been jeopardized, as well as the growing number of cases in which the lives and well-being of staff members in the performance of their official functions had been threatened. It urged the Secretary-General to commission a comprehensive and independent study, from within existing resources, to shed further light on the safety and security problems faced by United Nations and other personnel carrying out activities in fulfilment of the mandate of a United Nations operation, taking into account the evolution of the nature of United Nations missions around the world and the greater responsibilities of those personnel, giving due consideration to the views of the main United Nations agencies concerned and of relevant international organizations, both intergovernmental and non-governmental.
- 3. The present report, which contains information on the security of United Nations personnel, has been prepared pursuant to General Assembly resolution 52/126 and is based on the views and comments provided by specialized agencies and related organizations on the recommendations made by Mrs. C. Bautista, Special Rapporteur on the protection of the human rights of United Nations staff members, experts and their families, in her final report (E/CN.4/Sub.2/1992/19). These views and comments were collected to serve as a basis for the independent study recommended by the General Assembly in the above-mentioned resolution. A list of the bodies and organizations invited to provide their views and comments on the recommendations of the Special Rapporteur on the protection of the human rights of United Nations staff members, experts and their families is given below.

# I. VIEWS AND COMMENTS OF UNITED NATIONS SPECIALIZED AGENCIES

4. The specialized agencies which were requested to submit their views and comments are: the United Nations Security Coordinator, the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), the World Food Programme (WFP), the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), the International Labour Office (ILO), the International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA), the United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO), the International Monetary Fund (IMF), the World Trade Organization (WTO), the World Meteorological Organization (WMO), the World Intellectual Property Organization (WIPO), the World Health Organization (WHO), the International Telecommunications Union (ITU), the

World Tourism Organization, the Federation of International Civil Servants Associations, the Association for the Security and Independence of International Civil Servants (ASIICS), the Coordination Committee for Independent Staff Unions and Associations (CCISUA), the International Maritime Organization and the World Bank. Only a few agencies replied: the World Bank, the International Labour Office, the International Civil Aviation Organization, the United Nations Industrial Development Organization, the Universal Postal Union, the International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC) and the Association for the Security and Independence of International Civil Servants.

- 5. The International Labour Office "considers that the report raises a number of interesting, yet sensitive, policy issues and operational dilemmas. This would require a fairly substantial and coordinated discussion between all the organizations concerned".
- 6. The International Civil Aviation Organization said that it supported "the development of training modules for designated officials and other staff concerned with a view to enhancing security of staff in such missions".
- 7. The United Nations Industrial Development Organization is concerned about the security of its staff, stating that "the protection of our staff serving at various duty stations is indeed of great concern to our office. Even more since the ongoing transformation of UNIDO will entail an increase of our field representation. UNIDO confirms its support for all measures that would ensure the safety and security of staff". It indicates that "there have been no cases of arrest or detention of UNIDO personnel or any other incidents violating the privileges and immunities of UNIDO officials since 7 July 1997".
- 8. The Universal Postal Union supports the Special Rapporteur's recommendations: "We particularly agree with the report's recommendations concerning the security of United Nations personnel during missions to countries in conflict situations".
  - II. INFORMATION PROVIDED BY THE STAFF REPRESENTATIVES OF THE ASSOCIATION FOR THE SECURITY AND INDEPENDENCE OF INTERNATIONAL CIVIL SERVANTS (ASIICS)
  - A. Comments on the recommendations contained in the final report of the Special Rapporteur of the Sub-Commission (E/CN.4/Sub.2/1992/19) on the protection of the human rights of United Nations staff members, experts and their families

#### <u>Information</u>

9. The Association for the Security and Independence of International Civil Servants (ASIICS) agrees with the Special Rapporteur that more open information is an effective means to combat violations of human rights. Regular and factual information about staff members detained, missing or killed in the line of duty should be easily accessible.

## Action

- 10. Prompt action needs to be taken whenever a staff member is arrested, reported mission or taken hostage. For that purpose, staff members in positions of authority need to be properly informed of the procedure to be followed in such cases. In addition, ASIICS supports the recommendation made by FAO and retained by the Special Rapporteur "that regularly updated information concerning the situation of the various regional and universal human rights instruments should be communicated to the various organizations" of the United Nations system together with the state of ratification. This should provide good legal basis for discussion with the authorities. It could be done through the Field Security Handbook.
- 11. This prompt initial action should be followed up by further initiatives. It is important to insist on the right to visit detained staff members and to ask for him/her to be provided with appropriate medical care. ASIICS agrees with the Special Rapporteur that more concrete measures such as suspension of activities and missions need to be taken when Governments neither provide satisfactory information nor take any actions to solve the case.

#### Indemnification and compensation

12. With the increasing number of people being assigned to conflict areas and the variety of contractual arrangements, urgent attention needs to be paid to the question of indemnification of victims and their families with the purpose of ensuring fair treatment to all staff, including locally recruited staff. But at the same time ways and means should be explored to get those who are responsible for the damage inflicted on the organization to pay compensation.

### Rehabilitation and preservation of statutory rights

13. Staff members whose basic rights have been violated should not be penalized again through the loss of their statutory rights. While detained, reported missing or taken hostage, no staff member should see his/her contract terminated even if it happens to expire during that period. It should be automatically extended. This is the only way to protect them. They should also be assisted, administratively, morally, medically as well as psychologically after their release.

# Inquiries

14. A case should never be dropped before it is solved to the satisfaction of the Secretary-General and should continue to appear on the lists published by the United Nations until that time. These lists should be recapitulative. When the case is solved it should be stated clearly and publicly. ASIICS fully supports the recommendation of the Special Rapporteur to establish independent boards of inquiry to investigate the killings of United Nations officials. The conclusions of the boards should be made public.

# Security in missions

15. The lives of United Nations and associated personnel working in the field are increasingly threatened. In some instances, they have even been

targeted. An illustration of this rather new and disquieting phenomenon was the assassination, a year ago, in Rwanda, of five colleagues of the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights. Since 1990, more than 150 United Nations staff members (one third of these in Rwanda in 1994) have been killed in the line of duty. This number does not include blue helmets and United Nations soldiers. Consequently, the need for enhancing security measures is obvious. Much has been done in this respect since 1992, but more needs to be done.

#### B. <u>Unresolved cases</u>

- 16. There are a certain number of long-standing unresolved cases, some of them dating back to more than 20 years ago. Many of them have simply been dropped without any explanations by United Nations organizations and agencies. ASIICS has on many occasions asked for information to be provided on the fate of Viviana Micucci (World Health Organization), reported missing since 1976 in Argentina, Belay Melake (Economic Commission for Africa (ECA)) reported missing in Ethiopia since 1978, Wadood Abdul Fattah, abducted in 1989 in Pakistan, and Aw Jama Adan Zainab, reported missing in Somalia since 1988, both of the World Food Programme. The fate of Mohmoud Hussein Ahmad, Mohammad Ali Sabbah, Alec Collett and Mohammad El Hajj Ali from the United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East (UNRWA), reported missing in Lebanon between 1983 and 1986, has never been clarified.
- 17. Nine locally recruited staff members of the Food and Agriculture Organization and of the United Nations Development Programme expelled arbitrarily from Mauritania in 1989 and two other staff members of ECA expelled from Ethiopia have just been forgotten.
- 18. The Supreme Court of Chile gave a final verdict on 24 August 1996 in the case of the assassination of Carmelo Soria Espinosa in 1976. The Court applied the 1978 Amnesty decree-law No. 2191 and refused to reopen the case. The Government of Chile had earlier acknowledged that State agents were responsible for this assassination. This case should be pursued and justice should be sought.
- 19. There are still 37 staff members from United Nations organizations and agencies detained without trial in appalling conditions in Rwanda. Some of them have been detained since 1994 and 1995. Pressure needs to be exerted on the Government of Rwanda for these colleagues to be presented to a court or to be released.
- 20. According to ASIICS, staff members are also still being detained in Angola, Ethiopia, Somalia and Sudan. In addition, the cases of UNRWA staff members detained in the Gaza Strip and the West Bank either by the Israeli authorities or the Palestinian Authority and in Jordan, Lebanon and the Syrian Arab Republic raise particular problems. It is very difficult to follow these cases since no account about individual cases is given from one year to another. Although UNRWA stated, in the report submitted at the last session of the General Assembly by the Secretary-General on respect for the privileges and immunities of officials of the United Nations and the specialized agencies and related organizations (A/C.5/52/2), that "there was an overall decrease in the number of staff members arrested and detained

during the reporting period (1 July 1996-30 June 1997)", no explanation was given about the fate of staff members who had been reported detained in the report of the previous year. No statement was made to the effect that they had all been released.

- III. STATUS OF THE CONVENTION ON THE SAFETY OF UNITED NATIONS AND ASSOCIATED PERSONNEL
- 21. By resolution 49/59, the General Assembly adopted the Convention on the Safety of United Nations and Associated Personnel.
- 22. In connection with the report of the Special Committee on Peacekeeping Operations (A/51/130 and Corr.1), the General Assembly adopted resolution 51/137 of 13 December 1996, in which it urged all States that had not yet done so to consider ratifying, accepting, approving or acceding to the Convention, to bring about its entry into force at the earliest possible date; and requested the Secretary-General to continue to take the necessary steps to facilitate the dissemination of information relating to the Convention and to promote its wider appreciation.
- 23. As at November 1996,  $^1$  the status of signatures and ratifications of the Convention on the Safety of United Nations and Associated Personnel was as follows:

| <u>Participant</u> | Action       |    | <u>Date</u>   |
|--------------------|--------------|----|---------------|
| Argentina          | Signature    | 15 | December 1994 |
| Australia          | Signature    | 22 | December 1995 |
| Bangladesh         | Signature    | 21 | December 1994 |
| Belarus            | Signature    | 23 | October 1995  |
| Belgium            | Signature    | 21 | December 1995 |
| Bolivia            | Signature    | 17 | August 1995   |
| Brazil             | Signature    | 3  | February 1995 |
| Canada             | Signature    | 15 | December 1994 |
| Czech Republic     | Signature    | 27 | December 1995 |
| Denmark            | Ratification | 11 | April 1995    |
| Fiji               | Signature    | 25 | October 1995  |
| Finland            | Signature    | 15 | December 1994 |
| France             | Signature    | 12 | January 1995  |
| Germany            | Signature    | 1  | February 1995 |
| Haiti              | Signature    | 19 | December 1994 |
| Honduras           | Signature    | 17 | May 1995      |
| Italy              | Signature    | 16 | December 1994 |
| Japan              | Acceptance   | 6  | June 1995     |
| Liechtenstein      | Signature    | 16 | October 1995  |
| Luxembourg         | Signature    | 31 | May 1995      |
| Malta              | Signature    | 16 | March 1995    |
| Netherlands        | Signature    | 22 | December 1995 |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup><u>Multilateral treaties deposited with the Secretary-General</u>. Status as at 31 December 1996 (ST/LEG/SER.E/15).

| <u>Participant</u>                     | <u>Action</u> |    | <u>Date</u>    |
|--|---------------|----|----------------|
| New Zealand                            | Signature     | 15 | December 1994  |
| Norway                                 | Ratification  | 3  | July 1995      |
| Pakistan                               | Signature     | 8  | March 1995     |
| Panama                                 | Ratification  | 4  | April 1996     |
| Philippines                            | Signature     | 27 | February 1995  |
| Poland                                 | Signature     | 17 | March 1995     |
| Portugal                               | Signature     | 15 | December 1994  |
| Romania                                | Signature     | 27 | September 1995 |
| Russian Federation                     | Signature     | 26 | September 1995 |
| Samoa                                  | Signature     | 16 | January 1995   |
| Senegal                                | Signature     | 21 | February 1995  |
| Sierra Leone                           | Signature     | 13 | February 1995  |
| Singapore                              | Ratification  | 26 | March 1996     |
| Slovakia                               | Ratification  | 26 | June 1996      |
| Spain                                  | Signature     | 19 | December 1994  |
| Sweden                                 | Ratification  | 25 | June 1996      |
| Togo                                   | Signature     | 22 | December 1995  |
| Tunisia                                | Signature     | 22 | February 1995  |
| Ukraine                                | Ratification  | 17 | August 1995    |
| United Kingdom of<br>Great Britain and |               |    |                |
| Northern Ireland                       | Signature     | 19 | December 1995  |
| United States of                       |               |    |                |
| America                                | Signature     | 19 | December 1994  |
| Uruguay                                | Signature     | 17 | November 1995  |

24. The Convention on the Safety of United Nations and Associated Personnel plays a key role in protecting staff members and their dependants against arrest and detention. However, it has been signed by only 43 Member States and ratified by 10. It can enter into force only when it has been ratified by 20 States.

## IV. CONCLUSION

- 25. The information received from organizations of the United Nations system drew attention to concern about better conditions of security for international civil servants.
- 26. The recommendations made by Mrs. Bautista, Special Rapporteur of the Sub-Commission on Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities on the protection of the human rights of United Nations staff members, experts and their families, in her final report are thus very much to the point. The preparation of the study requested by the Commission on Human Rights would go a long way towards furthering the discussion of the question.
- 27. It should be noted that the comprehensive and independent study has so far not been carried out because the necessary resources are lacking and the Commission expressly stated that the study should be prepared "from within existing resources".

#### ANNEX I

Final conclusions and recommendations of the Special Rapporteur of the Sub-Commission on Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities on the protection of the human rights of United Nations staff members, experts and their families (E/CN.4/Sub.2/1992/19)

The Special Rapporteur made a number of detailed recommendations in her final report on the protection of the human rights of United Nations staff members, experts and their families. Since the Commission is called on to take a decision on these recommendations, they have been reproduced below to make their discussion easier.

#### 1. <u>Information</u>

- 1.1. The Special Rapporteur endorses the recommendation by FAO that regularly updated information concerning the situation of the various regional and universal human rights instruments should be communicated to the various organizations: this would enable them, when taking action to ensure the protection of their personnel, to invoke the relevant provisions. In order to facilitate their implementation, the Special Rapporteur recommends that the appropriate excerpts from these instruments should be appended to the <u>Security Handbook</u> and to the corresponding texts used by the specialized agencies, together with a list of ratifications and simple instructions concerning implementation of the relevant provisions.
- 1.2. The Special Rapporteur strongly recommends the immediate establishment of a better coordinated and more detailed system of information on cases of infringements of the human rights of staff members of the international organizations and their families. This system must be placed under the responsibility of the United Nations Security Coordinator. The specialized agencies and other organizations should be reminded that they are required to inform the Secretary-General without delay, in order that he may have precise, comprehensive and authoritative information on the various cases.
- 1.3. The information system should contain factual information on each case which may be consulted by any interested person or association, together with information on the handling of the situation, available only to authorized persons and intended to constitute a database for the handling of similar cases and the definition of more appropriate guidelines.
- 1.4. The Special Rapporteur notes that a list of detained staff members is contained in the annex to the annual report of the Secretary-General to the General Assembly. Reports of detained staff members should contain the following information:
- (a) The name and nationality of the person arrested or detained, his or her employment status with, and official function for, the United Nations; for family members the family relationship must be given;
  - (b) The time, place and other circumstances of the arrest or detention;

- (c) The legal expression or term used by the applicable local law to describe the arrest or detention;
- (d) The legal grounds for the arrest or detention, including any charges against the person concerned;
- (e) The name of the governmental agency, such as a court or an administrative authority, under whose authority the measure was taken;
- (f) Whether a representative of the United Nations has been or will be given access to the person arrested or detained; in the affirmative, any request or other reaction from the person concerned shall also be conveyed;
- (g) Whether consular protection and/or legal counsel is or will be available to the person arrested or detained; in the affirmative, the identity of these services shall be conveyed.
- 1.5. In addition to these elements, the Special Rapporteur would suggest that information be included on the health of the person or persons under detention and on any specific measures which should be taken in that regard.

# 2. Action to be taken in case of grave violation of human rights

- 2.1. In cases where staff members are held in their country of origin against their will or are arrested without the Secretary-General or Director-General of the organization in question having an assurance that the arrest was not motivated by the action of the person concerned as a staff member, the Special Rapporteur recommends that the Secretary-General or Director-General should freeze recruitment of nationals of the country concerned until such time as the situation is satisfactorily resolved.
- 2.2. The Special Rapporteur draws attention to paragraph 117 of the United Nations Security Handbook, under which, if the arrest or detention of a staff member of a United Nations agency constitutes a manifest violation of privileges and immunities and if the organization employing the staff member has not been able to fulfil its obligations towards him, the Secretary-General requests the heads of secretariat of the organizations executing programmes in the country in question to suspend all their activities with the exception of those of a purely humanitarian nature and to cancel further missions until the problem is resolved. She recommends that the Secretary-General should consider, with the executive heads of the specialized agencies, means of implementing this measure.
- 2.3 The Special Rapporteur draws attention to the proposal submitted by the United Nations Development Programme that member States should firmly undertake to ensure that the authorized official of an organization or a representative designated by him should be able to visit an arrested staff member within 24 hours of his arrest, and that the Government should officially explain the reasons for the arrest and notify the place of detention of the person concerned within 48 hours. Changes in places of detention should also be notified within the same time-limit.
- 2.4. The Special Rapporteur strongly recommends the establishment of independent boards of inquiry to investigate the killings of United Nations

officials as recommended by the Task Force on the Independence and Security of the International Civil Service and strongly supported by the Coordinating Committee for Independent Staff Unions and Associations (CCISUA) and the Federation of International Civil Service Associations (FICSA). In addition, names of all staff members who have disappeared or have been killed should be maintained on the list presented by the Secretary-General to the General Assembly.

## 3. <u>Compensation</u>

It is unjust that damage suffered in the performance of the activities and programmes undertaken by the United Nations or specialized agencies and caused by States following the arrest or detention of staff members should be borne by the international community as a whole. The Special Rapporteur recommends that the Secretariat should consider ways and means of implementing the principles established by the International Court of Justice in its advisory opinion of 11 April 1949 on compensation for damage suffered in the service of the United Nations, with a view to compensating damage suffered by the organization and by the staff member or his rightful claimants, and submit a report on this matter to the competent bodies.

## 4. Rehabilitation and preservation of statutory rights

The Special Rapporteur acknowledges that when a United Nations official has been set free, although his or her physical ordeal may have ended there remain very many invisible obstacles to the full rehabilitation and reintegration of the staff member. The Special Rapporteur, conscious of the fact that ad hoc measures do not satisfactorily resolve these problems, recommends that the <u>United Nations Security Handbook</u>, the <u>Staff Rules</u> and any other appropriate document of similar juridical value be amended to include adequate provisions to cover rehabilitation and indemnification of staff members and their families in case of illness, invalidity or death attributable to arrest, detention or abduction. Staff members should be fully maintained in their statutory rights from the day they are prevented from accomplishing their functions because of detention or imprisonment.

## 5. <u>Security while on mission</u>

- 5.1. The Special Rapporteur is aware that several peace-keeping operations are currently under way in various parts of the world. In view of the increasing risk of violations of human rights of United Nations staff members called upon to serve in conflict areas all over the world, the Special Rapporteur expresses the hope that every precaution necessary to ensure staff members' security has been taken.
- 5.2. The Special Rapporteur welcomes the decisions, taken by the Staff Management Coordinating Committee (SMCC) at its last session held from 15 to 19 June 1992, to take the necessary steps to enhance security measures within the United Nations Secretariat.
- 5.3. While recognizing the need to provide continuing political, humanitarian and emergency assistance to populations at risk, the Special Rapporteur considers that it is absolutely essential that staff involved in these missions be properly informed and suitably trained so as to ensure their

security and effectiveness in accomplishing their functions. The Special Rapporteur therefore recommends that training modules be developed for designated officials, area coordinators and staff at large on security issues such as early warning, precautionary measures and how to react in certain situations.

#### 6. Follow-up

- 6.1. The Special Rapporteur supports the efforts made by the Working Group on the Methods of Work of the Sub-Commission. She realizes that one of the key questions in this regard relates to the follow-up of final reports. The mandate of the Special Rapporteur expires this year, but an issue so closely connected with the very functioning of the United Nations system should not be abandoned.
- 6.2. In that connection, the Special Rapporteur wishes to express her concern that the report of the Secretary-General on the Respect for the Privileges and Immunities of Officials of the United Nations and the Specialized Agencies and Related Organizations will henceforth be examined only on a biennial basis. The list (see paragraph 37 above) prepared by the Secretary-General containing the names of United Nations officials whose basic rights had not been observed by Governments has over the years become a key reference for all those interested in this issue. It is her conviction that examination of this report on a biennial basis will be detrimental to the fate of staff members working under hardship conditions. The Special Rapporteur suggests that the Commission on Human Rights examine the human rights situation of United Nations and specialized agency staff members and their families as well as the measures taken or contemplated to protect their basic rights.
- 6.3. The Special Rapporteur endorses the recommendations, contained in the report of the Inter-Agency Meeting on Security Matters (Geneva, 12-15 May 1992) to the Administrative Committee on Coordination. She welcomes the timely convening of this meeting and recommends that similar meetings be held on a regular basis so as to ensure that matters related to the security and independence of staff members are given the highest priority and attention.
- 6.4. Finally, she expresses the hope that whatever follow-up will be chosen, the adequate functioning of the United Nations should be taken into consideration; however, to achieve such a goal it is indispensable that the staff members can fulfil the task entrusted to them without interference and in conditions of security.

ANNEX II

Consolidated list of staff members under arrest and detention or missing and with respect to whom the United Nations and the specialized agencies and related organizations have been unable to exercise fully their right to protection\*

| <u>Name</u>                     | <u>Agency</u> | Place and date of incident   |
|---------------------------------|---------------|--|
| Abdala Daker Hayatli            | UNRWA         | Missing in the Syrian Arab Republic since 20 April 1980.   |
| Issedine Hussein<br>Abu Khreish | п             | Detained in the Syrian Arab Republic since 11 September 1980.  |
| Mahmoud Hussein Ahmad           | п             | Missing in Lebanon since<br>22 March 1983. Reportedly detained<br>by militias or unknown elements.       |
| Mohammad Ali Sabbah             | п             | Missing in Lebanon since<br>22 March 1983. Reportedly detained<br>by militias or unknown elements.       |
| Alec Collett                    | п             | Detained in Lebanon by militias or unknown elements since 25 March 1985.                                 |
| Mohammad Mustafa<br>El-Hajj Ali | п             | Missing in Lebanon since<br>28 November 1986. Reportedly<br>detained by militias or unknown<br>elements. |
| Kassu Asgedon                   | WFP           | Detained in Ethiopia since<br>4 September 1991.  |
| Andualem Zeleke                 | ECA           | Detained in Ethiopia since<br>25 June 1993.  |
| Alfredo Afonso                  | WFP           | Detained in Angola since July 1994.  |
| Alfred Rusigariye               | UNAMIR        | Detained in Kigali since<br>22 September 1994.   |
| Elizier Cyimanizanye            | UNICEF        | Detained in Kigali since<br>28 October 1994.   |
| Deo Idanumbira                  | UNDP          | Missing in Rwanda since<br>1 November 1994.  |

<sup>\*</sup> The consolidated list contains in chronological order the names of staff members who remained under detention or missing as at 30 June 1997. The list, however, is not intended to provide information on all cases of staff members who have been arrested or detained or have been missing in the past or on the cases where staff members have lost their lives in the performance of official duties.

| <u>Name</u>              | <u>Agency</u>                                   | Place and date of incident                               |
|--------------------------|---|--|
| Benoit Ndejeje           | п   | Detianed in Kigali since<br>11 November 1994.            |
| Jean-Marc Ulimubenshi    | UNHCR   | Detained in Butare, Rwanda, since<br>15 November 1994.   |
| Athanase Habimana        | 11  | Detained in Butare, Rwanda, since<br>December 1994.      |
| Jean Bosco Rwagaju       | п   | Detained in Gitarama, Rwanda, since<br>January 1995.     |
| Jean Chrisostome Muvunyi | п   | Detained in Gikongoro, Rwanda, since 9 January 1995.     |
| Charles Ngendahimana     | п   | Detained in Butare, Rwanda, since<br>10 January 1995.    |
| Alfred Nsinga            | UNAMIR  | Detained in Kigali since<br>8 February 1995.             |
| Mathieu Nsengiyaremye    | UNHCR   | Detained in Cyangugu, Rwanda, since<br>12 February 1995. |
| Luc Birushya             | UNDP  | Detained in Kigali since<br>13 March 1995.               |
| Athanase Ngendahimana    | п   | Detained in Kigali since<br>25 March 1995.               |
| Joseph Nsabimana         | UNHCR   | Detained in Nyanza, Rwanda, since<br>25 March 1995.      |
| François Semanzi         | "   | Detained in Butare, Rwanda, since<br>April 1995.         |
| Aloys Byugura            | UNICEF  | Detained in Kigali since<br>4 April 1995.                |
| Prosper Gahamanyi        | UNDP  | Detained in Kigali since<br>12 April 1995.               |
| Clotilde Ndagijimana     | UNICEF  | Detained in Butare, Rwanda, since<br>14 April 1995.      |
| Augustin Rukeribuga      | UNHCR   | Detained in Butare, Rwanda, since<br>23 April 1995.      |
| Dismas Gahamanyi         | WFP   | Detained in Kigali since 2 June 1995.                    |
| Theodore Niyitegeka      | п   | Detained in Kigali since 2 June 1995.                    |
| Fulgence Rukindo         | Human<br>Rights<br>Field<br>Office in<br>Rwanda | Detained in Kibuye, Rwanda, since<br>17 June 1995.       |

| <u>Name</u>                    | <u>Agency</u> | Place and date of incident   |
|--------------------------------|---------------|--|
| Boniface Rutagungira           | UNICEF        | Detained in Kigali since<br>20 June 1995.                                      |
| Manasse Mugabo                 | UNAMIR        | Missing in Rwanda since<br>19 August 1995.                                     |
| Joseph Munyambonera            | UNHCR         | Detained in Kigali since<br>19 October 1995.                                   |
| Khaled Umar El Hamameh         | UNRWA         | Detained in the Gaza Strip by the Palestinian Authority since 1 November 1995. |
| Al Hakim Hasan Mahdi           | UNRWA         | Detained in the West Bank by the Palestinian Authority since 25 November 1995. |
| Andre Uwizeyimana              | UNHCR         | Detained in Butare, Rwanda, since<br>29 December 1995.                         |
| Mahmoud Saqer El Zatma         | UNRWA         | Detained in the Gaza Strip by the Palestinian Authority since 3 February 1996. |
| Boaz Imanivuganamwisi          | UNAMIR        | Detained in Kigali since<br>19 February 1996.                                  |
| Maher Mohamed Salem            | UNRWA         | Detained in the Gaza Strip by the Palestinian Authority since 14 March 1996.   |
| Tareq Soboh Abu<br>El Hussain  | п             | Detained in the Gaza Strip by the Palestinian Authority since 16 March 1996.   |
| Bernard Nshinyumukiza          | UNAMIR        | Detained in Kigali since<br>19 March 1996.                                     |
| Raed Subhi El Zaqzouq          | UNRWA         | Detained in the Gaza Strip by the Palestinian Authority since 29 March 1996.   |
| David Bukeyeneza               | UNICEF        | Detained in Kigali since<br>4 April 1996.                                      |
| Emmanuel Twagirayezu           | п             | Detained in Kigali since<br>28 April 1996.                                     |
| Francois Nsabimana             | UNHCR         | Detained in Rwanda since May 1996.   |
| Husni Mohammad Ahmad<br>Borini | UNRWA         | Detained in the West Bank since 21 May 1996.                                   |
| Benoit Twagirumukiza           | WFP           | Detained in Gitarama, Rwanda, since 6 June 1996.                               |
| Hasan Ibrahim al Hmouz         | UNRWA         | Detained in the West Bank since 17 June 1996.                                  |

| <u>Name</u>               | <u>Agency</u>                                   | Place and date of incident  |
|---------------------------|---|---|
| Israel Nkulikiyimana      | UNICEF  | Detained in Kigali since<br>7 August 1996.                                |
| Jean Marie Bagaragaza     | UNHCR   | Detained in Rwanda since<br>October 1996.                                 |
| Victor Niyomubyeyi        | II  | Detained in Rwanda since October 1996.                                    |
| Tareq Ahmad Mohamed Ziiad | UNRWA   | Detained in the West Bank since 7 October 1996.                           |
| Theodomir Nkaka           | UNHCR   | Detained in Rwanda since March 1997.                                      |
| J. Baptiste Sibomana      | Human<br>Rights<br>Field<br>Office in<br>Rwanda | Detained in Rwanda since March 1997.                                      |
| Adnan Omar Mansi          | UNRWA   | Detained in Jordan since 28 May 1997.                                     |
| Mahmoud Allan             | UNRWA   | Detained in the West Bank by the Palestinian Authority since 7 June 1997. |
| Wael Ibrahim Iswed        | п   | Detained in Jordan since<br>12 June 1997.                                 |
| Berhane Gebremedhin       | UNHCR   | Detained in Ethiopia since<br>24 June 1997.                               |

ANNEX III

List of staff members who have lost their lives since 1 July 1996

| <u>Name</u>               | Nationality       | Agency                                      | Place/date of incident  | Cause of death   |
|---------------------------|-------------------|---|---|--|
| Mohamed Ali Sheik<br>Said | Somalia           | UNESCO                                      | Mogadishu<br>28 October 1996                                    | Gunshot wounds   |
| Roger Manirakiza          | Burundi           | UNICEF                                      | Bubonga, Burundi<br>29 October 1996                             | Gunshot wounds   |
| Germain Lugano Barega     | Zaire             | UNHCR                                       | Goma, Democratic<br>Republic of the<br>Congo<br>1 November 1996 | Gunshot wounds   |
| Augustin Semwaga          | Rwanda            | UNDP  | Kigali<br>4 November 1996                                       | Gunshot wounds   |
| Veneranda Uwimana         | Rwanda            | п   | Kigali<br>6 November 1996                                       | Gunshot wounds   |
| Seleshi Jembere           | Ethiopia          | UNICEF                                      | Comoros<br>23 November 1996                                     | Victim of Ethiopian<br>Airlines hijacking<br>and crash |
| Therese Ndongko           | Cameroon          | ECA   | Comoros<br>23 November 1996                                     | Victim of Ethiopian<br>Airlines hijacking<br>and crash |
| Jorge Leitao              | Angola            | WFP   | Ngomguembo,<br>Angola<br>11 December 1996                       | Gunshot wounds   |
| Tomas Ouijada             | El Salvador       | UNOPS                                       | Nueva<br>Concepción, El<br>Salvador<br>13 January 1997          | Gunshot wounds   |
| Graham Turnbull           | United<br>Kingdom | High<br>Commissioner<br>for Human<br>Rights | Karengara,<br>Rwanda<br>4 February 1997                         | Gunshot wounds   |
| Sastra Chim Chan          | Cambodia          | п   | Karengara,<br>Rwanda<br>4 February 1997                         | Gunshot wounds   |
| Jean Bosco Munyaneza      | Rwanda            | п   | Karengara,<br>Rwanda<br>4 February 1997                         | Gunshot wounds   |
| Agrippin Ngabo            | Rwanda            | п   | Karengara,<br>Rwanda<br>4 February 1997                         | Gunshot wounds   |
| Aimable Nsengiyumvu       | Rwanda            | п   | Karengara,<br>Rwanda<br>4 February 1997                         | Gunshot wounds   |
| Alphonse Ngoga            | Rwanda            | UNDP  | Kigali<br>14 February 1997                                      | Gunshot wounds   |

| <u>Name</u>                   | <u>Nationality</u> | Agency                                       | Place/date of incident  | Cause of death        |
|-------------------------------|--------------------|--|---|-----------------------|
| Iurie Caraganciu              | Moldova            | World Bank                                   | Chisinau,<br>Republic of<br>Moldova<br>14 February 1997       | Killed during robbery |
| Elizabeth Assey               | Tanzania           | Internationa<br>l Tribunal<br>for Rwanda     | Arusha,<br>United Republic<br>of Tanzania<br>24 February 1997 | Killed during robbery |
| John Reignat                  | Sierra<br>Leone    | Department<br>of<br>Humanitarian<br>Affairs* | Makeni,<br>Sierra Leone<br>7 May 1997                         | Gunshot wounds        |
| Didace Nkezagera              | Rwanda             | WFP  | Ruhengeri,<br>Rwanda<br>14 June 1997                          | Gunshot wounds        |
| Jean de Dieu<br>Murwanashyaka | Rwanda             | п  | Ruhengeri,<br>Rwanda<br>17 June 1997                          | Gunshot wounds        |
| Felicien Bucyekabili          | Rwanda             | High<br>Commissioner<br>for Human<br>Rights  | Ruhengeri,<br>Rwanda<br>19 June 1997                          | Gunshot wounds        |
| Sayeef Uddin Mahmud           | Bangladesh         | МНО  | Siddhirganj,<br>Bangladesh<br>17 July 1997                    | Gunshot wounds        |

----

<sup>\*</sup> Superseded by the Office of the Emergency Relief Coordinator as of 12 September 1997.